General Assembly

Seventieth session

Official Records

79th plenary meeting
Wednesday, 16 December 2015, 3 p.m.
New York

President: Mr. Lykketoft . . . . (Denmark)

In the absence of the President, Ms. Mejía Vélez (Colombia), Vice-President, took the Chair.

The meeting was called to order at 3.10 p.m.

High-level Meeting of the General Assembly on the overall review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society

Agenda item 17 (*continued*)

Information and communications technologies for development

   Report of the Secretary-General (A/70/63)

   Draft resolution (A/70/L.33)

   The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): In accordance with the decision taken at the 78th plenary meeting, I now give the floor to Mr. Patrick Keuleers, Director and Chief of Profession of the Governance and Peacebuilding Bureau for Policy and Programme Support of the United Nations Development Programme.

   Mr. Keuleers (United Nations Development Programme): The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) is honoured to be part of this high-level meeting to review the 10-year implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS). The review comes at an opportune moment, capping a year of fundamental decisions made by the global community on our shared future — the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction, through which we agreed to make the world safer from the risk of disasters; the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development

(resolution 70/1), which commits us to ending poverty and hunger, protecting the planet, fostering peaceful, just and inclusive societies, enabling people to enjoy prosperous and fulfilling lives and ensuring that no one is left behind; and, just last week, the Paris Agreement of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change, which frames our resolve to strengthen our collective response to the threat of climate change.

   The role of information and communications technologies (ICT) in achieving those global goals and commitments is recognized by all stakeholders. The 10-year review of the implementation of the WSIS outcomes (WSIS+10) is therefore a distinct opportunity to ensure that this role is concretized within those global imperatives. UNDP congratulates the WSIS community on its agreement on a draft outcome document (A/70/L.33) that reaffirms a vision of building a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented information society.

   Building that information society requires us to bridge the digital divide, and for UNDP that divide is far more than a mere infrastructure issue. The era of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) is digital and increasingly connected, and digital inclusion is therefore particularly important, since many services, access to information and the space for engaging with Governments and the private sector are being increasingly enabled or deployed through digital tools and platforms. The digital divide therefore implies inequalities in access to services, information, opportunities and public processes where decisions that affect people's lives are being made. Those are divides

that cannot be bridged by technology or infrastructure alone. They require policies and strategies aimed at ensuring that ICT access and Internet connectivity can have a meaningful impact on people's lives, in particular those of women, young people and marginalized peoples.

UNDP is pleased that the WSIS+10 draft outcome document encourages consideration of the outcome of the 2025 WSIS review as an input into the review of the 2030 Agenda. A WSIS community closely engaged in implementing the SDGs can do a great deal to advance those development efforts, including the building of peaceful, just and inclusive societies. To be effectively implemented, the 17 Sustainable Development Goals and 169 targets require harnessing a range of capacities, robust resources and the sustained engagement of all stakeholders. Partnerships are absolutely critical, and we need all sectors to work together in innovative ways. There should be no more business as usual, as Member States made clear here in the Hall in September when they agreed on the 2030 Agenda.

The Secretary-General noted in his remarks here yesterday (see A/70/PV.76) that the agencies, funds and programmes of the United Nations system are committed to strengthening the coherence of their efforts in support of Member States and partners in development. Our UNDP country offices and United Nations country teams have started working with partners at the national and local levels on SDG implementation. Smart, innovative approaches, on which this community has much to offer, will be tremendously helpful to countries trying to balance priorities as they address multiple and complex development challenges. The WSIS community is best positioned to lead the way in showing how ICT can help achieve the 2030 Agenda, and with that Agenda, we have an opportunity to truly transform our world. UNDP looks forward to working closely with everyone represented here to ensure smooth progress on interlinked global agendas and priorities.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): Also in accordance with the decision taken at the 78th plenary meeting, I now give the floor to Mr. Torbjörn Fredriksson, Chief of the Information and Communications Technology Analysis Section of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development.

Mr. Fredriksson (United Nations Conference on Trade and Development): I am honoured to deliver this statement on behalf of the Secretary-General of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD).

Ten years ago, at the conclusion of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS), world leaders set out a vision of a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented information society. Since then, we have seen remarkable progress made in the scope and reach of information and communication technologies (ICT). Connectivity has improved tremendously, and a wide range of new services and applications has emerged that are influencing our lives in many ways. As a result, today the scope for ICT to contribute to sustainable development in all its dimensions is much greater. Our concept of the information society has consequently evolved, and we stand on the verge of further rapid change as we move into the era of big data and the Internet of Things.

Nevertheless, we are far from a world where everyone, everywhere, regardless of status or geography, can reap the benefits of ICT for development. Approximately 4 billion people are not yet online, and fewer still are benefiting from broadband access. Even among those who are active online, the full potential of the Internet is often not taken advantage of.

To make the information society people-centred and inclusive, we must prioritize efforts to bridge the digital divides that prevail between countries and between rich and poor, men and women, younger and older people, large and small enterprises and rural and urban areas. Special attention must be given to supporting the ability of least developed countries to catch up. We also need to continue to ensure transparent policy processes that are open to the participation of all the relevant stakeholders.

To make the information society more development-oriented, we must address the challenges of content and capabilities as well as connectivity, and ensure that ICT are fully harnessed in support of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), which are rightly emphasized in the draft outcome document (A/70/L.33) to be adopted at this high-level meeting. UNCTAD looks forward to working with our colleagues within the United Nations Group on the Information Society, and with other partners, to support the implementation of WSIS outcomes and the SDGs. The joint statement of the Chief Executives Board for Coordination on the overall review of the implementation of the WSIS outcomes is testimony to the strong commitment of the

United Nations system as a whole to working together to harness ICT for sustainable development. The lessons learned over the past decade should help us further improve our efforts to implement the WSIS outcomes as we head towards the next milestone, in 2025.

A deeper understanding of the changes taking place in our economies, societies and cultures is essential if we are to maximize the opportunities and minimize the challenges of the ICT-induced transformation of economies and societies. Going forward, constructive international cooperation will be even more vital to addressing a host of emerging issues, from concerns about cybercrime to questions of inclusiveness and the fact that ICTs can magnify skill differences, with potentially worrying effects on inequality.

The Commission on Science and Technology for Development, for which UNCTAD serves as secretariat, has played a central role in analysing the impact of the information society and following up on the implementation of the WSIS outcomes. Its 10-year review of WSIS and comprehensive report on implementing WSIS outcomes have served as a valuable resource for the General Assembly's overall review. UNCTAD is fully committed to continuing its support for the Commission's work.

Rapid technological developments call for clear targets and tools for measurement, both for WSIS outcomes and on how they can support the SDGs. The pioneering work of the Partnership on Measuring ICT for Development, of which UNCTAD is a founding member, has laid the groundwork. However, the work has only just begun. We must build on that groundwork to ensure that policymakers are equipped to measure progress and assess the impact of the relevant policies in support of the WSIS targets and the SDGs. The past decade has demonstrated the value of cooperation and dialogue among Governments, international organizations, the private sector, the technical community and civil society. The ability of diverse stakeholders to work together in the common interest of a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented information society has been inspiring. UNCTAD shares the desire and determination to build on that success.

We have come a long way since Tunis. Together, we have seen great changes and achieved significant progress. At the same time, new challenges have emerged. In the next decade, still more opportunities and challenges will evolve that will require effective responses from all the relevant stakeholders. It is by working together that we stand the best chance of achieving a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented information society.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): In accordance with paragraph 3 of resolution 68/302 of 31 July 2014, we shall now hear from stakeholders of the World Summit on the Information Society.

I give the floor to Mr. Parminder Jeet Singh, Executive Director of IT for Change.

Mr. Singh (IT for Change): It is a great honour to address this parliament of the world.

The Internet is fundamentally transforming our world, producing changes that will be no less far-reaching than those of the industrial revolution. The question then arises as to whether the world today is politically more mature than it was in that distant past and therefore better able to guide this transformation towards our common goals. More specifically, this time around, can the ideals of equity, social justice, human rights, democracy and sustainability be a part of the intrinsic design of the social structures that are emerging? Unfortunately, the early indications in that regard are not too good. The post-millennial period, during which the Internet began to underpin most social systems, has also seen one of the fastest-ever increases in inequality all over the world, at a time when the Internet is supposed to be a socially egalitarian technology.

The Internet has been called the new nervous system of our society. Data is variously referred to as the new oil or the new currency. Today, just before I came up here to speak, I read a report of the World Economic Forum saying that data may become a new ideology. Monopoly Internet platforms today mediate crucial social activities, driven by algorithms serving interests about whose nature and owners we know nothing. Such vital elements of society cannot remain ungoverned and left to unregulated market forces and to the powerful.

But the decade that has passed since the World Summit on the Information Society has regrettably failed to provide an adequate governance response to the many critical social, economic, political and cultural issues associated with the Internet. As we move into the next decade, I would like to appeal to this gathering to

address the urgent imperative that global governance of the Internet represents. We can begin with three things.

First of all, we must give up the idea of Internet exceptionalism, of seeing the Internet as somehow so uniquely transnational, bottom-up, and private-sector-led that it cannot, and perhaps need not, be governed. The Internet is no more transnational than climate change, no more bottom-up than education, health and livelihood practices, and no more private-sector-led than are trade and intellectual property. All of those areas have dedicated global governance mechanisms in the United Nations system, and so should the Internet.

Next, the fully justified fear of possible State abuse of the Internet must be addressed by putting robust checks and balances into its governance mechanisms, not by being in denial about the Internet's myriad and complex governance needs.

And thirdly, the so-called tension between multilateralism and multi-stakeholderism must be resolved through the test of democracy. The Internet should indeed be served by evolutionary forms of participatory governance, but the basics of democracy do not change. It is the people alone, directly or through their representatives, who can make public policy and law. Neither business nor technical experts can claim special, exalted roles in public policy decisions. Such a trend, as sections of civil society have noted with concern, is an unfortunate anti-democratic development in Internet governance today.

The world urgently needs a well-defined democratic mechanism for global governance of the Internet that fully embraces the technical, social and political opportunities of a new, networked world. Among other things, we need such a mechanism as an anchor point and meta-support agency for the governance of the larger information-society changes that are taking place across all sectors.

Left to itself, the digital network phenomenon will undoubtedly be appropriated by the powerful and will result in an even more unequal and unfair world, as the early trends show. Our digital future depends on what the United Nations does or does not do right now.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to Mr. Matthew Shears, Director of the Global Internet Policy and Human Rights Project of the Center for Democracy and Technology.

Mr. Shears (Center for Democracy and Technology): The Center for Democracy and Technology is a public-interest advocacy organization devoted to promoting fundamental rights and participatory processes in Internet policy. We have been fully engaged in the 10-year review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Society on the Information Society (WSIS), and I can say that we are encouraged by the draft outcome text (A/70/L.33). It is indeed an achievement, and the co-facilitators and all the stakeholders who contributed to the process deserve our thanks and congratulations.

There is a sense of optimism and direction. We have a clear mission: realizing a knowledge society and substantively contributing to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). That is no small task, and we are not going to be able to do it unless we work together, innovate in terms of solutions, policies and partnerships, and recognize the importance of empowering individuals and communities so that they too can contribute to achieving those goals.

Throughout the WSIS review there has been resounding support for stakeholders working together. The draft final text has captured the critical importance of multi-stakeholder processes to the future of the Internet and to the work we have to do related to the SDGs.

That said, to build a knowledge society and contribute to achieving the SDGs, we are going to have to do more than talk about the value of multi-stakeholder processes. We will have to live them, put them to work and show how they can deliver, because we really do not have any other choice. We cannot expect to build a knowledge society or meet the SDG targets while stuck in our respective stakeholder silos. We have no choice other than to cooperate, collaborate, bring expertise, skills and know-how together and address the very real challenges through multi-stakeholder approaches. We will be able to deliver on the promise of a knowledge society and meet the SDG targets effectively only if we do so together, crafting policies and delivering solutions through processes that allow us to draw on the expertise and contributions of all.

To achieve those goals by 2025 and 2030, the community is going to have to be far more innovative and ambitious in terms of solutions, policies, capacity-building, technologies and much more. We are going to have to look at information and communications technologies (ICT) and the Internet, and how they will

impact the SDGs, far more holistically. Yes, connectivity is absolutely essential, but we also have to look at how those who are most affected by development challenges are equipped to address those challenges, locally and nationally.

We must look at our policies and solutions and ask whether they are the right ones for empowering individuals and communities, creating opportunity and jobs, spurring innovation and entrepreneurship. We cannot harness the potential of ICT for development if the policy environments do not encourage communities and businesses to build networks, enhance skills and create opportunity. And it is not just about technology. At the end of the day, it is about ensuring that individuals and communities have the tools and skills to be able to contribute to their own social and economic development.

Empowerment comes in different ways. It is not just through connectivity and access. It is also through the realization of one's human rights and digital dignity. There is excellent language on human rights in the draft outcome text. In paragraph 41, it states that we have a collective responsibility to work for the realization of human rights and fundamental freedoms. But, much as with the multi-stakeholder language, we are going to have to do more than talk. What concrete measures are we, the WSIS community, going to take to work towards the realization of human rights and fundamental freedoms and the recognition of the importance of human rights to economic and social development?

Our work going forward is part of a bigger tapestry and a greater ambition. In December 2014, the Secretary-General issued a synthesis report on the post-2015 agenda entitled "The road to dignity by 2030: ending poverty, transforming all lives and protecting the planet". The very last words of that document read as follows:

"we have an historic opportunity and duty to act, boldly, vigorously and expeditiously, to achieve a life of dignity for all, leaving no one behind." (*A/69/700, para. 161*)

I would ask us to consider that as our opportunity and our responsibility.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to Ms. Deniz Duru Aydin, representative of Access Now.

Ms. Aydin (Access Now): I am speaking here today as a 23-year-old Internet user from Istanbul, Turkey. I have been told that I am the youngest person to address this Hall in the past two days. My participation in the information society started when I was 12, playing the game Snake on my father's mobile phone. Now I use the free and open Internet on a daily basis to access information, talk with my family and friends back home and express my ideas. I am also proud to say that I encrypt my e-mails.

I represent Access Now, an international organization that defends and extends the digital rights of users at risk around the world. When I was invited to speak here, I asked Access Now's global community of Internet users to identify the biggest threats and opportunities for the future of the Internet in the next 10 years. More than 1,000 people from over all over the world have helped me to write this speech, so perhaps this is the first crowd-sourced statement delivered at the United Nations. Here is what we have to say.

Human rights must remain at the centre of the development agenda for the Internet. As we take on the important responsibility of bridging digital divides, we must recognize that connectivity is not enough. We have to measure progress through new benchmarks for human rights and fundamental freedoms, and not merely by cell phone subscriptions or bandwidth alone. The Internet can empower the most vulnerable among us to harness their potential. It is therefore inspiring to see that today's draft outcome document (A/70/L.33) acknowledges the centrality of human rights to the vision of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS). And it is now the duty of the States assembled in this Hall to realize that vision by protecting our digital rights.

We must protect our privacy in the digital age. We should end the practice of mass surveillance, because it undermines the security of our communications, turns citizens into suspects and lessens confidence in the use of information and communications technologies (ICT). As the draft outcome document notes, users around the world should not be subjected to arbitrary or unlawful interference with their privacy, and we all agree with that.

A free and open Internet must be protected. Net neutrality ensures end-to-end access to global networks and provides a foundation for opportunity and innovation. Citizens of the largest democracies

in the world are calling for net neutrality in public consultations, sometimes submitting millions of comments in support of a free and open Internet. It is time to hear their voices and act on their call.

We must stop censorship and the blocking of content. Barriers to participation in the information society such as content filtering; shutting down networks; and imprisoning lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and queer advocates, bloggers, human rights defenders and climate activists should come to an end. Such violations of rights directly obstruct the free flow of information and knowledge. We want to acknowledge and stand in solidarity with those who are detained, facing charges or at risk as a result of exercising their basic rights. We hope that the draft outcome document's call for the protection of journalists, media workers and civil society space will help end the criminalization of speech, both online and offline.

As a young Internet user, I congratulate everyone involved in producing the draft outcome document. I would also like to thank the 1,000 members of Access Now's global community who contributed to the writing of this speech.

We hope that the future steps of the WSIS process will become more inclusive, participatory and transparent. We urge the General Assembly to include more youth and civil society in the conversation, so that we can continue to shape the future of the Internet and ensure that our digital rights are defended and extended for generations to come.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to Ms. Avri Doria, Researcher with M17M.ORG.

Ms. Doria (M17M.ORG): I would like to thank Member States for producing a draft outcome document (A/70/L.33) that not only does no harm to the Internet but offers opportunities for us to reinforce the global Internet as a resource to be shared by all people.

Since I was young, I have had great love for the United Nations in its role of bringing people together to talk. Over the past decades, the multi-stakeholder movement in Internet governance, as well as in other areas, has contributed to participatory democracy within international organizations and, in small measure, within some intergovernmental organizations. I thank the co-facilitators for having allowed a measure of stakeholder participation and for giving us a peek into

a largely opaque process. I thank those Governments that have included stakeholder voices within their delegations, allowing them to participate and to observe the full process. When the time comes in 10 years to review the work enabled by such outcomes, our hope is that we will have a full multi-stakeholder process to review — one that goes beyond giving us a peek behind the curtain.

It is important to use the outcomes to create and implement policies and practices that reinforce and expand an open, people-centred Internet that serves the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). While the SDGs may not fully realize the importance of information and communication technologies and the Internet in their effort, those involved in the process of the World Summit on the Information Society are aware of what we can do to help. It is up to us. I am heartened to see the focus that was put on human rights in the draft outcome docuemnt, at a time when so many organizations fear implementing human rights policies and some Member States violate them in their treatment of women, indigenous populations and endangered populations. It is good to see that when Member States come together, they are still able to respect the importance of human rights.

In dealing with human rights, I need to single out two areas that need special attention: violence against women — something that is already endemic in society and that has found new expression on the Internet — and the fact that the Internet is being used as a means to incite violence against the gay community in many countries around the world. When people talk about security on the Internet, it is endangered populations that are of great concern. Within their roles and responsibilities, Governments and others must refrain from using the Internet as a weapon against minorities.

It is good that the Internet Governance Forum (IGF) has been renewed for at least 10 years. I am also grateful that the barrier between enhanced cooperation, as a goal, and the Internet Governance Forum as a space for working on such goals, has been lessened somewhat — perhaps a little. The IGF has already been used for bilateral as well as multi-stakeholder discussions. The IGF is part of the United Nations system, and therefore can be used for multilateral discussions on enhanced cooperation, as necessary. While some decisions will continue remain in the hands of Member States, I hope that, over time, Member States

will realize that inclusive and democratic stakeholder participation, in both national and international settings, is essential for developing public policy and for implementing it.

In conclusion, I thank the United Nations for the work that it has done to contribute to the continued growth of an open, people-centred Internet. Now there is much work for all of us to do together as participants on an equal footing, despite our different roles and responsibilities.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to Ms. Deborah Brown, Senior Project Coordinator of the Association for Progressive Communications.

Ms. Brown (Association for Progressive Communications): It is an honour to be here today. I speak on behalf of the Association for Progressive Communications (APC), a global non-governmental network with 70 members in more than 40 countries, mostly from the global South. The APC has been mobilizing the power of information and communications technologies (ICT) for social justice and development for the past 25 years and has participated in the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) process since its inception. We are pleased that the draft outcome document (A/70/L.33) reaffirms the WSIS principles of a people-centred, inclusive and development-oriented information society.

We are particularly pleased about the emphasis on human rights and gender equality. We would have liked to have seen an explicit mention of economic, social and cultural rights, but we believe that they are implicit in the human rights frameworks mentioned in the draft text. We strongly support the action plan to close the digital gender gap launched yesterday by UN-Women and the International Telecommunication Union and their partners. But we must also remember that gender justice cannot be achieved on the Internet alone. Social values and practices that harm and marginalize women exist everywhere, even in developed countries. For women to feel safe and empowered on the Internet they need more than access, they need respect, access to justice and equality online and offline.

We hope that the draft outcome and the process that produced it will serve to reinvigorate efforts to create enabling policy environments to mobilize ICT for development at all levels and encourage the collaboration and allocation of the resources needed to bring about positive change.

We are pleased that the draft outcome document links the WSIS process to the Sustainable Development Goals. For the next WSIS review to provide meaningful input into the review of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (resolution 70/1), the integration of the SDGs needs to be part of the follow-up and implementation in both processes, and concrete steps must be taken to ensure that such integration happens at all levels, especially at the national level.

We very much value that the draft document recognizes that multi-stakeholder and multilateral approaches are not mutually exclusive. We believe that that is precisely how the proposed working group of the Commission on Science and Technology for Development should approach its task. But cooperation and multi-stakeholder approaches to governance are needed not only at the global level but at the national level as well. Governments need to put into place processes that reflect the WSIS principles at that level as well.

We appreciate the emphasis on the multi-stakeholder approach in the draft document, but we would have liked it to look at the private sector not just as a partner, but as an actor with human rights responsibilities. Some Internet business models pose a threat to human rights and to the Internet as a public resource, and they increase inequality. We are disappointed that the draft outcome document failed to assert what was so clearly stated in NETmundial — that the Internet is a global resource and that it should be managed in the public interest.

We urge Member States, which worked so hard to reach agreement on the draft outcome document, to uphold their human rights commitments set out within it. That means ending mass surveillance both within and between countries and releasing journalists, activists and bloggers who have been persecuted as result of their use of the Internet for human rights and social justice. We call for the dropping of charges and release of Alaa Abdel Fattah, Bassel Khartabil, Khadijah Ismayilova and Hisham Almiraat, among too many others.

Finally, we must stop pitting human rights against security. It is a false dichotomy. When talking about security, we must ask — security for who? Approaches to cybersecurity must be truly people-centred and underpinned by human rights. Efforts to build trust,

security and confidence in the use of ICT can be done only through open, inclusive and transparent processes. It is only once users have trust in the technology that they are using that they will feel secure.

Today, while we mark the conclusion of the WSIS+10 review, it should not be seen as end. All stakeholders must renew their efforts to build a free and open Internet. If not, we are going to lose it.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to Ms. Kathryn Brown, President of the Internet Society.

Ms. Brown (Internet Society): On behalf of the Internet Society, an organization of 80,000 members, 145 organizations and 112 volunteer chapters in 92 countries dedicated to an open, globally connected Internet, I congratulate the General Assembly on the successful conclusion of the review of the World Summit on the Information Society 10 years on (WSIS+10).

The Internet Society evolved from the belief of our founder, Vint Cerf, that a society would emerge from the idea of the Internet. Today, we see that not only has an information society emerged, but also that the Internet has woven itself into the very fabric of our whole society and is now a critical part of how we connect, communicate, create and collaborate.

We are encouraged by the positive outcome of the WSIS+10 review, resulting from years of cooperation and shared dialogue. The draft final outcome document (A/70/L.33) is an endorsement of the agreement that we all made 10 years ago to allow the Internet to grow and flourish through bottom-up, distributed, collaborative processes. We enthusiastically support the unequivocal recommitment to the multi-stakeholder model, first adopted in Tunis, the renewal of the mandate of the Internet Governance Forum and the central focus on creating a digital enabling environment for achieving the Sustainable Development Goals. Moreover, the Internet Society has continually called for a sharper focus on development and human rights in order to build a people-centred information society. WSIS has delivered by putting the building blocks into place to continue to champion those two crucial imperatives. Importantly, the co-facilitators have shone a light on the value of the collaborative, multi-stakeholder model by striving to be as open, transparent and inclusive as the United Nations process would allow. By their actions they have acknowledged that there is only one way to build the Internet future, and that is by working together.

I would like to thank those who have made such an agreement possible. I thank the Secretary-General, the President of the General Assembly and our two excellent co-facilitators. But most of all, I thank all of those stakeholders who contributed with their passion, ideas and advocacy to this positive outcome.

We know that the draft outcome document reflects a series of compromises — but we have a concern, and it is not an insignificant one. In our view, the draft outcome falls short by failing to fully recognize the transnational nature of the Internet as a borderless network of networks, comprised of millions of individual networks that connect around the globe. It seeks to apply national solutions to global problems, particularly those related to safety and security. That shortfall is compounded by an unfortunate misbelief by some that cooperation among Governments alone is sufficient to solve issues that require the expertise and commitment of all of us.

Our able and perceptive co-facilitator from the United Arab Emirates asked the opening panel yesterday how we could improve United Nations processes, which have historically been multilateral, to better address the governance issues of the Internet. By nature, such issues are multi-stakeholder, transnational and distributed. We agree that further progress must be made to fully embrace a changing digital world that knows no boundaries, has no borders and has no single decision-maker.

As more people — and things — come online, many challenges, known and unknown, lie ahead. Government-centric processes are only one of the many ways that solutions can be crafted and implemented. Solving twenty-first century problems will require the collaboration of stakeholders through twenty-first century mechanisms. We at the Internet Society stand ready to join with everyone in this Hall, and with all stakeholders around the world, to reach a common vision of an open, global, trusted Internet for everyone, everywhere. Once again, I thank the Assembly for its dedication to a better world.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to the Vice-President of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers.

Mr. Markovski (Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers): I am honoured and delighted to make a statement on behalf of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN) on what is an important and historic discussion of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS)+10 review.

I would like to thank the President of the General Assembly, the co-facilitators — the Permanent Representative of the United Arab Emirates, Mrs. Lana Zaki Nusseibeh, and the Permanent Representative of Latvia, Mr. Jānis Mažeiks — their Permaent Missions to the United Nations and their staff, United Nations agencies and all stakeholders, many of whom are here today, for the excellent preparatory work that has allowed us to reach this important stage. It has been a supremely collaborative effort. I would especially like to thank the President of the General Assembly, the co-facilitators and the Department of Economic and Social Affairs and its staff for making the process as open as possible within the framework of the United Nations and for providing all stakeholders with opportunities to send comments and participate in the discussions.

ICANN and its community have been engaged in WSIS since the first Summit, in 2003 and, more recently, in the review preparation process, working with other stakeholders at events organized by UNESCO, the International Telecommunication Union, the Commission on Science and Technology for Development of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development and the Internet Governance Forum. We are glad that the draft WSIS+10 outcome document (A/70/L.33) builds on the foundations of the Tunis Agenda, while also addressing a number of different and important new issues. As the draft outcome document recognizes, we all face many challenges. But considerable positive progress has been made since 2005. Our ICANN community hopes to have contributed to bridging the digital divide — for example, by increasing Internet multilingualism through internationalized domain names, a programme on which we have been working in cooperation with our global community and UNESCO.

We are also pleased that the draft outcome document extends the mandate of the Internet Governance Forum for another 10 years. That is very important for this unique bottom-up dialogue, which is now taking place at the regional and international levels as well. I also want to take this opportunity to recognize the broader Internet community, whether here in New York for today's meeting or elsewhere, for its continuous engagement in the WSIS review process.

ICANN is happy to have been part of such a robust and vital technical community, including the Internet Society, Regional Internet Registries and others, whose work has been recognized and reflected in the draft outcome document. The NETmundial Conference, held in April last year, showed us all that by working together we can address issues of substance and mutual concern. I would like to thank Brazil for that. That must be our challenge for the future as we continue to work for the common good.

Let me finish by justifying the word "historic" when describing today's General Assembly meeting, as we should not use that word lightly here at the United Nations. We are at a turning point. We have the opportunity to collectively make a real difference with the adoption of the 2030 Sustainable Development Agenda (resolution 70/1), the successful and significant agreement in Paris on climate change and now with this draft agreement to adress the use of information and communications technologies for the common good. Fadi Chehadé, our President and Chief Executive Officer, said yesterday that we must grasp this opportunity to harness the goodwill and positive spirit shown during the negotiations and discussions over the past few weeks to tackle the challenges we all face. For its part, ICANN is committed to working with all stakeholders, including the United Nations and the Permanent Missions to the United Nations, in a truly multi-stakeholder and inclusive manner in order to make sure the Internet continues to develop as a global facility that is single, secure, stable and resilient for the good of all people.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to the Vice-President for Public Affairs of the Telenor Group.

Mr. Søndergaard (Telenor Group): First, let me congratulate members on the World Summit on the Information Society 10-year review draft outcome document (A/70/L.33), putting in place ambitious goals and frameworks on how to govern and ensure universal access to the Internet.

An urgent priority for us all must be to address the growing broadband connectivity gap. Studies show that the poor, the rural, the illiterate and, regrettably, women are those least likely to be online. This is of

concern because the opportunity lost through not being connected has never been greater, and it is growing. Being connected means being included. Today, mobile connectivity is within reach of almost everyone. The next challenge is to make the Internet accessible to everyone.

Telenor's contribution is our ambition to have 200 million active Internet users by 2017. At Telenor, we have seen the benefits of mobile and Internet connectivity at first hand. Look at Myanmar. When Telenor launched service in Yangon, we signed up 514,000 new customers in one day. Now, after a year of operations we have 12 million customers. In a country that has been cut off from the outside world for more than 60 years, over 50 per cent of the population now use their mobile phones to access the Internet regularly. In Pakistan, we are banking the unbanked through Easypaisa. When we launched in 2009, fewer than 1 in 10 Pakistanis had access to a bank account, but 60 per cent had a mobile subscription. Today we conduct more than $4 billion in transactions every year.

Telenor is a proud supporter of the Sustainable Development Goals. In our markets, we see how mobile connectivity is an enabler for people, reducing inequalities and securing inclusion. Mobile connectivity fosters economic growth, better health, quality education and better protection of our planet. Achieving these ambitious goals will require joint effort from Governments, civil society, international organizations and industry. It will also require massive and continuous investements. To help us make those investments, I would like to stress the following.

Governments must provide more certainty for investors. Frameworks and policies should be put in place that are future-oriented, open and transparent. Governments must not put up barriers to mobile connectivity. Taxes and fees can make up a significant portion of the cost of owning and using a mobile device. Governments must respect freedom of speech, access to information and a democratic dialogue. Far too often we have seen efforts to block services or clamp down on content. Finally, Governments must maintain an equal approach to all operators, irrespective of whether the company is public or private, foreign or national.

We are pleased to have the opportunity to be part of this event, as we seek a common goal to empower the many, not just a few.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to the Secretary General of the International Chamber of Commerce.

Mr. Danilovich (International Chamber of Commerce): I am John Danilovich, Secretary General of the International Chamber of Commerce, the world's largest and most representative business organization, with over 6.5 million members in some 130 countries.

In September, I spoke in this building to underscore the global business community's strong and unequivocal commitment to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). It is clear that the decisions taken by Governments as part of the review of the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) will have a significant bearing on the success of these new global Goals. I am grateful for the opportunity to set out the business community's vision for outcomes of the WSIS review that will help us all to deliver on the potential and promise of the SDGs.

Information and communication technologies (ICT) are clearly central to each of the 17 Sustainable Development Goals. Simply put, if we want people to find employment and to feed, heal and educate themselves, then we need to ensure that they can benefit from the Internet, and that they are able not just to use but also to create related technologies and services that are relevant to themselves, their communities and their countries.

Despite the significant advances in the last 10 years, more needs to be done to ensure that everyone has access to the Internet so that all people can be empowered to transform their lives and their economies. The challenge of connecting the world will require us to better understand persistent barriers and to focus actions on overcoming them in the years ahead. The emphasis placed by the draft WSIS outcomes on briding the variety of digitial divides, including the gender divide, in many countries and regions reflects the importance of this to all of us. In addressing these issues, we urge everyone present to recognize that the engagement of business, with its own unique voice, will be vital to connect, unleash and leverage the full potential of technology to achieve our common goals in the development of vibrant digital economies and to have inclusive information societies that deliver benefits to all.

Connecting the world is a vital first step, but we also need to take common action to build a secure and

trustworthy Internet. As business, we fully recognize that a global architecture of cybersecurity needs to be promoted, further developed and better implemented, in cooperation with all stakeholders and international expert bodies. We encourage Governments to note the growing number of multi-stakeholder initiatives dedicated to cybersecurity capacity-building at the local, the national, the regional and the global levels and their significant potential to enable a new global culture of cybersecurity.

Finally, we commend the outcome of this review for reaffirming the importance of cooperative and collective action in managing the global governance of the Internet. We applaud the fact that the review recognizes that it is crucial that the future of the Internet be shaped through an open, inclusive and truly multi-stakeholder process. The Internet Governance Forum (IGF) has become a unique means for identifying issues and solutions relevant across stakeholders and economies, with a special focus on those delivering on developing-world concerns through a collaborative approach on an equal footing and in an unfettered and open environment. We therefore fully support the proposed renewal of the IGF mandate for 10 years.

Business remains engaged in implementing improvements to the IGF to build on its important strengths and to enhance the community's ability to continue addressing complex problems and the challenges of the future. In particular, we strongly support the call to increase participation of business representatives from developing countries, and we encourage the International Monetary Fund's Multistakeholder Advisory Group to prioritize working collectively on proposals for addressing this in 2016, building and strengthening links on existing national and regional IGF initiatives and enabling the sharing of information globally on the practices that have successfully addressed these challenges.

In conclusion, we strongly encourage any future review of the implementation of the WSIS outcomes to maintain the important principles of an open, inclusive, multi-stakeholder Internet, and we commend the decision to align with the review of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (resolution 70/1). We stress that all reviews of WSIS should be undertaken in an open and fully inclusive manner, with all stakeholders participating. To support this, we request the Secretary-General and international organizations with a role in WSIS to intensify their efforts to develop effective mechanisms for the full participation of non-governmental stakeholders to more fully integrate their activities into development frameworks and processes.

The Internet, underpinned by earlier Summit decisions, has already had a transformational affect on our societies. This review can provide a footing that will enable us to work collaboratively to help deliver a brighter and more prosperous future for all by 2030. We urge the General Assembly to seize the opportunity in a true spirit of cooperation at the very heart of WSIS and the Sustainable Development Goals.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I now give the floor to the Chief Executive Officer of Telefónica Internacional USA.

Mr. Timmermans (Telefónica Internacional USA) (*spoke in Spanish*): It is an honour for me to address the Assembly today. I speak on behalf of Telefónica, which is a digital telecommunications company and broadband provider in Europe and Latin America. We have been involved in the World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) process since its beginning, and we very highly value the efforts made by the United Nations and its Member States to strengthen an open and inclusive process.

All our societies, including the most disadvantaged, have changed for the better thanks to the Internet and the new digital economy. However, no one can be left behind in this new industrial revolution. I think I can say that all private companies fully agree that we must connect everyone to the Internet. To achieve that goal, public-private collaboration is essential, as is some private sector investment that will make it possible to extend and improve Internet connectivity.

To provide an idea of the scope of this endeavour, Telefónica alone, just in Latin America, has invested €120 billion over the past 25 years to improve Internet connectivity. Those efforts must be supported by national Governments, whose public policies must attract private investment. That includes everything from spectrum policies to assistance with the rollout of networks.

Secondly, it is essential that we keep the Internet open. Open standards and interface established an Internet that everyone could connect to. It is essential that the open nature of the Internet be maintained, now

that conventional computers and browsers are being replaced by smartphones and applications.

Finally, Internet users must maintain the confidence that enables them to make their lives digital realities. The Internet must be secure and there must be adequate protection of the privacy of its users. Those objectives can be achieved only through the cooperation of all stakeholders. That is why it is fitting that the mandate of the Internet Governance Forum (IGF) be extended for another 10 years. There is no other forum that can match the IGF in its diversity, openness and the inclusiveness of its debates.

The Internet as we know it today exists thanks to the enthusiasm and participation of all parties, to the investments of many private companies and to the energy and dedication of many talented people. We must not forget that this is the best foundation on which to base our work for the future.

Mr. Mende Omalanga (Democratic Republic of the Congo) (*spoke in French*): Please excuse our late arrival to this discussion.

At the outset, I would like to express our appreciation to the Secretary-General and the entire international community for having accorded this importance to issues related to information and the progress of new and traditional information and communications technologies.

We are convinced that these technologies can be a true accelerator for development because they have the advantage of developing integrative global citizenship and facilitating democratic governance in all our countries, specifically due to a participatory approach to governance in various aspects of public action. They play a major role in the competitiveness of businesses and the effectiveness of administrations and public services, as well as health, education and security services. They also constitute a privileged space for the production and distribution of goods and materials, such as culture, in a country like ours, the Democratic Republic of the Congo. The advent of the Internet and especially the Web as a means for mass communication and the success of social networks mean that these technologies have an important social dimension and a major impact on the functioning of our societies, in particular of our young countries.

The growth of products stemming from the Internet, in areas that were previously separate and now overlap, has created a host of innovative services. That evolution accelerates humankind's progress from a global perspective, but, from another perspective, it brings with it some inconveniences to which we, as decision-makers, cannot turn a blind eye. They are problems we encounter in everyday life in the spaces we navigate through in social networks and instant messaging, which often harbour traps such as multiple user names and passwords, cyberfraud, attacks on private life, violent content, cybercrime and disinformation. Many colleagues spoke of that yesterday, according to information provided to us. A leader of a country recalled in this very Hall that we must avoid giving a blank check to those who produce those tools when they refuse to collaborate with State authorities seeking more security for their citizens. It is important that we, as decision-makers, can guard against such excesses.

This illustrates the need for a collective and objective approach, based on solidarity, to preventing those anti-social actions that one can see in the Internet sphere. We still remember the terrorist acts that destabilized certain countries, especially in Europe and Africa and even here in the United States. In that regard, my country, the Democratic Republic of the Congo, takes this opportunity to call for joining efforts by our respective countries, Governments and representatives of civil society, because that action must be coordinated. It is possible to succeed if we act together, but if we act alone success is simply an illusion.

To sum up, the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development (resolution 70/1) in the specific framework of the global information society will be able to achieve its goals only if it takes into account all the challenges attached to it. In that regard, my Government would like to urge everyone to work with both tools: on the one hand, the implementation of the progress made possible by the opportunities offered by the new information and communication technologies and, on the other hand, the certainty that any abuse of it will be dealt with by State authorities and civil society no matter at what level it occurs. It is only in that way that humankind will be able to benefit as much as possible in its search for a comprehensive and shared development, which is made possible to us by the Internet.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): We have heard the last speaker inr the high-level meeting of the General Assembly on the overall review of the

implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society, under agenda item 17.

The Assembly will now proceed to consider draft resolution A/70/L.33.

I give the floor to the representative of the Secretariat.

Mr. Zhang Saijin (Department for General Assembly and Conference Management): In connection with draft resolution A/70/L.33, entitled "Outcome document of the high-level meeting of the General Assembly on the overall review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society", I wish to put on record the following statement of financial implications on behalf of the Secretary-General, in accordance with rule 153 of the rules of procedure of the General Assembly.

Paragraph 65 and 71 of the outcome document contained in draft resolution A/70/L.33 read as follows:

"65. We note, however, the divergent views held by Member States with respect to the process towards implementation of enhanced cooperation as envisioned in the Tunis Agenda. We call for continued dialogue and work on the implementation of enhanced cooperation. We accordingly request the Chair of the Commission on Science and Technology for Development, through the Economic and Social Council, to establish a working group to develop recommendations on how to further implement enhanced cooperation as envisioned in the Tunis Agenda, taking into consideration the work that has been done on this matter thus far. The group, which shall be constituted no later than July 2016, will decide at the outset on its methods of work, including modalities, and will ensure the full involvement of all relevant stakeholders, taking into account all their diverse views and expertise. The group will submit a report to the Commission on Science and Technology for Development at its twenty-first session for inclusion in the annual report of the Commission to the Council. The report will also serve as an input to the regular reporting of the Secretary-General on implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society."

"71. We recognize that, in the preparation of this review, a number of challenges and opportunities have been identified, requiring longer-term consultations to determine appropriate responses, and that the pace of the development of information and communications technologies necessitates higher-level consideration of progress achieved and future action. We accordingly request the General Assembly to hold a high-level meeting on the overall review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society in 2025, involving the input and participation of all stakeholders, including in the preparatory process, to take stock of progress on the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society and identify both areas of continued focus and challenges. We recommend that the outcome of the high-level meeting be an input into the review process for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development."

Pursuant to the request contained in paragraph 65 of the draft outcome document, the Chair of the Commission of Science and Technology for Development is requested through the Economic and Social Council to establish a working group to develop recommendations on how to further implement enhanced cooperation as envisaged by the Tunis Agenda, taking into consideration the work that has been done on this matter so far by the previous working group on enhanced cooperation. Furthermore, the Commission on Science and Technology for Development, at its nineteenth session in May 2016, will prepare the draft resolution on the World Summit on the Information Society follow-up that will contain the request of the Chair to establish the aforementioned working group.

The draft resolution will be considered by the Economic and Social Council in its July 2016 session. Subsequently, the working group on enhanced cooperation, which shall be constituted no later than July 2016, will decide on its methods of work, including modalities and so forth, and the working group on enhanced cooperation will submit a report to the Commission on Science and Technology for Development at its twenty-first session in 2018.

Accordingly, at this time, there are no financial implications with regard to paragraph 65. However, should the Economic and Social Council endorse the request of the Chair of the Commission on Science and Technology for Development to establish the working group in its July 2016 session, the Secretariat will at that time, and in line with the established procedure and rule 53 of the rules and procedures of the Economic

and Social Council, inform the Council of any financial implications.

Pursuant to paragraph 71, all issues related to a high-level plenary meeting, including the date, format, organization and scope, on the overall review of the implementation of the World Summit on the Information Society outcomes in 2025 are yet to be determined. Accordingly, in the absence of the modalities for the meetings, it is not possible at the present time to establish the potential cost implications of the requirements for meetings and documentation. Upon the decision on the modalities, format and organization of the meeting, the Secretary-General would submit the relevant costs of such requirements, in accordance with rule 153 of the rules of procedure of the General Assembly. Furthermore, the date of the meeting will have to be determined in consultation with the Department for General Assembly and Conference Management. Accordingly, the adoption of draft resolution A/70/L.33 would not give rise to any financial implications under the programme budget.

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): There are no requests to speak in explanation of vote. The Assembly will now take a decision on draft resolution A/70/L.33, entitled "Outcome document of the high-level meeting of the General Assembly on the overall review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society". May I take it that the Assembly wishes to adopt it?

Draft resolution A/70/L.33 was adopted (resolution 70/125).

The Acting President (*spoke in Spanish*): I would like to express my sincere thanks to Ambassador Jānis Mažeiks, Permanent Representative of Latvia, and Ambassadir Lana Zaki Nusseibeh, Permanent Representative of the United Arab Emirates, who so ably and patiently conducted the discussions and complex negotiations in the informal consultations on resolution 70/125, which we have just adopted. I am sure the members of the Assembly join me in extending to them our sincere appreciation.

The High-level Meeting of the General Assembly on the overall review of the implementation of the outcomes of the World Summit on the Information Society is now concluded.

The Assembly has thus concluded this stage of its consideration of agenda item 17.

The meeting rose at 4.30 p.m.