UNITED NATIONS

NATIONS UNIES

UNRESTRICTED

ECONOMIC

AND

SOCIAL COUNCIL

CONSEIL ECONOMIQUE ET SOCIAL

E/CN.4/36/Add.2 5 December, 1947.

FRENCH ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS SECOND SESSION

Parallel Passages in

Human Rights Drafting Committee Text and United

States Proposal (E/CN.4/36)

Section I. Drafting Committee Text compared with United States
Short Form

Section II. United States Short Form compared with Drafting Committee Text

Legend:

DC - Human Rights Drafting Committee Text (Arabic numerals). US - United States Proposal (Roman numerals).

SECTION I

Human Rights Drafting Committee Text compared with United States Proposal

- DC 1. All men are brothers.

 Being endowed with reason and conscience, they are members of one family.

 They are free, and possess equal dignity and rights.
 - US Preamble, first clause.
 Whereas, by the Charter of the UN, all members affirm their faith in the dignity and worth of the human person
 - US X. Everyone, everywhere in the world, is entitled to the human rights and fundamental freedoms set forth in this Declaration
- DC 2, 3, 4. First alternative Article 2. The object of
 society is to afford each
 of its members equal
 opportunity for the full
 development of his spirit,
 mind and body.

Article 3. As human beings cannot live and support themselves without the help and support of society, each one owes to society fundamental duties which are

Article 4. In the exercise of his rights, everyone is limited by the rights of others.

Second alternative (one Article only)Article 2. These rights are limited only by the equal rights of others.
Man also owes duties to society through which he is enabled to develop his spirit, mind and body in wider freedom.

US X, second clause.

The full exercise of these rights requires recognition of the rights of others and protection by law of the freedom, general welfare and security of all.

DC 5. All are equal before the law and entitled to equal protection of the law. Public authorities and judges, as well as individuals are sub-

ject to the rule of the law.

U.S. Short Form

- US I. Everyone is entitled to life, liberty and equal protection under law.
- US VII. Everyone, regardless of office or status, is subject to the rule of law.
- DC 6. Everyone is entitled to the US X. Everyone everywhere in the rights and freedoms set forth in this Declaration, without distinction as to race, sex, language, or religion.
 - world, is entitled to the human rights and fundamental freedoms set forth in this Declaration without distinction as to race, sex, language or religion
- DC 7. Everyone has the right to US I. Everyone is entitled to life, to personal liberty and life, liberty, and equal to personal security.
 - protection under law.
 - US III. No one shall be subjected to unreasonable interference with his privacy
 - US VI. No one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention

- DC 8. No one shall be deprived of his personal liberty or kept in custody except in cases prescribed by law and after due process. Everyone placed under arrest or detention shall have the right to immediata judicial determination of the legality of any detention to which he may be subject.
- US VI. No one shall be subjected to arbitrary arrest or detention. Anyone who is arrested has the right to be promptly informed of the charges
 against him, and to trial within a reasonable time or to be released.

DC 9. No one shall be held guilty of any offence until legally convicted. No one shall be convicted or punished for any offence except by judgment of an independent and impartial court of law, rendered in conformity with law after a fair and public trial at which he has had an opportunity for a full hearing and has been given all guarantees necessary for his defense.

U.S. Short Form.

US VII. Everyone, in the determination of his rights and obligations, is entitled to a fair hearing before an independent and impartial tribunal and to the aid of counsel

- DC 10. No one can be convicted of crime unless he has violated some law in effect at the time of the act charged as an offence nor be subjected to a penalty greater than that applicable at the time of the offence.
 - No one, even if convicted of a crime, can be subjected to torture.
- US VII. No one shall be convicted or punished for crime except after public trial pursuant to law in effect at the time of the commission of the act charged
- US V. ... No one shall be subjected to torture, or to cruel or inhuman punishment or indignity.
- DC 11. Slavery, which is inconsistent with the dignity of man, is prohibited in all its forms.
- US V. No one shall be held in slavery or unvoluntary servitude. No one shall be subjected to torture, or to cruel or inhuman punishment or indignity.
- DC 12. The privacy of the home and of correspondence and respect for reputation shall be protected by law.
- US III. No one shall be subjected to unreasonable interference with his privacy, family, home, correspondence, or reputation

DC 13. There shall be liberty of movement and free choice of residence within the borders of each State. This freedom may be regulated by any general law adopted in the interest of national welfare and security. Individuals may freely emigrate or renounce their national-

U.S. Short Form

- US IV. There shall be liberty to move freely from place to place within the State, to emigrate
- US X. .. The full exercise of these rights requires recognition of the rights of others and protection by law of the freedom, general welfare, and security of all.
- 14. Everyone has the right to escape persecution on grounds of political or other beliefs or on grounds of racial prejudice by taking refuge on the territory of any State willing to grant him asylum.
- US IV. There shall be liberty to seek asylum from persecution.

- pc 15. Everyone has the right to a status in law and to the enjoyment of fundamental civil rights.
- US I. Everyone is entitled to equal protection under law.
- US X. Everyone, everywhere in the world, is entitled to the human rights and fundamental freedoms set forth in this Declaration

Everyone shall have access to independent and impartial tribunals for the determination of his rights, liabilities and obligations under the law. He shall have the right to consult with and to be represented by counsel.

US VII. Everyone, in the determination of his rights and obligations, is entitled to a fair hearing before an independent and impartial tribunal and to the aid of counsel

- DC 16. There shall be equal opportunity for all to engage in all vocations and professions not constituting public employment.
- U.S. Short Form
- US IX. Everyone has the right to a decent living; to work and advance his well-being;

- DC 17. Everyone has a right to own personal property. No one shall be deprived of his property except for public welfare and with just compensation. The State may determine those things, rights and enterprises, that are susceptible of private appropriation and regulate the acquisition and use of such property.
- US III. No one shall be arbitrarily deprived of his property.

- DC 18. Everyone has the right to US VIII. Everyone has the right a nationality.
- to a nationality....

- DC 19. No alien legally admitted to the territory of a State may be expelled therefrom without having a fair hearing
- US VII. Everyone, in the determination of his rights and obligations, is entitled to a fair hearing

DC 20. Individual freedom of thought and conscience, to hold and change beliefs, is an absolute and sacred right.

The practice of a private or public worship, religious observances, and manifestations of differing convictions, can be subject only to such limitations as are necessary to protect public order, morals and the rights and freedoms of others.

(UK alternative text, paragraph 3, emphasizes freedom of religious teaching)

DC 21. Everyone is free to hold US II. or impart his opinion, or to receive and seek information and the opinion of others from sources wherever situated.

Personne ne peut etre inquiete en raison de ses opinions.

DC 22. There shall be freedom of US II. expression either by word, in writing, in the press, in books or by visual, auditive or other means. There shall be equal access to all channels of communication.

US Short Form

US II. Everyone has the right... to freedom of religion, conscience, and belief ...

US X.

....The full exercise of these rights requires recognition of the rights of others and protection by law of the freedom, general welfare and security of all.

US II. Everyone has the right to freedom of information ...

US II. Everyone has the right to freedom of information, speech, and expression; to freedom of ... beliaf; ...

US II. Everyone has the right to freedom of information, speech, and expression; ...

DC 23. There shall be freedom of peaceful assembly, and of association for political, religious, cultural, scientific, professional and

other purposes.

US II. Everyone has the right ... to freedom of assembly and association.

- DC 24. No state shall deny to any US II. Everyone has the right ... individually or in assoc iation with others, to petition or to communicate with the Government of his state or of his residence or the United Nations.
- individual the right, either to freedom to petition his individually or in assoc. Government and the United Nations.

US Short Form

DC 25. When a government, group US II. (above) or individual seriously or systematically tramples the US VIII. (below) fundamental human rights and freedoms, individuals and peoples have the right to resist oppression and tyranny.

- DC 26. Everyone has the right to US VIII. ... Everyone has a right
 - take an effective part in his Government directly or through his representatives.

 to take an effective part in his Government directly or through his representatives.
- just authority only from the will of the people and has a duty to conform to the wishes secret ballot. of the people. These wishes shall be manifested particularly by democratic elections, which shall be periodic, free, and by secret ballot.
- DC 27. The State can derive its US VIII. ... and to participate in

- opportunity to engage in public employment and to hold public office in the State of which he is a citizen. Access to examinations for public employment shall not be a matter of privilege or favour.
- DC 28. Everyone shall have equal US VIII. ... Everyone has a right to take an affective part in his Government ...
 - US IX. Everyone has the right... to work and advance his well-being ... There shall be equal opportunity for all to participate in the economic and cultural life of the community.

US Short Form

- DC 29. Everyone has the right to US IX. Everyone has the right to perform socially useful work.

 a decent living, to work and advance his well-being; ...
- DC 30. Human labour is not a merchandise. It shall be performed in good conditions and shall secure a decent standard of living to the worker and his family.
- US IX. Everyone has the right to a decent living, to work and advance his well-being; ...
- DC 31. Everyone has the right to education. Primary education shall be free and compulsory. There shall be equal access for all to such facilities for technical, cultural and higher education as can be provided by the State on the basis of merit and without distinction as to race, sex, language, religion, social standing, political affiliation or financial means.
- US IX. Everyone has the right ... to ... education ... There shall be equal opportunity for all to participate in the ... cultural life of the Community.

- DC 32. Everyone has the right to US IX. Everyone has the right to a fair share of rest and a decent living; ... leisure.
- DC 33. Everyone, without distinction as to economic and social conditions, has a right to the highest attainable standard of health. The responsibility of the State and community for the health and safety of its people can be fulfilled only by the provision of adequate health and social measures.
- US IX. Everyone has the right ... to health ...

E/CN.4/36/Add.2 Page 10

HRDC Text

DC 34. Everyone has the right to social security. To the utmost of its possibilities, the State shall undertake measures for the promotion of full employment and for the security of the individual against unemployment, disability, old age, and all other loss of livelihood for reasons beyond his control.

Mothers and children have the right to special regard, care and resources.

- DC 35. Everyone has the right to participate in the cultural life of the community, to enjoy the arts, and to share in the benefits that result from scientific discoveries.
- DC 36. In States inhabited by a substantial number of persons of a race, language or religion other than those of the majority of the population, persons belonging to such ethnic, linguistic or religious minorities shall have the right as far as compatible with public order to establish and maintain their schools and cultural or religious institutions, and to use their own language in the press, in public assembly and before the courts and other authorities of the State.

US Short Form

US IX. Everyone has the right ... to social security ...

- US IX. ... There shall be equal opportunity for all to participate in the economic and cultural life of the community.
- US II. Everyone has the right to freedom of information, speech and expression; to freedom of religion, conscience and belief; to freedom of assembly and association; ...
- US IX. Everyone has the right to education ... There shall be equal opportunity for all to participate in the cultural life of the community.
- US X. ... without distinction as to race, sex, language, or religion.