



Human Rights Council
Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances
Communications, cases examined, observations and other activities conducted by the Working Group on Enforced or Involuntary Disappearances*
116th session (10–14 September 2018)
I. Communications

1. Between its 115th and 116th sessions, the Working Group transmitted 77 cases under its urgent action procedure, to: Bahrain (2), Bangladesh (2), China (2), Egypt (52), Jordan (2), Kuwait (1), Libya (1), Pakistan (2), Saudi Arabia (8) and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) (5).
2. At its 116th session, the Working Group decided to transmit 156 newly reported cases of enforced disappearance to 17 States: Algeria (8), Burundi (8), China (1), Democratic People's Republic of Korea (12), Egypt (10), Iraq (1), Libya (4), Mauritania (1), Myanmar (1), Nigeria (7), Oman (1), Pakistan (49), Sri Lanka (21), Syrian Arab Republic (28), Turkmenistan (1), Ukraine (2) and Yemen (1).
3. The Working Group also clarified 149 cases, in: Angola (2), Argentina (16), Bahrain (2), Bhutan (1), China (1), Egypt (50), Iran (Islamic Republic of) (4), Iraq (1), Jordan (2), Libya (1), Mexico (2), Pakistan (64), Peru (1), Russian Federation (1) and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) (1). Some 112 cases were clarified on the basis of information provided by the Governments and 36 on the basis of information provided by sources.
4. Between its 115th and 116th sessions, the Working Group also transmitted 18 communications, either individually or jointly with other special procedure mechanisms: 9 urgent appeals, to Bangladesh (1), China (1), Egypt (2), Nicaragua (1), Pakistan (1), Saudi Arabia (2) and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) (1); 4 prompt intervention letters, to Iran (Islamic Republic of) (1), Libya (1), Sri Lanka (1) and Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of) (1); 4 allegation letters, to Myanmar (1), Turkey (1), the United Arab Emirates (1) and the United States of America (1); and 1 "other letter" to China.
5. On 12 June 2018, a press release concerning the United Arab Emirates was issued together with other special procedure mechanisms.
6. On 27 June 2018, a press release concerning Saudi Arabia was issued together with other special procedure mechanisms.
7. On 4 July 2018, a press release concerning China was issued together with other special procedure mechanisms.

* The annexes to the present document are reproduced as received, in the language of submission only.



8. On 25 July 2018, a press release concerning Spain was issued together with other special procedure mechanisms.
9. On 26 July 2018, a press release concerning Egypt was issued together with other special procedure mechanisms.
10. On 9 August 2018, a press release concerning Nicaragua was issued together with other special procedure mechanisms.
11. At its 116th session, the Working Group also reviewed and adopted three general allegations, concerning Bahrain, Libya and Turkmenistan.

II. Other activities

12. During the session, the Working Group met with relatives of victims of enforced disappearances and with non-governmental organizations working on the issue. The Working Group also held meetings with representatives of the Governments of Angola, Egypt, El Salvador, Morocco, Portugal, Saudi Arabia and Ukraine.
13. On 10 September, the Working Group held an expert consultation on standards and public policies for an effective investigation of enforced disappearances, receiving inputs and contributions to inform its next thematic report to the Human Rights Council in September 2019.
14. On 12 September 2018, the Working Group also presented its annual report to the Human Rights Council and the reports on its visit to the Gambia and the follow-up report to the recommendations it made following its visits to the Western Balkans.
15. The Group also reappointed Bernard Duhaime as Chair-Rapporteur and Tae-Ung Baik as Vice-Chair.

III. Information concerning enforced or involuntary disappearances in States reviewed by the Working Group during the session

Algeria

Standard procedure

16. The Working Group transmitted eight cases to the Government, concerning:
 - (a) Miloud Amari, allegedly arrested on 1 February 1995 by uniformed police outside his home in Oran and never seen again;
 - (b) Tahar Bait, allegedly arrested on 28 August 1996 by the military security at his home in Laghouat and taken to the Laghouat military sector. Reportedly, he was never seen again;
 - (c) Nacer Bellamine, allegedly arrested on 25 May 1994 by members of the military security at his home in Medea and never seen again;
 - (d) Said Hemmache, allegedly last seen on 17 October 1995. It is believed that he was abducted by the army at the Berrouaghia barracks in Medea where he was performing his national service;
 - (e) Nadji Haimed, allegedly last seen on 13 March 1998 at his home in Medea. It is believed that the gendarmes, soldiers or the communal guards may be responsible for his disappearance as reference is made to previous episodes in which he was allegedly persecuted and detained;
 - (f) Amer Mouaz, allegedly arrested by gendarmes at the Mimouza barracks in Oran between 27 June and 2 July 2004, and never seen again;

(g) Yamna El Allaoui, allegedly arrested on 19 December 1975 by the police in the commercial street of downtown Ain Temouchent and never seen again;

(h) Abdelrahmane Ayachine, allegedly abducted on 11 February 1995 from a house located on Sahraoui Brahim Abdelaziz street, in the Sidi Bashir urban sector of Oran, by members of the Special Intervention Group.

17. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of one of the case files to the Government of Morocco.

18. During the session, the Working Group was unable to review the information provided by the Government of Algeria on 30 April 2018 concerning 2,780 outstanding cases due to lack of clarity on some of the information provided. The Working Group hopes to soon be in contact with the Government of Algeria to be able review this information without further delay.

Reply to a general allegation

19. On 7 June 2018, the Government of Algeria responded to the general allegation transmitted on 13 March 2018 focusing on the limited investigations regarding the enforced disappearance of nationals from Morocco in Algeria between 1970 and 1990. The Government of Algeria explained that the Moroccan nationals who had allegedly disappeared during that time were soldiers taking part in an international conflict, which lasted from 1975 to 1991. Reportedly, Algeria was not part of the conflict and did not host any Moroccan prisoners of war in any part of its territory. However, Algeria allegedly facilitated the logistical arrangements for the International Committee of the Red Cross to repatriate Moroccan prisoners of war.

Observation

20. During the session, which coincided with the 39th session of the Human Rights Council, the Working Group noted the statement of the Government of Algeria indicating that details for a possible country visit by the Working Group were being studied. The Working Group hopes that it will soon be allowed to visit the country.

Angola

Clarification

21. On the basis of information previously provided by the Government, the Working Group decided to clarify two cases that were placed under the six-month rule at the 114th session, concerning Silva Alves Kamulingue and Isaias Sebastiao Cassule (A/HRC/WGEID/114/1, para. 13). Reportedly, Mr. Kamulingue and Mr. Cassule are deceased.

Argentina

22. On the basis of information previously provided by the Government, the Working Group decided to clarify 16 cases that were placed under the six-month rule at the 114th session, concerning Armando Archetti, Julio César Campopiano, Alba Luz Cosentino, Federico Adolfo Furth Martínez, Néstor Ubaldo Herrera, María Trinidad Iramain de Vitale, Eduardo Néstor López Gonzalo, Julio Antonio Martín, Ángel Alfonso Medina Guitierres, Susana Elena Ossola de Urra, Ricardo Alberto Pisculichich, Rolando Jesús Pisculichich, Humberto Rubén Ponce, Pedro Rondoletto, María Teresa Sánchez de la Vega and Hugo Arnaldo Vega (A/HRC/WGEID/114/1, para. 14). Reportedly, the remains of the 16 individuals were identified through DNA testing, and the surviving relatives were notified.

Azerbaijan

Application of the six-month rule

23. On 8 August 2018, the Government provided information on one outstanding case. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to the case.

24. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case file to the Governments of Georgia and Turkey.

Bahrain

Urgent action

25. On 11 June 2018, the Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted to the Government of Bahrain the two cases of Fatema Dawood Hasan Ahmed Juma and Zakeya Isa Ali Isa al Barboori, allegedly arrested on 18 May 2018 by plain-clothes officers and armed commando forces from their home in Al Nuwaidrat.

Clarification based on information from sources

26. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the two aforementioned cases. Reportedly, one individual is held in Isa Town Women's Prison and one was released.

Information from the Government

27. On 16 and 18 July 2018, the Government provided information on four cases. Two of the cases were clarified based on information provided by sources (see para. 25 above). The Working Group will consider the information as soon as it has received the translation thereof.

General allegation

28. The Working Group received information from credible sources alleging obstacles to the implementation of the Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance in Bahrain. A general allegation was transmitted to the Government of Bahrain on 5 October 2018 (see annex I), focusing primarily on the reported pattern of arrest and short-term enforced disappearances, as well as on related violations of human rights.

Observation

29. The Working Group wishes to recall article 10 (1) and (2) of the Declaration, according to which any person deprived of liberty shall be held in an officially recognized place of detention and, in conformity with national law, be brought before a judicial authority promptly after detention. Accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, shall be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information unless a wish to the contrary has been manifested by the persons concerned.

Bangladesh

Urgent action

30. On 27 August 2018, the Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted to the Government of Bangladesh the case of Hasinur Rahman, allegedly abducted on 8 August 2018 by a group of 10 to 15 armed plain-clothes men in front of his house in Dhaka.

Joint urgent appeal

31. On 6 June 2018, the Working Group issued an urgent appeal together with other special procedure mechanisms expressing concerns at the information received that more than 132 persons had been killed since 15 May 2018 in the context of the war on drugs; 13,000 had been allegedly arrested and a number of others had been subjected to enforced disappearance.

Observation

32. The Working Group is concerned about the fact that it continues to receive reports of new cases of alleged enforced disappearances in Bangladesh and about the lack of replies from the Government to its cases and communications. The Working Group stresses that, as provided for in article 7 of the Declaration, no circumstances whatsoever may be invoked to justify enforced disappearances and that, according to article 10 (2), accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, should be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information.

Bhutan

Suspension of the six-month rule

33. On 16 October 2017, the Government of Bhutan transmitted information concerning one outstanding case, which was also updated with information provided by the Government of Nepal. On the basis of the information, the Working Group decided to suspend the six-month period that was applied to the case of Lok Nath Acharya. The case will therefore remain under review by the Working Group.

34. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case file to the Government of Nepal.

Burundi

Standard procedure

35. The Working Group transmitted eight cases to the Government of Burundi, concerning:

(a) Jasper Arakaza, allegedly abducted from the Bolingo ya sasa Bar, 3rd Avenue, Gituro District, north of Bujumbura, on 26 December 2015 by officials of the national police;

(b) Albert Dushime, allegedly arrested on his way to Bujumbura from Rwanda on 21 November 2015 by officials of the national police;

(c) Gaston Cishahayo, allegedly abducted from the capital of the Bugarama area of Muramyya on 19 October 2017 by officials of the national police;

(d) Jean-Marie Vianney Arakaza, allegedly abducted from the premises of a factory in Bujumbura on 3 March 2018 by officials of the national police;

(e) Simon Masumbuko, allegedly abducted from a hotel room at the California Hotel in Muyinga between 27 and 28 March 2016 by officials of the national police;

(f) Deo Ndagijimana, allegedly abducted on the road between the Bumerec Hospital (West Kabondo) and Kamenge Hospital (South Kigobe) in Bujumbura on 17 February 2016 by members of the military;

(g) Remy Matabura, allegedly abducted from his home in Mugamba Commune, Bururi Province, on 17 April 2016 by officials of the national police;

(h) Dieudonne Gahungu, allegedly abducted from the Hotel Sangwe, Ngozi Province, on 17 June 2016 by officials of the national police.

Observation

36. The Working Group wishes to recall article 13 (1), (3) and (5) of the Declaration, according to which each State shall ensure that any person having knowledge or a legitimate interest who alleges that a person has been subjected to enforced disappearance has the right to complain to a competent and independent State authority and to have that complaint promptly, thoroughly and impartially investigated by that authority. Whenever there are reasonable grounds to believe that an enforced disappearance has been committed, the State shall promptly refer the matter to that authority for such an investigation, even if there has been no formal complaint. No measure shall be taken to curtail or impede the investigation. Also, steps shall be taken to ensure that all involved in the investigation, including the complainant, counsel, witnesses and those conducting the investigation, are protected against ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal. Finally, steps shall be taken to ensure that any ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal or any other form of interference on the occasion of the lodging of a complaint or during the investigation procedure is appropriately punished.

China

Urgent action

37. On 14 June 2018, the Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted to the Government of China two cases of Khenrap and Dhongye, allegedly forcibly disappeared between 9 and 13 April 2018 by local authorities in Shakchu, Biru County, Naqu Prefecture, Tibet Autonomous Region. Their place of detention remains unknown.

Joint urgent appeal

38. On 14 June 2018, the Working Group also issued an urgent appeal together with other special procedure mechanisms expressing concerns at the reported deteriorating physical and mental health of Liu Xia.

Press release

39. On 4 July 2018, the Working Group issued a press release together with other special procedure mechanisms to express concerns at reports of the deteriorating health of Liu Xia.¹

Standard procedure

40. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of China, concerning Gulikamaier Alifu, a member of the Uighur ethnic minority, allegedly last seen in Luntai, Xinjiang, on 6 March 2018. Her place of detention remains unknown.

Clarification based on information from sources

41. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify one case concerning Liu Xia. The individual is reportedly at liberty and has left the country.

Information from sources

42. Sources provided updated information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Information from the Government of Sweden

43. On 14 September 2018, the Government of Sweden transmitted information concerning one outstanding case under the records of China.

¹ www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23322&LangID=E.

Joint other letter

44. On 22 August 2018, the Working Group transmitted, with other special procedure mechanisms, a joint other letter concerning the use of residential surveillance in a designated location, as amended in article 73 of the Criminal Procedure Law, in relation to persons without permanent domicile, suspected of endangering State security, of terrorist activities or major bribery and in cases in which confinement in their own home may “impede the investigation”.²

Observation

45. The Working Group wishes to recall article 10 (1) and (2) of the Declaration, according to which any person deprived of liberty shall be held in an officially recognized place of detention and, in conformity with national law, be brought before a judicial authority promptly after detention. Accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, shall be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information.

Colombia**Information from sources**

46. Sources provided updated information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Information from the Government

47. On 29 May 2018, the Government transmitted information concerning two outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

48. The Working Group also considered information transmitted on 29 June 2018 by the Government of Spain, concerning one of those cases. The information provided was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Democratic People’s Republic of Korea**Standard procedure**

49. The Working Group transmitted 12 cases to the Government concerning:

- (a) Jong-mo An, allegedly abducted from his residence between July and August 1950 by members of the Korean People’s Army;
- (b) Dae-young Kim, allegedly abducted from Chungwon Primary School in Seoul in August 1950 by members of the Korean People’s Army;
- (c) Deok-yeong Lee, allegedly abducted near his residence in July 1950 by members of the Korean People’s Army;
- (d) Gi-seol Lee, allegedly abducted from his residence in August 1950 by officials of the Internal Affairs Department;
- (e) Jeong-geun Lee, allegedly abducted from his residence on 28 June 1950 by members of the Korean People’s Army;
- (f) Geun-yong Lee, allegedly abducted from his residence on 30 June 1950 by members of the Korean’s People’s Army;
- (g) Gyu-ho Lee, allegedly abducted on 20 August 1950 from a town near his residence in Geunnam-myeon, Uljin, Gyeongsangbuk-do, by officials of the Internal Affairs Department or the Political Security Bureau;

² <https://spcommreports.ohchr.org/TMResultsBase/DownloadPublicCommunicationFile?gId=23997>.

(h) Cheol Ho Seung, allegedly abducted on 26 June 2016 from his residence by security agents of the Ryanggang Province State Security Department;

(i) Man-gyo Lee, allegedly arrested on 25 September 1950 from a house located in Sinheung-dong, Incheon-si, by members of the Korean People's Army;

(j) Hae-mun Yu, allegedly abducted on 20 August 1950 from his residence by a member of the Korean People's Army;

(k) Si-cheol Choi allegedly abducted on 15 August 1950 from his residence by officials of the Internal Affairs Agency;

(l) Jeong Nam Hwang, allegedly abducted in February 1988 by agents of the Social Safety Agency.

50. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group also transmitted a copy of 10 of the case files to the Government of the Republic of Korea and a copy of 2 others to the Government of China.

Information from the Government

51. On 6 June 2018, the Government of the Democratic People's Republic of Korea transmitted information concerning 23 outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

Observation

52. The Working Group continues to be disappointed regarding the standard replies provided by the Government. It wishes to bring the Government's attention to Human Rights Council resolution 21/4, in which the Council urged States to cooperate with the Working Group to help it to carry out its mandate effectively.

Ecuador

Information from the Government

53. On 14 August 2018, the Government of Peru transmitted information concerning one outstanding case under the records of Ecuador. The information provided was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

54. On 29 May 2018, the Government of Colombia transmitted information concerning one outstanding case under the records of Ecuador. The information provided was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Egypt

Urgent action

55. The Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted 52 cases to the Government of Egypt (see annex II). In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted copies of the cases of the 18 individuals listed in (g) to (x) in annex II to the Government of the Russian Federation.

Standard procedure

56. The Working Group transmitted 10 cases to the Government of Egypt under its standard procedure, concerning:

(a) Osama Ibrahim Fathi Ali Mubarak, allegedly abducted from Mansoura II, Dakahlia Governorate, on 3 January 2018 by members of the National Security Agency;

(b) Ahmed Mohamed El-Sayed Mohamed El-Sawah, allegedly abducted from Nasr City, Cairo, on 13 February 2018 by members of the National Security Agency;

(c) Osama Mohamed El-Sayed Mohamed El-Sawah, allegedly abducted from Nasr City, Cairo, on 13 February 2018 by members of the National Security Agency;

(d) Ahmad Mohammad El-Said El-Said Ibrahim Mitwalli, allegedly abducted from Giza on 3 April 2018 by members of the National Security Agency;

(e) Ahmad Abdel Rahman Abdel Samee Mohammad Alesheiri, allegedly abducted from Giza on 3 April 2018 by members of the National Security Agency;

(f) Ahmed Subhi Hijazi Faraj Dawood, allegedly last seen in Awal Nasr City Police Station on 22 April 2018;

(g) Islam Raafat Abdel Mohsen Mohane, allegedly arrested in Alexandria on 9 April 2018 by members of the National Security Agency;

(h) Mohamed Jamal Mohamed Abdelmaguid, allegedly arrested at Al Azhar University on 20 December 2017 by members of the National Security Agency;

(i) Ahmed Adel Mohamed Mohamed Adawi, allegedly arrested at Al Ayyat Centre, Giza, on 24 April 2018 by police officers;

(j) Mohamed El Sayed El Araby Ahmed, allegedly abducted on his way to Cairo on 17 December 2017 by members of the National Security Agency.

Clarification based on information from sources

57. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify 22 cases, concerning Amr Mohammed Daa El Din Mousa Mohamed, Abdurrahman Ibrahim Abdulhamid Darwish, Khaled Mohamed Mahmoud al Sarif, Mohammed Aligadzhev, Sakinat Baysultanova, Saud Khapizova, Mesedo Baysultanova, Sumaya Suleymanova, Fatima Nurmagomedova, Nasib Sultanmagomedov, Maryam Magomednurova, Magomed Abdurakhmanov, Tharwat Khalil Khalil Farrag and 9 children. Reportedly, 3 individuals were in prison, 1 was released from detention and 18 were deported.

Information from sources

58. Sources provided information on three outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify the cases.

Application of the six-month rule

59. On 26 March 2018, 8 May 2018, 16 May 2018, 19 July 2018 and 25 July 2018, the Government of Egypt provided information on 47 outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to these cases.

Information from the Government

60. On 26 March 2018, 8 May 2018, 16 May 2018 and 10 August 2018, the Government provided information on 18 cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify the cases.

61. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of one of the case files to the Government of China.

Clarification

62. On the basis of information previously provided by the Government, the Working Group decided to clarify 28 cases, which were placed under the six-month rule at the 114th session or 115th session, concerning Abd al Rahman Nasr al Deen Amin, Nasr Helal Omar Mohamed Ahmed, Ali Said Khedr Abd al Motagaly, Abed Mohamed Ali Eltablawy, Yahiya Abd al Fattah Shaheen, Nabil Ibrahim al Desouky Mohamed Helmy, Yahya Mohamed Abu al Saoud Yahya Ali Ramadan, Abd al Latif El Dieb, Ibrahim Kamel Qandil, Abd al Fattah al Sayed Shaheen, Ahmed Masoud Salem, Mohamed Abd al Latif El Sayed Ibrahim Makawy, Ahmed Magdy Abd al Aalim Mohamed, Abd al Rahman Mohamed Mahmud Abd al Gawad, Ahmed Samir Mohamed al Sayed Hindy, Taher Abdulllah Abd al Ghany Abd al Ghany, Ahmed Ramadan Abdel Salem El Ansary, Ali Ragab Ahmed Mohamed Saleh, Belal Mamdouh al Azab, Mohamed Ali Mohamed Hamada, Shaker al Sharkawy Mahmoud al

Sayed Boundouq, Khalid Abdelazim Suleiman El Sayed Elnaggar, Gabar Ibrahim Saad Nada, Ahmed Hassan Abdel Azim Taleb, Ahmed Hammouda Mohamed Hammouda El Sakhawy, Mohamed al Hussieny Hassan Mohamed, Mohamed Abdulhafeez Ali Abdulhafeez al Ayari and Abdullah Mohammed Mudar Mousa and upon which the sources have since made observations (A/HRC/WGEID/114/1, para. 51, and A/HRC/WGEID/115/1, para. 40). Reportedly, 21 individuals were in detention and 7 had been released from detention.

Joint urgent appeal

63. On 9 May 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal concerning the alleged enforced disappearance of Galal el Behairy.

64. On 6 June 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, a joint urgent appeal concerning the alleged enforced disappearance of several individuals who have now been executed or sentenced to death or who face a possible death sentence.

Reply to a joint urgent appeal

65. On 22 May 2018, the Government of Egypt transmitted a reply to the joint urgent appeal sent on 12 January 2018 on the alleged enforced disappearance of several individuals now facing the death penalty.

Press release

66. On 26 July 2018, the Working Group issued a press release together with other special procedure mechanisms urging the Egyptian authorities to release Galal El Behairy, who was forcibly disappeared for a week after his arrest and who remains in detention for writing a song critical of government policies.³

Duplicates

67. The Working Group decided to consider six cases as duplicates. The duplicate cases were consequently deleted from the records of the Working Group.

Observation

68. The Working Group wishes to recall that the Declaration establishes that any person deprived of their liberty shall be held in an officially recognized place of detention. It noted that in two of the cases mention in paragraph 57 above, the individuals are being held in an unofficial place of detention, while the Government of Egypt indicated that they are being detained in a prison of the Eastern Security forces. The Working Group requested clarification on the name of the prison and its status.

69. The Working Group also emphasizes that, as provided for in article 13 of the Declaration, those involved in the investigation of enforced disappearance should be protected against ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal. It notes that it is still awaiting a response to its request for an update and the pending questions raised in relation to the case of Ebrahim Abdelmonem Metwally Hegazy (A/HRC/39/46, para. 96) and remains concerned that the measures against him may constitute acts of reprisal against him for cooperating with the Working Group.

70. While the Working Group thanks the Government of Egypt for the large number of replies that it has received, it reminds the Government that the clarification of many of the cases does not exonerate it from its obligations under the Declaration, including to take all measures necessary to prevent similar cases in the future. It is concerned that, notwithstanding repeated calls to address what appears to be a systemic problem relating to short-term enforced disappearances, the situation does not seem to have improved and

³ <https://www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23409&LangID=E>.

reiterates its calls for urgent action in this regard from the Government of Egypt (A/HRC/39/46, para. 95).

Gambia

71. The Working Group congratulates the Government of the Gambia for ratifying the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance, and calls for its effective implementation.

Guatemala

Information from the Government

72. On 16 May 2018, the Government of Guatemala transmitted information concerning one outstanding case. The information provided was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

India

Information from sources

73. Sources provided updated information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

Iraq

Standard procedure

74. The Working Group transmitted a case to the Government of Iraq under its standard procedure, concerning Ibrahim Al Shammari, allegedly last seen on television in February 2010 in a detention facility near the Square of the Eagles in Baghdad.

75. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group also transmitted a copy of this case to the Government of the United States of America.

Information from the Government

76. On the basis of the information provided by the Government of the United States on 19 June 2018, the Working Group decided to transfer the case concerning Al Izzi Mazen to the Government of Iraq.

Clarification based on information from sources

77. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Wissam Ibrahim Jasem. Reportedly, the individual is in prison.

Iran (Islamic Republic of)

Information from the Government of the United States of America

78. On 16 August 2018, the Government of the United States of America transmitted information concerning one outstanding case under the records of the Islamic Republic of Iran, which was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

Clarification

79. On the basis of information previously provided by the Government of the Islamic Republic of Iran, the Working Group decided to clarify four cases, which were placed under the six-month rule at the 114th session, concerning Hossein Panahi Zobeyr, Hossein Panahi Ahmed, Hossein Panahi Afshin and Hossein Panahi Ramin and upon which the sources have

since made observations (A/HRC/WGEID/114/1, para. 62). Reportedly, two individuals have been released on bail, one individual is in detention and the fourth has been executed.

Prompt intervention letter

80. On 16 May 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning the alleged continuous judicial harassment of Raheleh Rahemipor, as a reprisal against her legitimate exercise of the rights to freedom of expression and peaceful assembly, and against her efforts to seek the truth about the fate and whereabouts of her brother and his infant daughter.

Observation

81. The Working Group wishes to recall that the Declaration specifies that steps shall be taken to ensure that all involved in the investigation, including the complainant, counsel, witnesses and those conducting the investigation, are protected against ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal (art. 13 (3)) and that any ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal or any other form of interference on the occasion of the lodging of a complaint or during the investigation procedure is appropriately punished (art. 13 (5)).

82. In relation to the case of Hossein Panahi Ramin (see para. 79 above), the Working Group expresses its deepest regret at the information received on his execution on 8 September 2018.

Jordan

Urgent action

83. On 19 June 2018 and 9 August 2018, the Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted two cases to the Government of Jordan, which were also updated by the sources (see para. 85 below), concerning:

(a) Abdul Wahab al Jaghbir, allegedly arrested on 31 May 2018 by the General Intelligence Directorate at the Queen Alia International Airport in Amman;

(b) Yousef Awni Yousef Issa, allegedly abducted on 25 July 2018 from a house in Amman by members of the General Intelligence Directorate.

84. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of Abdul Wahab al Jaghbir's case file to the Government of Lebanon and a copy of Yousef Awni Yousef Issa's case file to the Government of the United States of America.

Clarification based on information by sources

85. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the aforementioned two cases. One individual was reportedly released and the second one is in detention in Juweideh Prison.

Kuwait

Urgent action

86. On 18 May 2018, the Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted one case to the Government of Kuwait, which was also updated by the Government and sources (see paras. 88 and 90 below), concerning Nawaf Talal bin Abdul Aziz al Rashid, allegedly arrested on 12 May 2018 at Kuwait International Airport departures terminal by plain-clothes security officials, while he was travelling back to Qatar.

87. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case file to the Governments of Qatar and Saudi Arabia.

Information from the Government

88. On 25 May 2018, the Government of Kuwait provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

89. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the information provided to the Governments of Qatar and Saudi Arabia.

Information from sources

90. Sources provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

Discontinuation

91. The Working Group decided, exceptionally and in accordance with paragraph 28 of its methods of work, to discontinue its consideration of one outstanding case concerning George Salsa. The case may, however, be reopened at any time.

92. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case file of to the Government of Jordan.

Lebanon**Information from the Government**

93. On 4 April 2018, the Government of Lebanon provided information in relation to the objectives of the draft bill addressing the issue of missing and forcibly disappeared persons.

Observation

94. The Working Group hopes that the Government of Lebanon will respond positively to the interest it expressed in visiting the country in the course of 2019.

Libya**Urgent action**

95. On 26 July 2018, the Working Group, under its urgent action procedure, transmitted one case to the Government of Libya concerning Ahmed Saleh al Shami, allegedly last seen on 11 July 2018 in the facilities under the control of the Department of General Investigations, located in Tariq El Seka, in front of the new buildings of the Presidential Council of the Government of National Accord in Tripoli.

Standard procedure

96. The Working Group transmitted four cases to the Government of Libya under its standard procedure, concerning:

(a) Hassan Yousif Hassan al-Bolifa, allegedly last seen in May 2016 in Gernada Prison, Eastern Libya;

(b) Abdul Nasser Ali Said al-Garoshe, allegedly last seen at the end of 2014 in a secret detention facility that is controlled by the Martyrs of al-Zawiya, an armed group allegedly affiliated with and funded by the Libyan National Army;

(c) Salem Gheryby, allegedly last seen on 3 April 2018 at Dakar airport, when he was about to take a flight to Tunis, where he would have made a stopover before landing in Misrata, Libya, in the context of his repatriation to that country by the Senegalese authorities. He reportedly contacted the source for the last time when he arrived in Tunis on 4 April early in the morning;

(d) Awad Khalifa, allegedly abducted on 3 April 2018 from his apartment in Dakar by the Senegalese authorities as part of his repatriation to Libya. Libyan Airways allegedly

confirmed that Mr. Khalifa had last been seen at Tunis airport boarding a plane bound for Tripoli.

97. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case files of Salem Ghereby and Awad Khalifa to the Governments of Tunisia, Senegal and the United States of America.

Information from sources

98. Sources provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify the case (see para. 95 above).

Clarification based on information from sources

99. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Gabir Mokhtar Zain Elabdeen Mahmoud. The individual is currently in detention.

100. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case file to the Government of Sudan.

Prompt intervention letter

101. On 28 August 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, a prompt intervention letter concerning allegations of arbitrary arrests and enforced disappearance of Mahmoud al Shami in direct retaliation for his legitimate exercise of the right to seek the truth about the fate and whereabouts of his father (see paras. 95 and 98 above) and reprisals for his cooperation with United Nations human rights mechanisms.

General allegation

102. The Working Group received information from credible sources alleging obstacles to the implementation of the Declaration in Libya. A general allegation was transmitted to the Government of Libya on 8 October 2018 (see annex I), focusing primarily on the reportedly mass enforced disappearance in Abu Salim Prison between 28 and 29 June 1996 in the aftermath of a mutiny that took place on 28 June 1996.

Observation

103. The Working Group wishes to recall article 10 (1) and (2) of the Declaration, according to which any person deprived of liberty shall be held in an officially recognized place of detention and, in conformity with national law, be brought before a judicial authority promptly after detention. Accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, shall be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information unless a wish to the contrary has been manifested by the persons concerned.

Malaysia

Information from sources

104. Sources provided information on two outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

Maldives

Information from sources

105. Sources provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Information from the Government

106. On 30 May 2018, the Government of Maldives provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Mauritania**Standard procedure**

107. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of Mauritania under its standard procedure, concerning Amadou Mamadou Sow, last seen on 22 November 1990 at his home at the Nouadhibou marine base, after being called on mission by members of the Mauritanian navy.

Information from sources

108. Sources provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Mexico**Clarification based on information from sources**

109. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify two cases, concerning Marco Antonio Flores Rosas and Jorge Valente Ibarra Moreno, who are reportedly deceased.

Information from sources

110. Sources provided information on 30 outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them. One of these cases was considered a duplicate (see para. 113 below).

Information from the Government

111. On 30 May 2018, the Government of Mexico provided information on two outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them. Exceptionally, and in accordance with paragraph 28 of its methods of work, the Working Group decided to discontinue its consideration of one of the two cases (see para. 111 above).

Discontinuation

112. The Working Group decided, exceptionally and in accordance with paragraph 28 of its methods of work, to discontinue its consideration of 13 outstanding cases concerning Giovany Urbina Aguilera, Jorge Antonio Salinas Cherety, Sonia Hinojosa Barrera, Homero Segura Hinojosa, Larissa Hasel Segura Hinojosa, Daniela Sarahi Segura Hinojosa, Ela Segura Hinojosa, Jorge Luis López Cantú, Carlos Enrique Ruiz Núñez, Roberto Ivan Hernández García, Yudith Yesenia Rueda García, Diego Armando Flores Acevedo and Alberto Vázquez Rodríguez. The cases may, however, be reopened at any time.

Duplicate

113. The Working Group decided to consider two cases as duplicates. The duplicate case was consequently deleted from the records of the Working Group.

Morocco**Information from sources**

114. Sources provided information on 16 outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

Suspension of the six-month rule

115. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to suspend the six-month period that was applied to the case of El Ouassouli Omar. The case will therefore remain under review by the Working Group.

Information from the Government

116. On 30 March 2018, the Government transmitted information concerning 148 outstanding cases, 31 of which had already been considered by the Working Group during its 114th session. The Working Group continued to review the cases at its 115th and 116th sessions. At its 116th session, the Working Group considered the information provided concerning 67 of the case files as insufficient to clarify them.

Application of the six-month rule

117. On 30 March 2018, the Government also provided information on four outstanding cases concerning Lehib Ballal Ahmed Keihel Ballal, Oufkir Ali Ben Dehan, Ali Abalehccen Salama and Abdellah Mansour Mohamed. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to those cases.

Discontinuation

118. The Working Group decided, exceptionally and in accordance with paragraph 28 of its methods of work, to discontinue its consideration of 12 outstanding cases. The cases may, however, be reopened at any time.

Mozambique

Information from the Government

119. On 14 September 2018, the Government of Portugal transmitted information concerning one outstanding case under the records of Mozambique. The information provided was considered insufficient to clarify the case. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case file to the Government of Mozambique.

Myanmar

Standard procedure

120. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of Myanmar under its standard procedure, concerning Gam Laphai, allegedly arrested on 4 December 2018 by the army near Pau Yar Basic Education School, located between Pang Seng and Mong Ko.

Joint urgent appeal

121. On 11 July 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal regarding the alleged arbitrary arrest, and deliberate and targeted extrajudicial killings, of two internally displaced persons, Hpaugan Yaw and Nhkum Naw San (also known as Dauje Naw San Maing Hkawng), in Mansi township, Kachin State.

Nepal

Duplicate

122. The Working Group decided to consider two cases as duplicates. The duplicate case was consequently deleted from the records of the Working Group.

Nicaragua

Joint urgent appeal

123. On 6 June 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal to Nicaragua regarding the alleged excessive use of force by the State security forces, including anti-riot police and pro-government armed groups, against protesters and students, as well as alleged cases of massive and arbitrary detentions, torture, cruel, inhuman and degrading treatment and enforced disappearances.

Press release

124. On 9 August 2018, the Working Group issued a press release together with other special procedure mechanisms urging the Government of Nicaragua to stop the repression following 100 days of unrest in which at least 317 people were killed and 1,830 injured. The experts also exhorted the Government of Nicaragua to immediately demobilize paramilitary groups and to investigate the extrajudicial executions, killings and reports of enforced disappearances with due diligence, without delay and through the use of effective, impartial and independent procedures.⁴

Nigeria

Standard procedure

125. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of Nigeria, concerning Abiri Jones, allegedly abducted from the offices of the *Weekly Source* newspaper in Bayelsa on 21 July 2016 by members of the State Security Services.

126. The Working Group also transmitted six cases to the Government of Nigeria, concerning Levi Ike, Ezinwanne Chukwudolue, Onyekachi Chukwudolue, Celestine Chukwuka Iteshi, Ugoeze Nnenna Sally Kanu and Israel Okwu Kanu, allegedly abducted from a house in Abia State on 14 September 2017 by members of the Nigerian Armed Forces.

Information from Governments

127. On 14 August 2018, the Government of the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland provided information on one outstanding case under the records of Nigeria.

Oman

Standard procedure

128. The Working Group transmitted one case to the Government of Oman under its standard procedure, concerning Ghulam Qadir, allegedly last seen on 29 January 2013 leaving the Said bin Sultan Naval Base of the Royal Navy of Oman in Muscat.

129. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the case to the Government of Pakistan.

Pakistan

Urgent action

130. During the period under review, the Working Group transmitted two cases under its urgent action procedure to the Government of Pakistan concerning Sadam Hussain and Hanif Muhammad, allegedly abducted from a house in Malir, Karachi, Sindh, on 23 April 2018 by agents of Inter-Services Intelligence and the Sindh Rangers.

⁴ www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23434&LangID=E.

Standard procedure

131. The Working Group transmitted 49 cases under its standard procedure to the Government of Pakistan (see annex III).

Clarification based on information from sources

132. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify five cases concerning Ali Afzal Bughti, Sarfaraz Sheikh, Sagheer Ahmed, Raza Mehmood Khan and Asin Amin.

133. Sarfaraz Sheikh is reportedly in detention. Ali Afzal Bughti, Sagheer Ahmed, Raza Mehmood Khan and Asin Amin have reportedly been released.

Information provided by sources

134. Sources provided updated information on 61 outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

Clarification

135. On the basis of information previously provided by the Government, the Working Group decided to clarify 59 cases following the expiry of the period prescribed by the six-month rule (A/HRC/WGEID/114/1, para. 109).

Joint urgent appeal

136. On 16 July 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal concerning the allegations of intimidation of journalists and media outlets ahead of the elections in Pakistan.

Observation

137. The Working Group wished to recall article 13 (1) of the Declaration, according to which each State shall ensure that any person having knowledge or a legitimate interest who alleges that a person has been subjected to enforced disappearance has the right to complain to a competent and independent State authority and to have that complaint promptly, thoroughly and impartially investigated by that authority. Whenever there are reasonable grounds to believe that an enforced disappearance has been committed, the State shall promptly refer the matter to that authority for such an investigation, even if there has been no formal complaint. No measure shall be taken to curtail or impede the investigation.

Peru

Information from the Government

138. On 14 August 2018, the Government of Peru provided information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Duplicate

139. The Working Group decided to consider three duplicate cases. The duplicate cases were consequently deleted from the records of the Working Group.

Russian Federation

Clarification based on information from sources

140. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify the case of Olexandr Steshenko. The individual is currently in detention.

Information provided by sources

141. Sources provided updated information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Information from the Government

142. On 15 August 2018, the Government of Ukraine provided information on one outstanding case under the records of the Russian Federation, which was also updated by sources (see para. 141 above). On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to clarify the case.

Saudi Arabia**Urgent action**

143. On 25 June 2018, 24 July 2018, 13 August 2018 and 11 September 2018, the Working Group transmitted eight cases under its urgent action procedure to the Government of Saudi Arabia concerning:

(a) Mohammed Saleh al-Bajadi, allegedly arrested at his home on 24 May 2018, in Buraydah, Al Qassim, by State Security Intelligence officers wearing both civilian and military clothes and taken to an unknown location;

(b) Safar bin Abdulrahman al Hawali, allegedly arrested at his home on 12 July 2018, in Al Hawala, 70 km south-east of Al Bahah, by State Security Forces personnel in military uniform and taken to an unknown location;

(c) Samar Mohammed Badawi, allegedly arrested at her house in Jeddah on 30 July 2018 by members of the Mabahith State security forces and taken to an unknown location;

(d) Amal al Harbi, allegedly arrested in front of her children at the Corniche in Jeddah on 30 July 2018 by members of the Mabahith State security forces dressed in civilian clothes and driving civilian vehicles;

(e) Al Ayyaf Yasser Abdullah, allegedly abducted in the street on 29 July 2018, in Al Qassim Province, north-west of Riyadh, by members of the Mabahith State security forces in a military vehicle;

(f) Nassima al Sadah, allegedly arrested at her house on 30 July 2018, in Safwa City in the Eastern Province of Saudi Arabia, by members of the Mabahith State security forces;

(g) Abdulmajeed al Zahrani and Ahmad bin Abdulaziz bin Mohammad al Zahrani, both allegedly arrested at their house on 7 August 2018, in Al Rawdah district, Jeddah, by officers of the State security services dressed in civilian clothes.

Information provided by sources

144. Sources provided updated information on one case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Information from the Government

145. On 9 July 2018, the Government provided information on the cases of Aida and Adil Alghamdi and on 17 and 18 September 2018 concerning Mohammed Saleh al-Bajadi and Safar bin Abdulrahman al Hawali (see para. 143 above). The Working Group will consider the information as soon as it has received the translations thereof.

Joint urgent appeal

146. On 14 June 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal concerning the alleged arrest and charges against a number of

women's human rights defenders along with the alleged enforced disappearance of Mohammed Saleh al-Bajadi and acts of reprisals against Loujain al-Hathloul.

147. On 26 July 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal concerning the alleged incommunicado detention of the human rights defender Kalid al Omair.

Press release

148. On 27 June 2018, the Working Group issued a press release together with other special procedure mechanisms calling on Saudi Arabia to immediately free the women human rights defenders held in a crackdown.⁵

Observation

149. The Working Group is concerned about the worrying trend of arbitrary arrests and enforced disappearances of human rights defenders over the past months in Saudi Arabia. The Working Group stresses that, as provided for in article 7 of the Declaration, no circumstances whatsoever may be invoked to justify enforced disappearances and that, according to article 10 (2), accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, should be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information.

Spain

Press release

150. On 25 July 2018, the Working Group issued a press release together with other special procedure mechanisms commending the Government of Spain for its proposal to create a truth commission and for its commitment to drawing up plans to search for those who disappeared during the civil war and Franco's dictatorship. It also expressed the hope that the initiative would be accompanied by progress in the judicial sphere, including regarding any criminal procedure carried out in any country for the enforced disappearances committed in Spain.⁶

Sri Lanka

Standard procedure

151. The Working Group transmitted 21 cases to the Government of Sri Lanka (see annex III).

Information provided by sources

152. Sources provided updated information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Joint urgent appeal

153. On 2 August 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an urgent appeal concerning allegations of harassment of Sandya Ekneligoda as a reprisal against her in seeking the truth about the fate and whereabouts of her husband.

Observation

154. The Working Group wishes to recall that the Declaration establishes that steps shall be taken to ensure that all involved in the investigation, including the complainant, counsel,

⁵ www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23270&LangID=E.

⁶ www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23402&LangID=E.

witnesses and those conducting the investigation, are protected against ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal (art. 13 (3)) and also to ensure that any ill-treatment, intimidation or reprisal or any other form of interference on the occasion of the lodging of a complaint or during the investigation procedure is appropriately punished (art. 13 (5)).

Syrian Arab Republic

Standard procedure

155. The Working Group transmitted 28 cases to the Government of the Syrian Arab Republic (see annex III).

156. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group sent a copy of one of the case files to the State of Palestine.

Application of the six-month rule

157. On 25 July 2018, the Government of Switzerland provided information on one outstanding case under the records of the Syrian Arab Republic, concerning Saït Cosar also known as Saeed Malki. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to the case.

Observation

158. The Working Group wishes to recall article 10 (1) and (2) of the Declaration according to which any person deprived of liberty shall be held in an officially recognized place of detention and, in conformity with national law, be brought before a judicial authority promptly after detention. Accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, shall be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information unless a wish to the contrary has been manifested by the persons concerned.

159. Similarly, the Working Group wishes to recall article 13 (1) and (6) according to which each State shall ensure that any person having knowledge or a legitimate interest who alleges that a person has been subjected to enforced disappearance has the right to complain to a competent and independent State authority and to have that complaint promptly, thoroughly and impartially investigated by that authority. Whenever there are reasonable grounds to believe that an enforced disappearance has been committed, the State shall promptly refer the matter to that authority for such an investigation, even if there has been no formal complaint. No measure shall be taken to curtail or impede the investigation. An investigation, in accordance with the procedures described above, should be able to be conducted for as long as the fate of the victim of enforced disappearance remains unclarified.

Thailand

Application of the six-month rule

160. On 9 August 2018, the Government of Thailand provided information on one outstanding case concerning Tangtai Kaminketkij. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to the case.

Discontinuation

161. The Working Group decided, exceptionally and in accordance with paragraph 28 of its methods of work, to discontinue its consideration of four outstanding cases concerning Sotheak Bun, Phon Ty, Panhareach Ty and Seang Ty. The cases may, however, be reopened at any time.

162. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the cases to the Government of Cambodia.

Observation

163. The Working Group appreciates the efforts made by the Government of Thailand to engage with it and hopes that the Government will consider accepting its request to conduct a visit to the country in the course of 2019. The Working Group draws the Government's attention to its methods of work, which clearly establish that cases can be discontinued only if families have freely expressed the wish not to pursue them and in full respect for their rights to truth, justice and reparation.

Turkey**Application of the six-month rule**

164. On 8 August 2018, the Government of Turkey provided information on five outstanding cases. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to the cases.

Information from the Government

165. On 8 August 2018, the Government of Turkey transmitted information on 59 outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

Duplicate

166. The Working Group decided to consider two duplicate cases. The duplicate case was consequently deleted from the records of the Working Group.

Joint allegation letter

167. On 18 May 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an allegation letter concerning the alleged arbitrary arrest and detention in Kosovo⁷ and illegal deportation to Turkey, as well as short-term enforced disappearance, of six Turkish nationals working for educational institutions allegedly linked to the Hizmet/Gülen movement.

Observation

168. The Working Group wishes to recall the observations made in its country visit report on Turkey (A/HRC/33/51/Add.1, paras. 19–20) regarding cases in which a decision of non-prosecution was issued due to a statute of limitation. It is stated in the Declaration that, when the remedies provided for in article 2 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights are no longer effective, the statute of limitations relating to acts of enforced disappearance shall be suspended until these remedies are re-established (art. 17 (2) of the Declaration). Where they exist, statutes of limitations shall be substantial and commensurate with the extreme seriousness of the offence (art. 17 (3)) and shall be counted only starting from the moment at which light is shed on the fate or the whereabouts of the person. In any case, the termination of the criminal investigation regarding an alleged enforced disappearance does not release the State from its obligation to search and locate the disappeared person, or his or her remains.

Turkmenistan**Standard procedure**

169. The Working Group transmitted a case to the Government of Turkmenistan, under its standard procedure, concerning Serdar Rakhimov, allegedly last seen in December 2002 when he was reportedly taken from the detention centre of the Ministry of National Security in Ashgabat to the Prosecutor General's Office for interrogation.

⁷ The reference to Kosovo shall be understood to be in the context of Security Council resolution 1244 (1999).

Information provided by sources

170. Sources provided updated information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

Information from the Government

171. On 29 March 2018, the Government of Turkmenistan transmitted information on one outstanding case, which was considered insufficient to clarify it.

General allegation

172. The Working Group received information from credible sources alleging obstacles to the implementation of the Declaration in Turkmenistan. A general allegation was transmitted to the Government of Turkmenistan on 5 October 2018 (see annex I), focusing primarily on the alleged high number of enforced disappearances in the prison system of Turkmenistan.

Ukraine

173. The Working Group would like to thank the Government of Ukraine for the support provided prior and during its visit to Ukraine, which took place from 11 to 20 June 2018.

Standard procedure

174. The Working Group transmitted two cases to the Government of Ukraine, under its standard procedure, concerning:

(a) Viktor Mykolaiovych Zotov, allegedly abducted on 12 June 2015 on the road between Pavlovka and Vuhledar by armed men of a volunteer battalion active in the Vuhledar area, presumably Shakhtiorsk, Donbass or Aidar battalions, reportedly supporting the State and operating with its acquiescence;

(b) Sergii Dolgov, allegedly abducted from his workplace on 18 June 2014 by plain-clothes officers of the Security Service of Ukraine and armed men from volunteer battalions.

Information provided by sources

175. Sources provided updated information on two outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

Application of the six-month rule

176. On 15 August 2018, the Government of Ukraine provided information on one outstanding case. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to the case.

Information from the Government

177. On 15 August 2018, the Government of Ukraine transmitted information on five outstanding cases, which was considered insufficient to clarify them.

United Arab Emirates**Information from Governments**

178. On 8 August 2018, the Government of Turkey transmitted information concerning the case of Huseyin Imintohti, under the records of the United Arab Emirates, which was considered insufficient to clarify the case.

179. In accordance with its methods of work, the Working Group transmitted a copy of the updated case files to the Governments of Turkey and China.

Joint allegation letter

180. On 4 May 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an allegation letter concerning the continued arbitrary detention of human rights defenders Osama al-Najjar and Ahmed Mansoor, along with the charges against Mr. Mansoor.

Reply to a joint urgent appeal

181. On 4 July 2018, the Government of the United Arab Emirates transmitted a reply to the joint communication (AL ARE 1/2018) sent on 4 May 2018 (see para. 180 above), in which it explained that Mr. Al-Najjar had been legally convicted in criminal case No. 53 of 2013 on a charge of membership of a terrorist organization by court judgment No. 79/2012 and had served his sentence. He is currently undergoing a treatment programme at a counselling (Munasaha) centre. In its reply, the Government added that Mr. Mansoor had refused to exercise his right to freely choose and appoint a lawyer to defend him, but the competent court, in accordance with national legislation, had appointed a lawyer at the expense of the Ministry of Justice to represent him at all stages of the legal proceedings.

Press release

182. On 12 June 2018, the Working Group issued a press release together with other special procedure mechanisms calling for the immediate release of Mr. Mansoor.⁸

Observation

183. The Working Group wishes to recall article 10 (1) and (2) of the Declaration, according to which any person deprived of liberty shall be held in an officially recognized place of detention and, in conformity with national law, be brought before a judicial authority promptly after detention. Accurate information on the detention of such persons and their place or places of detention, including transfers, shall be made promptly available to their family members, their counsel or to any other persons having a legitimate interest in the information unless a wish to the contrary has been manifested by the persons concerned.

United States of America

Joint allegation letter

184. On 25 May 2018, the Working Group transmitted, jointly with other special procedure mechanisms, an allegation letter concerning the alleged arrest of Scott Warren and the charges against him, including harbouring and conspiracy to transport illegal immigrants. Mr. Warren is a volunteer with No More Deaths, a humanitarian organization based in southern Arizona, the mission of which is to end the unlawful deaths and suffering of migrants, refugees and asylum seekers in the Mexico-United States borderlands.

Information from the Government

185. On the basis of the information provided by the Government of the United States on 19 June 2018, the Working Group decided to transfer one case to the Government of Iraq.

Uzbekistan

Information from the Government

186. On 22 August 2018, the Government transmitted information on seven outstanding cases, which were considered insufficient to clarify them.

⁸ www.ohchr.org/EN/NewsEvents/Pages/DisplayNews.aspx?NewsID=23195&LangID=E.

Venezuela (Bolivarian Republic of)

Urgent action

187. The Working Group transmitted under its urgent action procedure to the Government of the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela the following:

188. On 28 June 2018, the case of Luis Humberto De La Sotta Quiroga, allegedly arrested on 18 May 2018 by agents of the General Directorate of Military Counter-Intelligence at his place of work located in Aragua State.

189. On 28 June 2018, the cases of Jorman Alexander Ortiz Herrera and Hebert Emmanuel Ramírez Arcia, allegedly abducted on 23 May 2018 by agents of the Bolivarian National Intelligence Service in Plaza Venezuela, Caracas.

190. On 29 June 2018, the case of Pedro Patricio Jaimes Criollo, allegedly arrested on 10 May 2018 by agents of the Bolivarian National Intelligence Service at his home in Los Teques, Miranda State.

191. On 13 July 2018, the case of Valerio Antonio Manzano Ochoa, allegedly abducted on 6 July 2018 by a group of unidentified armed men, alleged State agents, from his home in Maru Baruta.

Clarification based on information from sources

192. On the basis of the information provided by sources, the Working Group decided to clarify one case, concerning Mr. Jaimes Criollo. Reportedly, the individual is in detention.

Application of the six-month rule

193. On 14 August 2018, the Government of the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela provided information on one outstanding case. On the basis of the information provided, the Working Group decided to apply the six-month rule to the case.

Yemen

Standard procedure

194. The Working Group transmitted a case to the Government of Yemen under its standard procedure, concerning Abdulla Yahya Abdullah Ahmed, allegedly abducted on 23 December 2016 in Al-Adwya Street, Al-Kahera neighbourhood, Aden, by paramilitary forces under the control of the Ministry of the Interior.

Annex I

General allegations

Bahrain

1. The Working Group received information from the source concerning alleged violations and obstacles encountered in the implementation of the Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance in the Kingdom of Bahrain.
2. According to the source, over the course of the last eight years, authorities of the Kingdom of Bahrain have been systematically arresting and forcibly disappearing its citizens, and frequently torturing them into signing confessions of committing crimes without the presence of a legal counsel. These confessions would have then been used against them during their trials. The individuals have been charged with and sentenced for crimes ranging from illegal assembly to terrorism. Enforced disappearances and related abuses have been occurring more frequently in counter-terrorism cases than in cases based on less serious charges. This pattern of mostly short-term enforced disappearances and related violations of human rights is ongoing.
3. The source submits that there have been 145 documented enforced disappearances in the Kingdom of Bahrain between March 2010 and July 2018. In 89 of these cases, the individuals reported torture or other ill-treatment while forcibly disappeared; in one case, the disappeared individual was executed, in January 2017. Ages of victims range from 15 years to 48 years at the time of the disappearance. Of the 145 documented enforced disappearances, 130 of the individuals are male and 15 are female.
4. The disappearances, according to the source, range from lasting between a few days to over 300 days. The length of the disappearance is typically proportionate to the length of the investigation. The type of charge may also influence the length of the disappearance and the intensity of the torture. Individuals suspected of more severe crimes are often disappeared for a longer period and the torture to which they are subjected to is often greater. The reported torture methods include electric shock, sexual assault, and threats of physical torture. The source asserts that the torture takes place mostly at the premises of the Criminal Investigations Directorate (CID) but disappeared persons have also been tortured at the police stations and in one documented case at a medical facility. Enforced disappearances and concomitant ill-treatment typically end when the victims confess to the Office of Public Prosecution.
5. The source also underlines that enforced disappearances last longer in cases handled within the military jurisdiction. In this connection, the source reports that enforced disappearances of three persons tried by the Bahraini High Military Court on 25 December 2017 have been ranging from 331 to 575 days, with an average of 448 days. According to the source, upon repeated request for information about the whereabouts of their loved ones, Bahraini authorities informed that because the case was within the military jurisdiction, the defendants' status was subject to special restrictions.
6. Finally, the source asserts that national institutions mandated to safeguard human rights in the country are in fact covering these practices as they expressly refuse to accept complaints indicating the absence of contact with the arrested person whereas the facts of the cases point towards enforced disappearances.

Libya

7. The Working Group received information from sources concerning reported violations of the Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance in Libya.
8. According to the sources, 1,161 detainees of the Abu Salim Prison had been victims of a mass enforced disappearance between 28 and 29 June 1996 in the aftermath of a mutiny

which took place on 28 June 1996. Since then, there has been no official public account of the crime, no definitive official list of the missing detainees, and no trial for those accused of involvement in committing the crime.

9. It was reported that during the years of 2007 and 2008, several families of the missing detainees undertook legal proceedings to know their whereabouts. On 8 June 2008, the Benghazi North District Court ordered the State to reveal the fate of the disappeared detainees.

10. The sources also reported that on 1 October 2011, the District Attorney Office (DA) of Abu Salim district started an investigation into the case. The accused were held at the Hadhba Prison.

11. According to the sources, on 26 June 2013, the General National Congress (GNC) issued a Decree setting up a special commission to identify those who were disappeared and proposed measures of reparations, directing the General Attorney (GA) to take the legal measures to investigate the case, identify the perpetrators and bring them to justice.

12. On 18 December 2013, the GNC issued law No. 31, which defined the massacre as a crime against humanity, required the State to investigate, define provisions for reparations and establish a fact-finding commission to investigate the massacre. Yet, no investigation or fact-finding commissions have been established.

13. It was reported that on 12 March 2017, the Office of the GA of Libya completed the investigation started by the DA and prepared the indictment of 172 individuals in the case.

14. On 26 May 2017, the “Tripoli Revolutionaries Battalion” militia attacked the Hadhba Prison, and reportedly moved the detainees to an undisclosed location. Among the detainees taken, were those accused of the Abu Salim Prison massacre who were awaiting trial.

15. On 29 May 2017, the GNA reportedly celebrated openly the operation, which it said had been carried out by “forces belonging to the government’s security institutions”. According to the sources, the “Tripoli Revolutionaries Battalion” militia works under the Government of National Accord (GNA).

Turkmenistan

16. The Working Group received information from the source concerning reported obstacles encountered in the implementation of the Declaration on the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance in Turkmenistan.

17. The source asserts that over the last 16 years, enforced disappearances into the prison system of Turkmenistan have been a systematic practice, and the number of verified cases of enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan’s prisons as of September 2018 stands at 121. However, the list of victims of enforced disappearances known to the source is incomplete. According to the source’s estimates, the total number of victims of enforced disappearances in Turkmenistan is in the order of hundreds, and some prisoners have been forcibly disappeared since 2002.

18. The source states that recently Turkmen authorities for the first time have allowed some individuals convicted in 2017 and forcibly disappeared in the prison system to see their families. Turkmen authorities have recently softened their position concerning the prohibition of handing over the bodies of deceased incommunicado prisoners to their families. Finally, they have been providing information to international organizations about some of the disappeared persons. However, the practice of this grave violation of human rights persists.

19. The source submits that many individuals were arrested in November and December 2002, tried in court in January 2003, and forcibly disappeared in the prison system in connection with the alleged coup attempt which took place on 25 November 2002. In addition, several arrests and trials as part of this case took place in the summer of 2003 and in 2005. So-called Novemberists were given sentences of between 12 and 25 years, and six were sentenced to life imprisonment, although life imprisonment is not a legal punishment in

Turkmenistan's law. Allegedly, families of sentenced individuals have not heard from them since their trials.

20. Until 2016, when the bodies of two deceased were handed over to their families for the first time, the bodies of Novemberists who died in prison were not handed over to the families for burial, nor were the families informed of the deaths. The source reports that at least nine Novemberists are presumed to have died in prison.

21. The source alleges that the government refuses to provide any official information concerning the fate of all other Novemberists, including those whose prison terms ended in 2017.

22. The source further alleges that it is aware of 30 individuals who were accused of Islamic extremism, given sentences of mostly between 8 and 25 years, and forcibly disappeared in the prison system of Turkmenistan. In several cases, those given sentences of 2 and a half to 3 years of imprisonment on suspicion of extremism, were later re-sentenced to longer terms while in prison. Four of the prisoners belonging to this category, according to the source, died in prison.

23. Twenty-six individuals, the source asserts, were sentenced for economic crimes and abuse of power and forcibly disappeared in the prison system, as well. Thirteen of the disappeared in this category, according to the source, have died in prison.

24. Finally, the source maintains that among those forcibly disappeared are three civil society activists, including Ms. Ogulsapar Muradova who died in prison in 2006. On 6 April 2018, the United Nations Human Rights Committee found the Turkmen Government in violation of Ms. Muradova's rights, including the rights to life, to freedom from torture, to personal integrity, to a fair trial and to freedom of expression and called upon the government to conduct an impartial investigation into Ms. Muradova's case and provide full redress to her family members.

Annex II

Urgent actions

Egypt

1. The Working Group, following its urgent action procedure, transmitted 52 cases to the Government concerning:

(a) Assem Nady Abdo Hussein, allegedly abducted from Beni Suef Univeristy, Beni Suef Governorate on 2 January 2018, by members of the National Security Agency;

(b) Mohamed Ramadan Mohamed Hussein, allegedly arrested from a police checkpoint in Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 22 April 2018, by members of the security forces;

(c) Abdelfattah Abdelwahab Abdelfattah Farag, allegedly arrested from Meit Gaber Village, Egypt on 28 April 2018, by members of the security forces;

(d) Bilal Wagdi Abdellatif Ibrahim Jaafer, allegedly arrested in Adrashin city, Giza Governorate, Egypt on 6 April 2018, by members of the State Security Forces;

(e) Wagdi Abdellatif Ibrahim Jaafer, allegedly arrested in Badrashin city, Giza Governorate, Egypt on 6 April 2018, by members of the State Security Forces;

(f) Reda El Sayed El Sayed El Bedewi, allegedly arrested in Obour City, Qaliubia Governorate, Egypt on 11 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(g) A child, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(h) Mohammed Aligadzheiv allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(i) A child, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(j) Sakinat Baysultanova, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(k) A child, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(l) Saud Khapizova, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(m) A child, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(n) Mesedo Baysultanova, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(o) A child, allegedly arrested from Al Rehab City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(p) A child, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(q) A child, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(r) Sumaya Suleymanova, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(s) Fatima Nurmagomedova, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

- (t) Nasib Sultanmagomedov, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (u) Maryam Magomednurova, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (v) A child, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (w) A child, allegedly arrested from Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (x) Magomed Abdurakhmanov, allegedly abducted from Al Nasr City, Cairo Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (y) Mohamed Abdurrahman Hassan Abu Amer, allegedly arrested from a shipping company in the Ataba area, Cairo, Egypt on 6 February 2018;
- (z) Saif El Din Mostafa Mohamed Hassan, last seen on 21 April 2018 in Zagazig Police Station;
- (aa) Ali Abdelkader Ali Abdelkader, allegedly arrested from Khanka center, Qaliubia Governorate, Egypt on 11 February 2018, by members of the National Security Agency;
- (bb) Toufiq Gharib Ali Gharib, allegedly arrested from Hassania Center, Faqous, Sharqia Governorate, Egypt on 24 March 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (cc) Kamal Hassan Mehdi Hassan, allegedly arrested from Al Abour City, Al Hay Al Thani, Cairo, Egypt on 24 May 2018, by members of the State Security Forces;
- (dd) Manal Yamani Ala Yamani, allegedly arrested from Al Abour City, Al Hay Al Thani, Cairo, Egypt on 24 May 2018, by members of the State Security Forces;
- (ee) Ahmed Gamal Atia Mohammed, allegedly arrested from Imbaba, Giza Governorate, Egypt on 20 February 2018, by members of the State Police;
- (ff) Anas Mohamed Mohamed Ibral El-Beltagy, last seen on 12 April 2018 at Nasser City Police Station, Egypt;
- (gg) Mustafa Jafar Ali Hamad, allegedly arrested from Al-Haram Street, Giza Governorate, Egypt on 19 May 2018, by members of the Police Force;
- (hh) Amal Abdelfattah Abdu Ismail, allegedly arrested from Damietta I town, Damietta Governorate, Egypt on 3 May 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;
- (ii) Mohamed Tharwat Khalil Khalil Farrag, allegedly arrested from Al Hamoul Center, Kafr El Shei, Egypt on 22 May 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;
- (jj) Ashraf El Shahat Mohamed El Sayed, allegedly abducted from a street in 10th of Ramadan city, Sharkia Governorate, Egypt on 11 May 2018, by members of the State Police;
- (kk) Khadija Zuhair Alawi, allegedly arrested from above Abou Rady Area, Al-Mahalla Al-Kubra City, Gharbiya Governorate, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;
- (ll) Mohamed Ahmed Mahmoud Tayara, allegedly arrested from Abou Rady Area, Al-Mahalla Al-Kubra City, Gharbiya Governorate, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;
- (mm) Mahmoud Ahmed Mahmoud Tayara, allegedly arrested from Abou Rady Area, Al-Mahalla Al-Kubra City, Gharbiya Governorate, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;
- (nn) Mohamed Raslan Abou Hamed, allegedly arrested from Abou Rady Area, Al-Mahalla Al-Kubra City, Gharbiya Governorate, Egypt on 24 April 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;

(oo) El-Sayed Mohamed El Sayed Ibrahim, allegedly arrested from in front of the Abu Hammad Court, Sharkia Governorate, Egypt on 20 May 2018, by members of the security forces;

(pp) Mohamed El Bakry Mohamed Abdelwahab, allegedly arrested from Awlad Sakr Court, Sharkia Governorate, Egypt, on 28 June 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(qq) Abdullah Amer Shehata Fattouh, allegedly arrested from Residential City, Shubra al-Khaimah Center, Qalyubia Governorate, Egypt on 11 June 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;

(rr) Mohamed Said Fahmy Mohamed, allegedly arrested from Mayit Eaqaba Center, Agouza, Giza Governorate, Egypt on 1 June 2018, by members of the National Security Forces and the State Police;

(ss) Saad Mohamed Saad Abdelfattah Ali, allegedly abducted from Khanka Center, Qaliubia Governorate, Egypt on 30 June 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(tt) Moataz Ali Elsaed Mohamed, last seen in Waily Police Station, Cairo, Egypt on 22 May 2018;

(uu) Mohamed Mahmoud Abdelmoteleb Abouelnass, allegedly arrested from 8th District, Nasr City, Cairo, Egypt on 9 June 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(vv) Mohammed Mahmoud Mohammed Mohammed Atta, allegedly arrested from Cairo International Airport, Cairo, Egypt on 17 August 2018 by members of the airport security;

(ww) A child, allegedly arrested from Faisal, Giza, Egypt on 18 August 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(xx) Nouredin Hatem Sayed Ibrahim Sayed, allegedly arrested from Faisal, Giza, Egypt on 18 August 2018, by members of the National Security Forces;

(yy) Ali Jamal Ali Salim, allegedly arrested from Alexandria Governorate, Egypt on 26 July 2018, by members of the Security Forces;

(zz) Ahmed Abdelmuttalib Abdelazim Mohamed Selim, allegedly arrested from Benha City, Qaliubia Governorate, Egypt on 3 August 2018, by members of the Security Forces.

Annex III

Standard procedure cases

Pakistan

1. The Working Group transmitted 49 cases to the Government, concerning:
 - (a) Muhammad Rasheed Ahmad, allegedly abducted on 6 December 2007, by agents of the Inter-Services Intelligence (ISI), from Unit #102, Light Air Defence Sargodha, District Khushab, Punjab;
 - (b) Muhammad Faisal, allegedly abducted on 9 January 2012, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Orangi Town, Karachi, Sindh;
 - (c) Abdul Wahab, allegedly abducted on 12 September 2008, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Mohalla Tachakai, Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (d) Muhammad Nasir, allegedly abducted on 5 February 2015, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Kot Addu District, Muzafargarh, Punjab;
 - (e) Nasrullah Tariq, allegedly abducted on 12 December 2011, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home on Sher Shah Road, Kot Khawaja Saeed, Lahore, Punjab;
 - (f) Ghulam Qadir, allegedly abducted on 28 August 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Chungi #22 bus stop in Bajaur (formerly part of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (g) Maaz Ahmad Khan, allegedly abducted on 6 April 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Attock Petrol Pump, Korangi Link Road, Karachi, Sindh;
 - (h) Muhammad Musawer Iqbal, allegedly abducted on 30 June 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Arbab Moeed Building, Material Store, Noor ul Amin Colony, Millat Road, Faisalabad, Punjab;
 - (i) Alamgir, allegedly abducted on 24 August 2012, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from South Waziristan Agency (formerly part of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (j) Masood Khan, allegedly abducted on 29 May 2010, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Abbotabad, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (k) Syed Ameer Faisal, allegedly abducted on 22 April 2011, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Hangu, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (l) Asadullah, allegedly abducted on 22 April 2011, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Hangu, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (m) Mudasar Hassan, allegedly abducted on 22 April 2011, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Hayatabad, Peshawar, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
 - (n) Hafiz Shahzad Akram, allegedly abducted on 3 September 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Town Ship, Lahore, Punjab;
 - (o) Muhammad Tahir Farooq, allegedly abducted on 3 July 2017, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Lal Masjid, Islamabad, Federal Capital Territory;
 - (p) Rizwan Asghar Butt, allegedly abducted on 15 September 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Jinnah Super Market, Gujrat, Punjab;
 - (q) Hafiz Umar Khitab, allegedly abducted on 18 January 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Wazirabad, Punjab;
 - (r) Muhammad Kamran Sheikh, allegedly abducted on 16 December 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Karachi, Sindh;

- (s) Gul Wahab, allegedly abducted on 30 December 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Swabi, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (t) Umar Zadah, allegedly abducted on 1 May 2010, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (u) Sher Bahadur Khan, allegedly abducted in August 2009, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (v) Fareed Ghulam, allegedly abducted on 25 August 2016, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, and members of the military and the Frontier Corps, from his home in Kharan District, Balochistan;
- (w) Irfan Basarat Hussain Siddiqui, allegedly abducted on 8 September 2017, by paramilitary forces (Rangers), from his home in Gulshan Iqbal, Karachi, Sindh;
- (x) Zain ul Abideen, allegedly abducted on 7 June 2012, by members of the Pakistan army, from a market in Makal Karodara village, Upper Dir District, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (y) Sardar Ali Khan, allegedly abducted on 2 March 2010, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from a market located in Dhok Paracha, Tarnol, Islamabad, Federal Capital Territory;
- (z) Abzeer Ali, allegedly abducted in June 2010, by members of the Pakistan Army, from an army unit located in Jamal Public School, Dir, Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (aa) Habib ur Rehman, allegedly abducted on 26 February 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Mohalla Moragai, Bara Bandai, Swat, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (bb) Muhammad Ayoub Kandhro, allegedly abducted on 28 April 2017, by members of the Sindh Police, from a highway between Kolab Jeal and Gambat, District Khairpur, Sindh;
- (cc) Talha Khalid Talha, allegedly abducted on 30 June 2015, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents and members of the paramilitary Rangers, from his home in Nazimabad, Karachi, Sindh;
- (dd) Syed Sheeraz Haider Ali Sheeraz, allegedly abducted on 16 November 2016, by officials of the Sindh Police, the Rangers, Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Karachi, Sindh;
- (ee) Shamim Haider Guddar, allegedly abducted on 27 July 2015, by officials of the Sindh Police, the paramilitary Rangers and Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his shop in Golimar, Karachi, Sindh;
- (ff) Muslim, allegedly abducted on 2 August 2017, by officials of the Rangers, from the street on which his home is located in Lyari, Karachi, Sindh;
- (gg) Junaid Rasheed Junaid, allegedly abducted on 19 September 2017, by masked officials of the paramilitary Rangers, from his residence at the University of Karachi, Karachi, Sindh;
- (hh) Danish Rasheed Awan Danish, allegedly abducted on 5 September 2017, by officials of the paramilitary Rangers, from his residence at the University of Karachi, Karachi, Sindh;
- (ii) Syed Haider Ali Rizvi, allegedly abducted on 1 November 2015, by 8 to 10 members of the Crime Investigation Department (CID), paramilitary Rangers and police officers dressed in civilian clothes, from his home in Karachi, Sindh;
- (jj) Zahid Khan allegedly, abducted on 9 January 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Gondan stop near the police barrier in Mansehra, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;
- (kk) Qazi Muhammad Ibraheem, allegedly abducted on 12 June 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Gulzar-e-Quaid;

(ll) Abdul Rehman, allegedly abducted on 6 March 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Salamat Pura, Raiwind, Lahore, Punjab;

(mm) Nazeer Ahmad, allegedly abducted on 29 April 2013, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Attock District, Punjab;

(nn) Syed Ameen, allegedly abducted on 13 September 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Firash Town Alipur, Phase 1, Near Sultana Foundation, Islamabad, Federal Capital Territory;

(oo) Abdul Wahab, allegedly abducted on 19 September 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Momondgarh check post, Mohmand Agency (formerly part of the Federally Administered Tribal Areas), Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;

(pp) Muhammad Imran Siddiqui, allegedly abducted on 21 June 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in New Sadiq Colony, Multan, Punjab;

(qq) Sohail Umer Khan, allegedly abducted on 13 March 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Islamabad Airport, Islamabad, Federal Capital Territory;

(rr) Talha Rafique, allegedly abducted on 10 December 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from House No. 25, Street 14, Phase 1, New City Tehsil, Taxila, Rawalpindi, Punjab;

(ss) Muhammad Saleem, allegedly abducted on 23 November 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from Sadar stadium chowk, Peshawar Cantt, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa;

(tt) Asif, allegedly abducted on 5 February 2014, by Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Mohalla Gala Kot, Lyari Road, Karachi, Sindh;

(uu) Aziz Ahmed Gurgaiz, allegedly abducted on 24 May 2017, by agents of the Sindh Police, from his home in Khudabad village, Badin, Sindh;

(vv) Shahid Ali Junejo, allegedly abducted on 5 August 2017, by agents of the Sindh Police, Rangers and Inter-Services Intelligence agents, from his home in Mundra Taluka Dokri village, Larkana, Sindh;

(ww) Mukhtiar Ali Almani, allegedly abducted on 1 June 2017, by agents of the Sindh Police, from his home in Mundra Taluka Dokri village, Larkana, Sindh.

Sri Lanka

2. The Working Group transmitted 21 cases to the Government, concerning:

(a) Thavarobini Sivananthamoorthy, allegedly abducted on 31 July 2009 from Vavuniya hospital, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

(b) Kaanthan Kumarasamy Ganeshwaran, allegedly abducted on 16 May 2009 from Omanthai, Vavuniya, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

(c) Kendira Balakumar Arulappa Joseph, allegedly abducted on 14 July 2008 from a checkpoint in Murugandi, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

(d) Karikalan Raasanayagam, allegedly abducted on 17 May 2009 from the Omanthai checkpoint, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

(e) Rajeevan Jeyadevanesan, allegedly abducted on 25 February 2008 from his workplace by members of the People's Liberation Organization of Tamil Eelam;

(f) Vinathan Thevadas, allegedly abducted on 13 May 2008 from Thavasikulam, Vavuniya, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

(g) Insian Kanagalingam, allegedly abducted on 10 June 2008 from his house, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

(h) Vickneshwaran Vinasithambi, allegedly abducted on 17 May 2009 from the Vattuvakal area, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;

- (i) Thananjayan Sokkalingam, allegedly abducted on 18 May 2009 from Vattuvakal, Mullaitheevu, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (j) Sudhakaran Somasuntharam, allegedly abducted on 18 September 2009 from Mullaitheevu, Vattuvakal, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (k) Sivarasa Kanabathy, allegedly abducted on 6 August 2008 from his house, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (l) Ketheeswaran Palaninathan, allegedly arrested on 18 May 2007 from Vannankulam 100 Acre Area in Vavuniya District Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (m) Senthuran Ramchandran, allegedly arrested on 18 May 2007 from Vannankulam 100 Acre Area in Vavuniya District Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (n) Selvakumar Ravichandran, allegedly arrested on 17 May 2007 from Vannankulam 100 Acre Area in Vavuniya District Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (o) Suthakaran Sakthivel, allegedly arrested on 18 May 2007 from Vannankulam 100 Acre Area in Vavuniya District Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (p) Indrabalan Ranjan, allegedly arrested on 17 May 2007 from Vannankulam 100 Acre Area in Vavuniya District Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (q) Vijayakumar Karuppaiah, allegedly arrested on 14 April 2009 from the Pokkanay area in Skanthappuram, Kilinochchi District, Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (r) Akilan Selvanayagam, allegedly abducted on 20 April 2009 from Patchaipoolmottay, Kilinochchi District, Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (s) Sinthuja Sunthararaja, allegedly abducted on 15 May 2009 from Kilinochchi, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (t) Amalathas Thambirasa, allegedly abducted on 10 January 2011 from Kilinochchi, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka;
- (u) Pradeep Panchalingam, allegedly abducted on 4 April 2009 from Mathalan, Kilinochchi District, Northern Province, by members of the military forces of Sri Lanka.

Syrian Arab Republic

3. The Working Group transmitted 28 cases to the Government concerning:
- (a) Odai Al Tarkawi, allegedly arrested from the checkpoint on the barrier of Hama road in Homs on 27 April 2012, by members of the Air Force Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (b) Mohammad El Ezzazdin, allegedly arrested from Homs in March 2014, by members of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (c) Hani Abd Al Aal, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Jericho in early 2014, by members of the Political Security Branch of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (d) Husain Al Badawi, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Al Abbasiyeen garage region in Damascus on 2 January 2012, by members of the Air Force Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (e) Mahmoud Rashid Al Shayeb, allegedly arrested from Damascus on 14 October 2012, by members of the Political Security Branch of the Syrian Arab Republic;

- (f) Nouh Al Bakour, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Al Mleiha, Damascus on 26 May 2012, by members of the Air Force Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (g) Ibrahim Al Bakour, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Hama on 2 July 2012, by members of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (h) Tammam Al Haj Fahd, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Deir Ez-Zour on 27 September 2012, by members of the Syrian Army;
- (i) Majd Al Tarkawi, allegedly abducted on 25 July 2012 from the house of a person associated with him in Garamana city, Damascus suburbs, by members of the Air Force Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (j) Saad Sinbul, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Al Nizaria, Al Qusayr on 25 July 2012, by members of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (k) Isma'eil Hamddo, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint on Kasab road on 25 November 2012, by members of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (l) Riad Al Othman, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint on Al Arba'een Street in Hama on 15 November 2012, by members of the State Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (m) Abdullatif Zibaq, allegedly abducted from Damascus on 7 April 2014, by members of the Military Intelligence Service of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (n) Ahmad Al Hallak, allegedly arrested from the Hisyah checkpoint on the Homs-Damascus Highway on 29 December 2012, by members of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (o) Shadi Shaikhani, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Al Jisr Al Abyad, Damascus on 15 August 2012, by members of the Air Force Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (p) Mohammad Al Sagheir, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Nakhleh circle, Brazil Street neighbourhood, Homs on 17 September 2012, by members of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (q) Adnan Al Bakour, allegedly abducted from his home in Kafr al-Tun, Hama on 12 November 2012, by agents of the Air Force Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (r) Sulaiman Al Bakour, allegedly arrested from his home in Kafr al-Tun, Hama on 2 January 2013, by agents of the Air Force Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (s) Radwan Al Hamad, allegedly arrested from his home in Kafr al-Tun, Hama on 1 December 2012, by agents of the Air Force Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (t) Mahdi Al Hamad, allegedly arrested from his home in Kafr al-Tun, Hama on 1 December 2012, by agents of the Air Force Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (u) Ayham Al Akla, allegedly arrested from the house of a person associated with him in Havyleen, Hama on 23 February 2012, by agents of the Military Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (v) Saad Al Akla, allegedly arrested from his home in Kafr al-Tun, Hama on 2 February 2014, by agents of the Military Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (w) Madyan Al Jassim, allegedly arrested from the Al-Istigama checkpoint at the entrance of Hama on 15 June 2013, by agents of the Military Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (x) Hassan Al Sheikh, allegedly arrested from his home in Kafr al-Tun, Hama on 13 July 2013, by agents of the Military Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;
- (y) Ahmed Manaa, allegedly arrested from his home in Sheikh Fatouh, Idlib on 5 May 2012, by agents of the State Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic;

(z) Adnan Al Hamad, allegedly arrested from his farm in Marzaf-Muhradah village, Marzaf-Muhradah, Hama on 24 January 2012, by agents of the Air Force Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;

(aa) Inad Al Hamad, allegedly arrested from a farm in Marzaf-Muhradah village, Marzaf-Muhradah, Hama on 24 February 2012, by agents of the Air Force Intelligence of the Syrian Arab Republic;

(bb) Abdulaziz Ibrahim Alouied, allegedly arrested from a checkpoint in Eshe River, Damascus on 1 July 2014, by agents of the Military Security Forces of the Syrian Arab Republic.
