



General Assembly

Distr.: General
8 March 2010

Original: English

Human Rights Council

Fifteenth session

Working Group on the Right to Development

High-level task force on the implementation of
the right to development

Sixth session

Geneva, 14–22 January 2010

Right to development

Report of the high-level task force on the implementation of the right to development on its sixth session

(Geneva, 14–22 January 2010)

Addendum

Right to development criteria and operational sub-criteria

1. The present document contains a revised list of right to development criteria, together with corresponding operational sub-criteria, as requested by the Working Group on the Right to Development and endorsed by the Human Rights Council in its resolution 12/23. The criteria and sub-criteria attempt to address the essential features of the right to development, as defined in the Declaration on the Right to Development, in a comprehensive and coherent way, including priority concerns of the international community beyond those enumerated in Millennium Development Goal 8, and to serve the purposes set out in all relevant provisions of Council resolution 9/3.
2. For that purpose, the task force has prepared a table (see annex) that begins with a general statement on what the basic expectation of the right to development is (its “core norm”), then clarifies the core norm by enumerating three attributes of the right, the realization of each of which can be assessed with reference to several criteria, which, in turn, can be made more precise through sub-criteria. The sub-criteria may then be assessed by drawing upon reliable measurement tools in the form of one or several indicators.
3. In order to place this exercise in the context of the work of the task force spanning five years, the main phases of the task force’s work on these measurement tools are highlighted and several of their main features are explained in the section below.

Phase I: pilot testing preliminary criteria with development partnerships

4. At its first session in 2004, the task force expressed the view that, in order to implement the policy frameworks supporting the Millennium Development Goals and further the implementation of the right to development, it was necessary to develop practical tools, including guidelines and objective indicators, which help in translating the human rights norms and principles into parameters accessible to policymakers and development practitioners (E/CN.4/2005/WG.18/2, para. 46).
5. In accordance with the request made by the Working Group that the task force examine Millennium Development Goal 8, on global partnership for development, and suggest criteria for its periodic evaluation (E/CN.4/2005/25, para. 54 (i)), the task force considered at its second session, in 2005, a study¹ commissioned by the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR), and adopted a preliminary set of 13 criteria (E/CN.4/2005/WG.18/TF/3, para. 82).
6. In recommending the above-mentioned criteria to the Working Group, the task force stressed that all existing accountability mechanisms relating to aid, trade, debt, technology transfer, the private sector and global governance, within the context of their specific mandates, could improve overall accountability in the implementation of goal 8, as they are the principal source of relevant information for the periodic evaluation of goal 8 with a view to implementing the right to development. In the task force’s view, however, the existing monitoring tends to neglect critical human rights aspects, such as those reflected in its criteria, and would need to be carefully and critically scrutinized in order to be useful for the purposes of the right to development. As a prerequisite for the effective monitoring of the above criteria, the task force urged these monitoring mechanisms to integrate relevant and measurable human rights indicators based on solid research and data, including those that demonstrate links between the promotion and protection of human rights and positive

¹ Millennium Development Goal 8: indicators for monitoring implementation, by Sakiko Fukuda-Parr (E/CN.4/2005/WG.18/TF/CRP.2), subsequently published as “Millennium Development Goal 8 – international human rights obligations?” in *Human Rights Quarterly*, vol. 28, No. 4.

development outcomes. Furthermore, the task force considered that it would be valuable to monitoring progress in realizing the right to development if the Working Group were to receive periodically the elements of existing monitoring mechanisms most relevant to the criteria proposed by the task force, and thus facilitate its task in undertaking a periodic review of the global partnerships for the realization of the right to development. Its main recommendation was that the Working Group undertake such a periodic evaluation.

7. In 2006, 2007 and 2008, the task force applied the criteria to various global partnerships and refined them in the light of that experience. The Working Group requested the task force to review the structure of the criteria, their coverage of aspects of international cooperation and the methodology for their application with a view to enhancing their effectiveness as a practical tool for evaluating global partnerships, and specifically providing a consistent mapping of the criteria and relevant checklists, viewing the latter as operational sub-criteria. The Working Group saw this process eventually leading to the elaboration and implementation of a comprehensive and coherent set of standards. The task force was therefore particularly attentive to the request of the Working Group that it progressively develop and further refine the criteria, based on actual practice (A/HRC/4/47, paras. 51, 52 and 55).

8. The constant concern of the task force for the quality of the criteria was echoed by its institutional members and Member States, as well as the agencies responsible for the partnerships reviewed. It therefore drafted a revised set as a progressive development of the criteria, which maintained essentially the same content, while reordering, clarifying and developing them on the basis of lessons learned from applying the criteria to date, and submitted that list as an intermediary stage for use in phase II of its work, in 2008.² Significantly, the task force drew the attention of the Working Group to its commitment to achieve the desired level of quality of the criteria by ensuring that they (a) are analytically and methodologically rigorous; (b) provide empirically-oriented tools to those involved in implementing development partnerships that can improve the outcome of their work in the light of their respective mandates; (c) integrate analytical work done by expert groups at the World Bank, the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development, the United Nations Development Programme, the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development, the United Nations Children's Fund, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, OHCHR and others, as well as academic research centres; and (d) provide guidance so that global partnerships for development are able to respond better to the broader objectives of the right to development, proposing for that purpose an expert consultation.³

Phase II: finalizing the methodology and structure of the criteria

9. In 2009, the task force embarked upon a more systematic process of structuring criteria around attributes and attaching illustrative indicators. The first step was to commission a substantive paper,⁴ and other background materials,⁵ and to convene an international meeting of experts.⁶ Based on this work, the task force developed preliminary

² A/HRC/8/WG.2/TF/2, annex II.

³ Ibid., paras. 69–70.

⁴ Implementing the right to development: a review of the task force criteria and some options, by Rajeev Malhotra (A/HRC/12/WG.2/TF/CRP.6).

⁵ Methodological issues of qualitative and quantitative tools for measuring compliance with the right to development, selected bibliography (A/HRC/12/WG.2/TF/CRP.7/Add.1).

⁶ See A/HRC/12/WG.2/TF/CRP.7.

attributes and criteria. A progress report was shared with the Working Group at its tenth session, in 2009, in order to benefit from the considered views of Member States before continuing its work and in anticipation of submitting revised proposals in 2010 (A/HRC/12/WG.2/TF/2, annex IV). In the report, the task force drew attention to the imperative of placing the identified criteria on a rigorous analytical foundation, both conceptually and methodologically. This foundation must exclude any arbitrariness or political bias in the selection of criteria. In addition, the criteria must be sufficiently operational so that they can be meaningful to the various stakeholders, and in particular to the development community, to apply in their respective domains of work. The report also highlighted the fact that the criteria, sub-criteria and indicators are based on an exhaustive reading of the human rights instruments from which the core components can be identified; and that attributes (components) must be mutually exclusive to the extent possible. On this basis, the task force proposed three components for review by the Working Group before proceeding with the identification of criteria and sub-criteria.

10. The Working Group, despite the differences in emphasis of various delegations, expressed general support for the approach of the task force reflecting both the national and international dimensions of the right to development in the elaboration of criteria, and applying a holistic approach to human rights in their refinement (A/HRC/12/28, para. 34). There was also general support for the three components of the right to development (comprehensive human-centred development, enabling environment, social justice and equity) reflected in the criteria, with particularly strong support for the attribute relating to social justice and equity. Some delegates attached more importance to the comprehensive approach to development component, others to the enabling environment element. With regards to the coherence and pertinence of criteria, several delegates expressed their views and offered suggestions on specific criteria. Some concern was expressed about the very ambitious nature of some criteria, and whether corresponding sub-criteria could be designed for them. Some suggested that the criteria should be streamlined and that duplication be avoided, while others considered that one of the components should contain more criteria than the current preliminary draft. Numerous suggestions were made regarding specific criteria, which were noted and used by the task force in the final phase of its work (*ibid.*, para. 35).

11. Following the feedback from the Working Group, the task force continued in 2009 and 2010 to develop a full set of attributes, criteria, sub-criteria and indicators. In conformity with the Working Group's recommendation that it draw on specialized expertise, including from academic and research institutions and relevant United Nations agencies and other relevant global organizations (A/HRC/12/28, para. 46 (a)), OHCHR commissioned a study⁷ from two consultants, one with expertise in international human rights law, the other in development economics. The purpose of the study was to research comprehensively (a) the normative content of the right to development in the context of international human rights law and practice in order to define its core attributes and criteria for assessing progress towards its realization; (b) the most relevant development challenges that needed to receive priority attention in order to identify the criteria and sub-criteria; and (c) the availability of methodologically robust measures and reliable data sets that would be appropriate for indicators. A further purpose of the study was to propose refinements in the list of attributes with corresponding criteria as elaborated by the task force, and complement them with operational sub-criteria and indicators.

⁷ Bringing theory into practice: operational criteria for assessing implementation of the international right to development, by Maria Green and Susan Randolph (A/HRC/15/WG.2/TF/CRP.5).

12. To draw on specialized expertise further, the study was reviewed in an expert consultation convened by OHCHR in December 2009. Finally, at its sixth session, in January 2010, the task force considered the consultants' study and the report of the expert consultation (A/HRC/15/WG.2/TF/CRP.4), together with preliminary observations made by Member States and observers from concerned institutions and non-governmental organizations (A/HRC/15/WG.2/TF/2, paras. 67–69).

General considerations underlying the framework of attributes, criteria, sub-criteria and indicators

13. The core norm, attributes, criteria, sub-criteria and indicators (see table, annex) were chosen out of concern for conformity with agreed principles and their potential for operationalizing the right to development, taking into account also the need to differentiate standards that are general and lasting from those that are context-specific and subject to change. With respect to conformity to agreed principles, care was taken to ensure that all standards (attributes, criteria and sub-criteria) were firmly anchored in (a) the Declaration on the Right to Development; (b) criteria already examined and found useful by the Working Group; (c) an analysis of United Nations bodies or agencies, leading scholars and practitioners; (d) other international human rights laws, standards, theories and practices; and (e) prevailing international development standards, theories and practices. With regard to operationalizing the right to development, the standards are intended to provide clear, action-oriented guidance as to the responsibilities of decision makers in States, international institutions and civil society as they plan, implement, monitor and assess development-related policies, projects and processes. The criteria and sub-criteria should be relatively long-lasting and suitable for inclusion in a set of guidelines or a legally-binding instrument that development actors may use over the long term when assessing whether their own responsibilities or those of others are being met. The indicators, on the other hand, are intended to help in assessing compliance with the criteria and sub-criteria, and are therefore context-specific and subject to change over time.

14. The United Nations and academic and research centres have made considerable advances in recent years in developing indicators to measure human rights. In particular, the task force considered the work for treaty bodies on indicators, which proceeds from distilling core attributes of the right and identifying indicators in three dimensions: structural, process and outcome (HRI/MC/2008/3). The task force decided to apply these concepts in its work on the right to development, as reflected in the principles of selection described below. The indicators selected for inclusion reflect pressing contemporary concerns and established tools of measurement and data collection, as identified by international institutions, used to measure progress in meeting commitments arising from international agreements and conferences dealing with human rights and such matters as debt, trade, poverty reduction, financing of development and climate change. They also reflect general consensus among development scholars and practitioners, as well as prevailing theories about the most effective means of addressing issues of underdevelopment or disparity at subnational and national levels. An effort was made to take into account the current capacities of Governments and international institutions to gather additional data.

15. The indicators included in the table are selected from among a much larger set of relevant structural, process and outcome indicators (HRI/MC/2008/3). The principal concern in selecting the illustrative quantitative indicators provided in the table was their validity, reliability and inter-temporal and international comparability. Preference was given to indicators that were likely to show variations among countries and over time, and thus illustrate changes in human well-being. There is a mix of indicators primarily useful for describing development outcomes and indicators (structural and process) in providing guidance for future action (outcome). On most issues, where multiple indicators were

available to address a specific issue, only the one closest to the essence of that issue was included. Others could have been chosen from the thousands of potentially relevant indicators, and new ones will emerge. For this reason, the indicators listed (see annex, endnotes) in most cases with references to where they can be consulted, should be updated, and revisions and new ones added as they become available.

16. One may legitimately ask to whom the standards are addressed. The answer is found in article 3 of the Declaration on the Right to Development: “States have the primary responsibility for the creation of national and international conditions favourable to the realization of the right to development.” When considering what is required to create such an enabling environment, many would have in mind international regimes and institutions that make the rules and allocate the resources. They are the products of States acting collectively, as are their policies and programmes. In this sense, the right to development is the responsibility of States acting collectively in global and regional partnerships. Some might prefer to address this responsibility as belonging to the legal entity of an international institution. While international institutions, as legal persons, have rights and duties, the task force preferred to draw from the above-mentioned article 3 the concept of responsibility of States acting collectively. The second level of responsibility is that of States acting individually as they adopt and implement policies that affect persons not strictly within their jurisdiction, such as the beneficiaries of aid programmes, persons gaining access to medicines made available through the use of flexibilities in trade agreements or through internationally agreed programmes. These collective and international actions are reflected in article 4 of the Declaration: “States have the duty to take steps, individually and collectively, to formulate international development policies with a view to facilitating the full realization of the right to development.”

17. Finally, article 2 of the Declaration makes it clear that “States have the right and the duty to formulate appropriate national development policies that aim at the constant improvement of the well-being of the entire population and of all individuals, on the basis of their active, free and meaningful participation in development and in the fair distribution of the benefits resulting therefrom.” Thus the creation of national conditions relates to policies and programmes at the national level affecting persons within a State’s jurisdiction.

18. The standards presented in the table could be structured according to the responsibilities of States acting internally, externally and collectively, or indicate for each sub-criterion the appropriate level of State responsibility. The task force found that such an arrangement would create too much duplication since most of the policies relevant to the right to development involve responsibilities at all three, or at least two, of these levels, and responsibilities at one level only are self-evident in most cases. Therefore, the table begins with the core norm and is structured around the three attributes of comprehensive and human-centred development policy, participatory human rights processes, and social justice. While structure, process and outcome indicators are relevant to all three, the principal distinguishing feature is that the first relates to commitment (to a particular concept of development), the second to rules and principles (human rights, participation, accountability and transparency) and the third to distributional outcomes (fair distribution of the benefits and burdens of development). They are mutually exclusive to the extent possible, but necessarily overlap, for example, with regard to non-discrimination and continuous improvement of well-being. Overlapping criteria are considered matters of policy in the first, matters of respect for rules and principles in the second and of achievement of social justice in the third.

19. The sub-criteria in the second column indicate the major areas in which progress can be measured and, in the third column, are summary descriptions of relevant indicators, which are then defined with references in the endnotes. The purpose of this presentation is to allow those responsible for national and international policy to have access to reliable

tools for gauging achievements in the right to development. The Working Group may wish to consider developing more context-specific mechanisms, such as reporting templates, to enable more practical application of the criteria. As they stand, they seek to be as comprehensive and coherent as possible in accordance with the request of the Working Group.

Annex

Implementation of the right to development: attributes, criteria, sub-criteria and indicators

The right to development is the right of peoples and individuals to the constant improvement of their well-being and to a national and global enabling environment conducive to just, equitable, participatory and human-centred development respectful of all human rights. The attributes, criteria, sub-criteria and indicators listed in the table below are designed to assess the extent to which States are individually and collectively taking steps to establish, promote and sustain national and international arrangements that create an enabling environment for the realization of the right to development. The responsibility for the creation of this enabling environment encompasses three main levels: (a) States acting collectively in global and regional partnerships;^a (b) States acting individually as they adopt and implement policies that affect persons not strictly within their jurisdiction;^b and (c) States acting individually as they formulate national development policies and programmes affecting persons within their jurisdiction.^c In order to assess progress in meeting these responsibilities, a selection of indicators is also listed (for their technical definition and sources, see endnotes).

Attribute 1: Comprehensive and human-centred development policy

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
1 (a) To promote constant improvement in socio-economic well-being ^d	1 (a) (i) Health	Public expenditures on primary health; ¹ life expectancy at birth; ² access to essential drugs; ³ low birthweight babies; ⁴ child mortality; ⁵ HIV prevalence; ⁶ births attended by skilled personnel ⁷
	1 (a) (ii) Education	Public spending on primary education; ⁸ school enrolment rates; ⁹ school completion rates; ¹⁰ international scores for student achievement ¹¹
	1 (a) (iii) Housing and water	Public expenditure on public service provision; ¹² access to improved drinking water and sanitation; ¹³ homelessness rate; ¹⁴ cost of housing relative to income; ¹⁵ slum populations ¹⁶
	1 (a) (iv) Work and social security	Long-term unemployment; ¹⁷ involuntary part-time employment; ¹⁸ public expenditure on social security; ¹⁹ income poverty rates below national and international lines ²⁰

^a See General Assembly resolution 41/128, annex, second preambular paragraph, art. 3.

^b Ibid., art. 4.

^c Ibid., art. 2.

^d Ibid., second preambular paragraph and art. 2.3.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
	1 (a) (v) Food security and nutrition	Child stunting rates ²¹
1 (b) To maintain stable national and global economic and financial systems ^e	1 (b) (i) Reducing risks of domestic financial crises	National regulatory framework; ²² domestic price stability; ²³ stability of investments ²⁴
	1 (b) (ii) Providing against volatility of national commodity prices	National food price volatility; ²⁵ mechanisms for mediating price swings for food staples; ²⁶ food production volatility; ²⁷ agricultural share in total investment ²⁸
	1 (b) (iii) Reducing risks of external macroimbalances	Debt sustainability; ²⁹ foreign exchange reserves ³⁰
	1 (b) (iv) Reducing and mitigating impacts of international financial and economic crises	International macroeconomic policy coordination; ³¹ counter-cyclical financial flows; ³² stability of private capital flows; ³³ policies to avert adverse impact of domestic macropolicies on other countries ³⁴
	1 (b) (v) Protect against volatility of international commodity prices	International commodity prices for food staples; ³⁵ international price stabilization mechanisms; ³⁶ non-agricultural commodity prices ³⁷
1 (c) To adopt national and international policy strategies supportive of the right to development ^f	1 (c) (i) Right to development priorities reflected in national development plans and programmes	Availability of disaggregated socio-economic data as element of right to development content in key national development strategy documents ³⁸
	1 (c) (ii) Right to development priorities reflected in policies and programmes of IMF, World Bank, WTO and other international institutions	Equity, non-discrimination and right to development objectives in IMF, World Bank and WTO programmes and policies ³⁹
1 (d) To establish an economic regulatory and oversight system to manage risk and encourage competition ^g	1 (d) (i) System of property rights and contract enforcement	Rule of law governance measures ⁴⁰
	1 (d) (ii) Policies and regulations promoting private investment	Regulatory quality governance measures ⁴¹

^e Ibid., fourteenth and fifteenth preambular paragraphs and arts. 2.2, 2.3, 3.1, 3.3 and 10.

^f Ibid., third preambular paragraph, arts. 2.3, 3.1, 4 and 10. See also the report of the International Conference on Financing for Development (A/CONF.198/11), para. 11.

^g See General Assembly resolutions 41/128, fourteenth preambular paragraph, arts. 2.2, 2.3 and 3.1; 63/303, para. 37; and the Monterrey Consensus (A/CONF.198/11), paras. 20 and 21.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
1 (e) To create an equitable, rule-based, predictable and non-discriminatory international trading system ^h	1 (e) (i) Bilateral, regional and multilateral trade rules conducive to the right to development	Human rights impact assessment of trade agreements ⁴² aid for trade ⁴³
	1 (e) (ii) Market access (share of global trade)	Agricultural export subsidies that adversely affect low-income countries; ⁴⁴ agricultural imports from developing countries; ⁴⁵ tariffs on manufactured goods; ⁴⁶ tariffs on developing country exports; ⁴⁷ tariff peaks; ⁴⁸ manufactured exports ⁴⁹
	1 (e) (iii) Movement of persons	Ratification of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families ⁵⁰
1 (f) To promote and ensure access to adequate financial resources ⁱ	1 (f) (i) Domestic resource mobilization	Effective taxation policies that ensure mobilization of maximum available resources for fulfilment of human rights ⁵¹
	1 (f) (ii) Magnitude and terms of bilateral official capital flows	Net ODA flows relative to donor national incomes with 0.7 per cent MDG benchmark and recipient national incomes; ⁵² programme-based aid; ⁵³ quality of aid ⁵⁴
	1 (f) (iii) Magnitude and terms of multilateral official capital flows	Proposals for innovative sources for financing international development ⁵⁵
	1 (f) (iv) Debt sustainability	External debt relative to exports ⁵⁶
1 (g) To promote and ensure access to the benefits of science and technology ^j	1 (g) (i) Pro-poor technology development strategy	Existence of policy framework for technology development targeted at poor people's needs ⁵⁷
	1 (g) (ii) Agricultural technology	Improvement in agricultural technology; ⁵⁸ aid allocation to agriculture ⁵⁹
	1 (g) (iii) Manufacturing technology	Technology component of exports; ⁶⁰ performance requirement provisions in trade agreements ⁶¹

^h See General Assembly resolution 41/128, fifteenth preambular paragraph, and arts. 3.3 and 4; General Assembly resolution 64/172, ninth preambular paragraph and para. 26; and Human Rights Council resolution S-10/1, para. 7.

ⁱ See General Assembly resolution 41/128, fourteenth and fifteenth preambular paragraphs, arts. 4.2 and 8; General Assembly resolution 63/303, paras. 10, 11 and 14; and the Monterrey Consensus (A/CONF.198/11), para. 15.

^j See General Assembly resolutions 41/128, third, tenth and sixteenth preambular paragraphs, arts. 2.3, 3.3 and 4; 55/2, para. 20; and 60/1, para. 60.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
	1 (g) (iv) Technology transfer, access and national capacity	Electricity consumption; ⁶² Internet coverage; ⁶³ intellectual property and licensing; ⁶⁴ intellectual property and technology transfer provisions in trade agreements ⁶⁵
	1 (g) (v) Green energy technology	Development cooperation for green technologies; ⁶⁶ use of TRIPS flexibilities to acquire green technologies ⁶⁷
	1 (g) (vi) Health technology	Aid allocations to health technologies; ⁶⁸ use of TRIPS flexibilities and price discounts to expand access to HIV antiretroviral drugs ⁶⁹
	1 (g) (vii) Information technology	Access to telecommunications infrastructure ⁷⁰
1 (h) To promote and ensure environmental sustainability and sustainable use of natural resources ^k	1 (h) (i) Prevent environmental degradation and resource depletion	Ratification of environmental conventions; ⁷¹ consumption of ozone-depleting substances; ⁷² fishing subsidies; ⁷³ tropical timber imports; ⁷⁴ gasoline taxes ⁷⁵
	1 (h) (ii) Access to natural resources	Value of natural capital; ⁷⁶ consultative process for respecting the rights of indigenous peoples over natural resources ⁷⁷
	1 (h) (iii) Sustainable energy policies and practices	Renewable energy supply ⁷⁸
1 (i) To contribute to an environment of peace and security ^l	1 (i) (i) Reduce conflict risks	Transparency in extractive resources trade; ⁷⁹ socio-economic disparities between ethnic and other groups; ⁸⁰ adoption of international arms control measures; ⁸¹ implementation of international schemes to restrict marketing of natural resources that fuel conflicts ⁸² Index ⁸³
	1 (i) (ii) Protecting the vulnerable during conflict	Civilian deaths and internally displaced during conflict; ⁸⁴ commitment to participation of women in peace processes ⁸⁵
	1 (i) (iii) Post-conflict peacebuilding and development	Mechanisms for transitional justice; ⁸⁶ aid allocations for disarmament; ⁸⁷ rehabilitation and integration directed specifically at vulnerable groups ⁸⁸
	1 (i) (iv) Refugees and asylum-seekers	Contribution to hosting refugees ⁸⁹

^k See General Assembly resolution 41/128, arts. 1.2 and 3.1; General Assembly resolution 60/1, para. 10; and the Monterrey Consensus (A/CONF.198/11), paras. 3 and 23.

^l See General Assembly resolutions 41/128, ninth, eleventh and twelfth preambular paragraphs, arts. 3.2 and 7; and 60/1, paras. 5, 69–118.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
1 (j) To adopt and periodically review national development strategies and plans of action on the basis of a participatory and transparent process ^m	1 (i) (v) Personal security not in times and zones of armed conflict	Homicide rates ⁹⁰ (preferably disaggregated); political stability and absence of violence ⁹¹
	1 (j) (i) Collection and public access to key socio-economic data disaggregated by population groups	Disaggregated socio-economic indicators ⁹²
	1 (j) (ii) Plan of action with monitoring and evaluation systems	Existence of systems ⁹³
	1 (j) (iii) Political and financial support for participatory process	See attribute 2 list below

Attribute 2: Participatory human rights processes

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
2 (a) To establish a legal framework supportive of sustainable human-centred development ⁿ	2 (a) (i) Ratification of relevant international conventions	Ratification of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, the Convention on the Rights of the Child and conventions relating to environment, ⁹⁴ disadvantaged and marginalized populations ⁹⁵ and labour standards ⁹⁶
	2 (a) (ii) Responsiveness to international monitoring and review procedures	State reporting, acting upon findings and recommendations and views of treaty bodies and cooperation with special procedures and the universal periodic review process ⁹⁷
	2 (a) (iii) National legal protection of human rights	Constitutional and legislative guarantees; ⁹⁸ national human rights institutions protecting human rights ⁹⁹
2 (b) To draw on relevant international human rights instruments in elaborating development strategies ^o	2 (b) (i) Human rights-based approach in national development strategies	Human rights in national development plans and PRSPs; ¹⁰⁰ responsibility for extraterritorial infringement of human rights including by business enterprises ¹⁰¹

^m See General Assembly resolution 41/128, second preambular paragraph, arts. 1.1, 2.3, 3.1 and 8.2.

ⁿ Ibid., fifth, eighth and thirteenth preambular paragraphs, arts. 1.1, 2.1 and 10.

^o See *ibid.*, eighth and tenth preambular paragraphs, arts. 3.3, 6 and 9.2; and General Assembly resolution 64/172, para. 9.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
2 (c) To ensure non-discrimination, access to information, participation and effective remedies ^p	2 (b) (ii) Human rights-based approach in policy of bilateral and multilateral institutions/agencies	Institutional policy on human rights; ¹⁰² human rights impact assessments of WTO agreements and IMF and World Bank programmes ¹⁰³
	2 (c) (i) Establishment of a framework providing remedies for violations	Percentage of core human rights for which there are constitutional or legal protections and adjudicatory mechanisms; ¹⁰⁴ existence of legal protections for human rights defenders ¹⁰⁵
	2 (c) (ii) Establishment of a framework to facilitate participation	Provision of sufficient political and financial support to ensure effective participation of the population in all phases of the development policy and programme design, implementation, monitoring and evaluation; ¹⁰⁶ percentage of national and subnational ministries and other public service providers with published procedures to support public participation in the different stages of assessment, planning, implementation and evaluation of programmes and policies; ¹⁰⁷ existence of a legal or administrative standard requiring free, informed prior consent by indigenous communities to the exploitation of natural resources on their traditional lands ¹⁰⁸
	2 (c) (iii) Procedures facilitating participation in social and economic decision-making	Freedom of assembly and association; ¹⁰⁹ freedom of speech; ¹¹⁰ voice of rights holders, accountability of duty bearers ¹¹¹
	2 (c) (iv) Establishment of a legal framework supportive of non-discrimination	Percentage of core human rights for which there are constitutional or legal protections specifically for women; ¹¹² percentage of core human rights for which there are constitutional or legal protections ensuring equal rights for citizens regardless of race or ethnicity ¹¹³
	2 (c) (v) Establishment of assessment and evaluation system supportive of non-discrimination	Percentage of sectoral ministries that can provide all of the following for each of its core programmes and projects: assessment of relevant vulnerable groups in the context of the programme or project, including groups that are vulnerable to discrimination and groups that are vulnerable for other reasons; ¹¹⁴ baseline assessment data of the current state of access to relevant services disaggregated to reflect relevant vulnerable groups; ¹¹⁵ monitoring systems for the programme or policy that

^p See General Assembly resolutions 41/128, second and eighth preambular paragraphs, arts. 1.1, 5, 6 and 8.2; and 64/172, paras. 9 and 29.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
		provide disaggregated information about relevant vulnerable groups ¹¹⁶
	2 (c) (vi) Indicators reflecting likelihood of differential treatment of marginalized groups	Ratio of socio-economic indicators for marginalized groups to the national average; ¹¹⁷ ratio of percentage of population with advanced HIV infection with access to antiretroviral drugs for marginalized groups to the national average – tracks Millennium Development Goal indicator 6.5; ¹¹⁸ share of the population of marginalized groups incarcerated relative to their share in the population ¹¹⁹
	2 (c) (vii) Mechanisms for transparency and accountability	Percentage of providers of core public services, whether public or private, for which there exist functional administrative or judicial means of complaint and remedy if standards are violated ¹²⁰
2 (d) To promote good governance at the international level and effective participation of all countries in international decision-making ^q	2 (d) (i) Mechanisms for incorporating aid recipients' voice in aid programming and evaluation	Percentage of donor support provided through nationally defined coordinated programmes: Paris Declaration indicator 4 ¹²¹
	2 (d) (ii) Genuine participation of all concerned in international consultation and decision-making	IMF voting shares compared to share in global trade; ¹²² representatives for country participating in negotiations ¹²³
2 (e) To promote good governance and respect for rule of law at the national level ^r	2 (e) (i) Government effectiveness	Government effectiveness measures ¹²⁴
	2 (e) (ii) Control of corruption	Corruption control measures ¹²⁵
	2 (e) (iii) Rule of law	Rule of law measures ¹²⁶

Attribute 3: Social justice in development

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
3 (a) To provide for fair access to and sharing of the benefits of development ^s	3 (a) (i) Equality of opportunity in education, health, housing, employment and incomes	Income inequality; ¹²⁷ disaggregated outcome data by population groups, for example, male-female, rural-urban, ethnic/racial and social-economic status (see indicators for 2 (c) (vi)) ¹²⁸

^q See General Assembly resolution 41/128, arts. 3 and 10; General Assembly resolution 64/172, para. 10 (a); the Monterrey Consensus (A/CONF.198/11), paras. 7, 38, 53, 57, 62 and 63; and Human Rights Council resolution S-10/1, para. 3.

^r General Assembly resolutions 41/128, arts. 1.1, 2.3, 3.1, 6.3, 8.1 and 10; and 64/172, paras. 9, 10 (e), 27 and 28.

^s General Assembly resolution 41/128, first and second preambular paragraphs, arts. 1.1, 2.3 and 8.

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Sub-criteria</i>	<i>Indicators</i>
3 (b) To provide for fair sharing of the burdens of development ^t	3 (a) (ii) Equality of access to resources and public goods	Public expenditures benefiting poor households ¹²⁹
	3 (a) (iii) Reducing marginalization of least developed and vulnerable countries	Global gaps in income and human well-being; ¹³⁰ mitigating differential bargaining power and adjustment costs of trade liberalization ¹³¹
	3 (a) (iv) Ease of immigration for education, work and revenue transfers	Flow of skilled and unskilled migrants from poor to rich countries; ¹³² flow of remittances ¹³³
	3 (b) (i) Equitably sharing environmental burdens of development	Availability of climate change funds for developing countries; ¹³⁴ multilateral agreements to reduce negative environmental impacts; ¹³⁵ distribution of contributions to climate change ¹³⁶
	3 (b) (ii) Just compensation for negative impacts of development investments and policies	Hazardous industries, dams, natural resource concessions ¹³⁷
3 (c) To eradicate social injustices through economic and social reforms ^u	3 (b) (iii) Establishing safety nets to provide for the needs of vulnerable populations in times of natural, financial or other crisis	Domestic emergency response funds; ¹³⁸ international humanitarian and reconstruction aid; ¹³⁹ counter-cyclical official financial flows ¹⁴⁰
	3 (c) (i) Policies aimed at decent work which provide for work that is productive and delivers a fair income, security in the workplace and social protection for families	Growth rate per GDP of person employed, employment to population ratio, proportion of people living on less than a dollar a day ¹⁴¹
	3 (c) (ii) Elimination of sexual exploitation and human trafficking	Ratification of the protocol to prevent, suppress, and punish trafficking in persons especially women and children ¹⁴²
	3 (c) (iii) Elimination of child labour	Extent of child labour; ¹⁴³ ratification of the convention on the worst forms of child labour ¹⁴⁴
	3 (c) (iv) Eliminate slum housing conditions	Proportion of urban population living in slums; ¹⁴⁵ access to improved sanitation; ¹⁴⁶ and secure tenure
	3 (c) (v) Land reform	Access to land; ¹⁴⁷ secure land rights; ¹⁴⁸ and remedies against land grabs ¹⁴⁹

^t See *ibid.*, arts. 2.2 and 8.1 and Human Rights Council resolution S-10/1, para. 5.

^u See General Assembly resolution 41/128, art. 8; and the Monterrey Consensus (A/CONF.198/11), para. 16.

Notes

- ¹ Public expenditures on primary health care as percentage of GDP. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ² Life expectancy at birth, total. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ³ Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs on a sustainable basis (Millennium Development Goal indicator 8.13). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4>.
- ⁴ Percentage of low birthweight babies. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁵ Under-five mortality rate (Millennium Development Goal indicator 4.1). Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁶ HIV prevalence among population aged 15–24 years (Millennium Development Goal indicator 6.1). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4>.
- ⁷ Percentage of births attended by skilled personnel (Millennium Development Goal indicator 5.2). Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁸ Public expenditures on primary education as percentage of GNI. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁹ Percentage of 17– to 22-year-olds with fewer than four years of education, Deprivation and Marginalization in Education data set, <http://www.unesco.org/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/ED/GMR/html/dme-3.html>. Net secondary school enrolment rate. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ¹⁰ Percentage of pupils starting in grade one who will reach last grade of primary school (Millennium Development Goal indicator 2.2). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4>.
- ¹¹ Average score on the Programme for International Student Assessment. Source: OECD Program for International Student Assessment, available from http://www.oecd.org/pages/0,3417,en_32252351_32236130_1_1_1_1_1,00.html.
- ¹² Public expenditure on electricity or other forms of clean energy, water supply, sanitation and road infrastructure as percentage of GNI. Source: national estimates.
- ¹³ Percentage of population with access to improved drinking water (Millennium Development Goal 7.8) and percentage of population with access to improved sanitation (Goal 7.9). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4>.
- ¹⁴ Percentage of population homeless. Source: national data (no international data sets available).
- ¹⁵ Percentage of renters spending more than 30 per cent of household income on housing. Source: national data (no international data sets available).
- ¹⁶ Percentage of urban population living in slums (Millennium Development Goal indicator 7.10). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4> MDG indicators database.
- ¹⁷ Percentage of labour force unemployed. Source: ILO, KILM database http://www.ilo.org/empelm/what/pubs/lang--en/WCMS_114060/index.htm.
- ¹⁸ Percentage of labour force working part time involuntarily. Source: ILO, KILM database (www.ilo.org/empelm/what/pubs/lang--en/WCMS_114060/index.htm).
- ¹⁹ Public expenditure on social security as percentage of GNI. Source: national statistical services.
- ²⁰ For high-income countries, percentage of population with less than 50 per cent of median income. Source: Luxembourg Income Study Dataset for developing countries: percentage of population living on less than \$1.25 (2005 purchasing power parity per day (Millennium Development Goal 1.1). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4>.
- ²¹ Prevalence of underweight children under 5 years of age (Millennium Development Goal 1.8). Source: <http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Data.aspx?cr=4>.
- ²² Existence of a transparent, banking regulatory framework and supervisory system sufficient to ensure the integrity of monetary and banking system, mitigate systemic risk, protect consumers and investors, and ensure fairness and efficiency of markets. Source: national policy documents (no international data sets available).
- ²³ Inflation rate (GDP deflator) below 20 per cent. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ²⁴ Ratio of current year to average past five years gross domestic capital formation as percentage of GDP. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.

- 25 Ratio of average annual value to average over preceding five years of FAO food price index. Source: FAO, www.fao.org/worldfoodsituation/foodpricesindex/en.
- 26 Existence of national system of buffer stocks. Source: national policy documents.
- 27 Ratio of current year to average past five years net per capita production. Source: www.fao.org/worldfoodsituation/foodpricesindex/en.
- 28 Allocations to agricultural sector in national investment budgets (from domestic and external resources). Source: national budget and plan documents (no data sets available).
- 29 Ratio of debt to exports. Ratio of debt to Government revenue. Source: World Bank, *Global Development Finance*; debt management software system in place, such as DMFAS or CS-DRMS. Source: national documentation.
- 30 Ratio of reserves to short-term debt, and ratio of reserves to average monthly imports. Source: World Bank, *Global Development Finance*.
- 31 Percentage of coordinated macropolicy decisions by G-8 and G-20 countries that incorporate their human development impact. Source: records of G-8 and G-20 meetings and background policy documents (no international data sets available).
- 32 Year to year percentage change in total IMF credit and loans disbursed (net transfer International Bank for Reconstruction and Development and International Development Association loans outstanding, official net transfer) in proportion to percentage change in average GNI growth rate of developing countries. Source: World Bank, *Global Development Finance*.
- 33 Ratio of current year net transfer private non-publicly guaranteed external debt to average over past five-year net transfer. Source: World Bank, *Global Development Finance*.
- 34 Existence of national policy guidelines. Source: national Government policy documentation.
- 35 Ratio of average annual value to average value over preceding five years of FAO food price index. Source: www.fao.org/worldfoodsituation/foodpricesindex/en.
- 36 Existence of global or globally coordinated institutions capable of mediating price swings on key staple foods (corn, oilseed, soybean, rice, wheat), e.g. global buffer stock system. Source: www.fao.org/worldfoodsituation/foodpricesindex/en.
- 37 Ratio current year to preceding five years of average value price index for non-agricultural raw materials (minerals, ores and metals, crude petroleum). Source: UNCTAD, *Commodity Price Bulletin*.
- 38 Existence and accessibility of key socio-economic indicators disaggregated by population groups, such as region, ethnicity or linguistic affiliation, race, gender, rural and urban location. Source: national statistical data (no international data sets available).
- 39 For IMF, World Bank and WTO – does the institution explicitly take a rights-based approach to its work, with particular attention to equality and non-discrimination, transparency, participation and accountability? Source: IMF, World Bank, WTO policy statements (no international data sets available).
- 40 World Bank Worldwide Governance Indicators Project Index for “Rule of Law”. Source: <http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>. In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- 41 World Bank Worldwide Governance Indicators Project Index for “Regulatory Quality”. Source: <http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>. In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- 42 Existence of requirement to conduct prior impact assessment of the complaint remedy sought on human development in the opposing party, as well as domestically. Source: National Government documentation (no international data sets available).
- 43 Proportion of ODA allocated to aid for trade objectives. Source: donor agency data (no international data sets available).
- 44 Agricultural support estimate as percentage of the value of agricultural output. Source: compute from the World Development Indicators Online, World Bank.
- 45 Value of agricultural imports from developing countries (least developed, landlocked, small-island developing, low-income, middle-income) as a percentage of value of agricultural consumption in OECD countries. Source: UNCTAD, Trade Analysis and Information System database (http://r0.unctad.org/trains_new/index.shtm).

- ⁴⁶ Average tariff rate in OECD countries on manufactured goods originating from least developed, low- and middle-income countries. Source: UNCTAD, Trade Analysis and Information System database (http://r0.unctad.org/trains_new/index.shtm).
- ⁴⁷ Average tariff revenues received from countries with lower per capita income levels. Source: UNCTAD Trade Analysis and Information System database (http://r0.unctad.org/trains_new/index.shtm) and World Bank, World Integrated Trade Solution (<http://wits.worldbank.org/witsweb/FAQ/Basics.aspx>).
- ⁴⁸ Number of manufactured products subject to tariff peaks. Source: UNCTAD Trade Analysis and Information System database (http://r0.unctad.org/trains_new/index.shtm); and the World Bank World Integrated Trade Solution (<http://wits.worldbank.org/witsweb/FAQ/Basics.aspx>).
- ⁴⁹ Value of exports as percentage share of global trade. Source: United Nations Statistics Division Comtrade Database.
- ⁵⁰ Percentage of countries that have ratified the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families. Source: treaty body database (www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ⁵¹ Government revenue as percentage of GDP. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁵² Net ODA as percentage of GNI (Millennium Development Goal indicator 8.1). Source: OECD (www.oecd.org/dac/stats/data).
- ⁵³ Percentage of aid provided through programme-based approaches (Paris Declaration Indicator 9). Source: OECD, 2008 Survey on Monitoring the Paris Declaration: Effective Aid by 2010? What will it Take, vol. 1; overview available at (<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/ACCRAEXT/Resources/Full-2008-Survey-EN.pdf>).
- ⁵⁴ Quality of aid indicator of Commitment to Development Index. Source: Center for Global Development (www.cgdev.org/section/topics/aid_effectiveness). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ⁵⁵ Number of times that innovative proposals for financing (e.g. Tobin tax, airline tax) feature on the agenda of G-8 and G-20 meetings, and of intergovernmental meetings on financing for development. Source: records of G-8 and G-20 meetings and of United Nations meetings on financing for development.
- ⁵⁶ Ratio of debt to exports. Source: World Bank, *Global Development Finance*.
- ⁵⁷ Existence of national policy statement on science in technology. Source: national development plan or other strategy document (such as poverty reduction strategy paper). Source: national Government documentation (no international data sets available).
- ⁵⁸ Trends yields of main staple crops (rice, wheat, corn, cassava, plantain). Source: FAO statistics (<http://faostat.fao.org/default.aspx>).
- ⁵⁹ Share of ODA dedicated to agricultural sector development. Source: OECD aid statistics (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ⁶⁰ High technology exports as percentage of total exports of goods. Source: United Nations Statistical Division Comtrade.
- ⁶¹ Percentage of bilateral and regional trade agreements that prohibit developing countries from using performance criteria (such as local content requirements, technology transfer requirements and local employment requirements) to maximize benefits of foreign direct investment on national development. Source: content review of bilateral and regional trade agreements (no international data sets available).
- ⁶² Kilowatt hours per capita. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁶³ Internet hosts per 1,000 people. Source: International Telecommunications Union, World Internet Reports.
- ⁶⁴ Patents granted to residents. Source: WIPO Intellectual Property Statistics.
- ⁶⁵ Bilateral trade agreements and regional trade agreements that include conditions tightening intellectual property rights protection beyond the agreed levels of the TRIPS Agreement. Source: review of bilateral and regional trade agreements.
- ⁶⁶ Share of ODA devoted to promoting green technologies. Source: OECD (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ⁶⁷ Number of cases. Source: national Government documentation (no international data sets available).

- ⁶⁸ Share of ODA dedicated to health technologies. Source: OECD aid statistics (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ⁶⁹ Proportion of population with advanced HIV infection receiving antiretroviral therapy (Millennium Development Goal target 6.B). Source: Millennium Development Goals database (<http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mdg/Default.aspx>).
- ⁷⁰ Mainline and cellular telephones per 1,000 people (Millennium Development Goal target 8.F). Source: Millennium Development Goals database (<http://unstats.un.org/unsd/mdg/Default.aspx>).
- ⁷¹ Ratification of key environmental conventions. Source: OHCHR treaty body database (www.unhcr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ⁷² CO₂ emissions, kg per \$1,000 (PPP) of GDP; CO₂ emissions per capita. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁷³ Fishing subsidies per capita. Source: OECD, Review of Fisheries in OECD Countries, Policies and Summary Statistics, 2005.
- ⁷⁴ Value of tropical timber imports per capita. Source: national statistics (no international data sets available).
- ⁷⁵ No data source identified to date.
- ⁷⁶ Value of natural capital. Source: World Bank environmental indicators (<http://web.worldbank.org/WBSITE/EXTERNAL/TOPICS/ENVIRONMENT/EXTEEI/0,,contentMDK:21005068~pagePK:210058~piPK:210062~theSitePK:408050,00.html>).
- ⁷⁷ Existence of requirement for consultation process in regulations governing foreign direct investment. Source: national documentation (no international data sets available).
- ⁷⁸ Clean energy production as percentage of total energy supply. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ⁷⁹ Existence of national standards requiring transparency in payment arrangements to Governments (home or host country) by businesses engaged in extractive industries vulnerable to capture by parties to violent conflict. Source: national legislation.
- ⁸⁰ Measures of horizontal inequality or disparities between identity groups in the country: ratio of ethnic group to national average values for key socio-economic indicators. Source: calculations based on national data disaggregated by ethnic group.
- ⁸¹ Participation in one or more international agreements or standards regulating trade in small arms (Wassenaar Arrangement on Export Controls for Conventional Arms and Dual-Use Goods and Technologies). Source: Wassenaar Arrangement (www.wassenaar.org).
- ⁸² Country commitment to Kimberley Process. Source: Kimberley Process Working Group.
- ⁸³ Security index in Commitment to Development Index. Source: Center for Global Development (www.cgdev.org/section/topics/aid_effectiveness). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ⁸⁴ Annual number of civilian deaths per 100,000 population during years of and year following armed conflict. Source: UCDP/PRIO armed conflict data.
- ⁸⁵ Adoption of a national plan of action in accordance with Security Council resolution 1325 (2000) on women and peace and security. Source: national sources (no international database available).
- ⁸⁶ Existence of mechanisms for transitional justice within five years of cessation of hostilities. Source: national documentation (no international data sets).
- ⁸⁷ Proportion of aid allocations for disarmament. Source: OECD aid statistics (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ⁸⁸ Proportion of ODA for disarmament, rehabilitation and reintegration targeted at issues affecting women. Source: OECD aid statistics (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ⁸⁹ UNHCR index of refugee burden. Source: UNHCR Statistical Yearbook.
- ⁹⁰ Homicides per 100,000. Source: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (www.unodc.org/unodc/en/data-and-analysis/index.html?ref=menuaside).
- ⁹¹ Political stability and absence of violence index score, worldwide governance indicators. (www.worldbank.org/wbi/governance). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ⁹² Data on key socio-economic indicators, disaggregated by major population group, including gender, race, ethnicity and rural population. Source: national statistical data.
- ⁹³ Existence of systems. Source: national Government processes.

- ⁹⁴ Ratification. Source: OHCHR treaty body database (www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ⁹⁵ Ratification. Source: OHCHR treaty body database (www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ⁹⁶ Ratification. Source: OHCHR treaty body database (www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ⁹⁷ Existence of State reports. Source: OHCHR documentation.
- ⁹⁸ Existence of relevant legislation or administrative instructions. Source: national constitution and legislation.
- ⁹⁹ Existence of national human rights institutions. Source: national Government information.
- ¹⁰⁰ Human rights as an element of normative framework, analysis of critical constraints and priority plan of action. Source: content review of relevant documents.
- ¹⁰¹ Existence of national regulation. Source: national Government information (no international database available).
- ¹⁰² Human rights elements of institutional policy statements. Source: review of institutional statements (no data sets available).
- ¹⁰³ Human rights impact assessments of WTO, IMF and World Bank programmes. Source: studies from diverse origins (no data sets available to date).
- ¹⁰⁴ Percentage of core human rights for which there are constitutional or legal protections and adjudicatory mechanisms. Source: content review of legal and administrative references (no data sets available).
- ¹⁰⁵ Existence of legal protection for human rights defenders. Source: content review of legal and administrative references (no data sets available).
- ¹⁰⁶ Budget provided for participatory processes. Source: country-specific budgets at ministerial level (no data sets available).
- ¹⁰⁷ Existence of published guidelines in national and subnational ministries and agencies. Source: country-specific administrative information (no data sets available).
- ¹⁰⁸ Existence of guidelines and procedures. Source: country-specific administrative information (no data sets available).
- ¹⁰⁹ Further research required.
- ¹¹⁰ Further research required.
- ¹¹¹ World Bank Worldwide Governance Indicators Voice and Accountability score. Source: World Bank (<http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ¹¹² Existence of legal provisions. Source: country-specific assessment. Source: no international data sets available.
- ¹¹³ Existence of legal provisions. Source: country-specific assessment. Source: no international data sets available.
- ¹¹⁴ Existence of studies. Source: country-specific assessments (no international data sets available).
- ¹¹⁵ Existence of studies. Source: country-specific assessments (no international data sets available).
- ¹¹⁶ Existence of studies. Source: *country*-specific assessments (no international data sets available).
- ¹¹⁷ Ratio of value for marginalized population (ethnic group, racial group, women, disabled, aged, other identified groups) to national average for indicators under I (a) including health, education, housing and water, work and social security, food security and nutrition. Sources: sources identified with regard to attribute 1 (a). Note: Millennium Development Goal monitoring guidelines recommend collection of disaggregated data.
- ¹¹⁸ Ratio of value for marginalized population to national average with access to anti-retroviral drugs (Millennium Development Goal indicator 6.5). Note: Millennium Development Goal indicators guidelines recommend collection of disaggregated data.
- ¹¹⁹ Ratio of incarceration rate for marginalized population to national average. Source: national statistical data (no international data sets available).
- ¹²⁰ Country-specific assessments. Source: no international data sets available.
- ¹²¹ Percentage of donor support provided through nationally defined programmes (Paris Declaration monitoring indicator 4). Source: OECD, 2008 survey on monitoring the Paris Declaration: effective aid by 2010? What will it take? vol. 1.

- ¹²² Ratio of percentage IMF quotas to share in global trade. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online and IMF (www.imf.org/external/np/sec/memdir/members.htm).
- ¹²³ Ratio country average to high-income country average in average number of WTO representatives per country party to negotiations for multilateral trade agreement. Source: WTO delegations and negotiations records (no data sets available).
- ¹²⁴ Worldwide Governance Indicators Government Effectiveness Index. Source: World Bank Worldwide Governance Indicators (<http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ¹²⁵ Worldwide Governance Indicators Corruption Index. Source: World Bank Worldwide Governance Indicators (<http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ¹²⁶ Worldwide Governance Indicators Rule of Law Index. Source: World Bank Worldwide Governance Indicators (<http://info.worldbank.org/governance/wgi/index.asp>). In the light of the conceptual and methodological considerations made in the present report, further research is required.
- ¹²⁷ Ratio of income of bottom quintile to bottom quintile population (by country). Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ¹²⁸ Ratio of key socio-economic outcome data between population groups (rural, female, ethnic group, linguistic group, racial group) and national average. Source: calculation based on disaggregated national data as in sub-criteria 2 (c) (vi).
- ¹²⁹ Ratio of combined school enrolment rate of poorest population quintile to wealthiest population quintile; public expenditure on economic infrastructure and services benefiting smallholders and business owners as percentage of GNI; ratio of income growth rate of poorest population quintile to income growth rate of wealthiest population quintile. Source: calculations based on national data (no international data sets available).
- ¹³⁰ Ratio of average per capita GDP growth rate of poorest quintile of countries to average per capita GDP growth rate of wealthiest quintile of countries; ratio of under-five mortality rate average in least developed countries to rate in high-income countries; ratio of net secondary enrolment rate average in least developed countries to global average; ratio of percentage of children under 5 years who are shorter for age average in least developed countries compared to global average. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ¹³¹ Proportion of total OECD country imports from least developed countries admitted free of duty (Millennium Development Goal indicator 8.6). Source: Millennium Development Goal indicators data set.
- ¹³² Foreign nationals of developing countries with valid work permits as percentage of high-income country labour force. Source: national data (no international data sets available).
- ¹³³ Inflow of remittances. Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ¹³⁴ Value of global funds (sum of ODA and private contributions) as percentage of global GNI made available to developing countries for activities mitigating the effects of climate change. Source: OECD aid statistics (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ¹³⁵ Percentage signed of major environmental treaties (e.g. Cartagena Protocol, Framework Convention on Climate Change, Kyoto Protocol to the Framework Convention, Vienna Convention for the Protection of the Ozone Layer, Montreal Protocol on Substances that Deplete the Ozone Layer, Stockholm Convention on Persistent Organic Pollutants, Convention on the Law of the Sea, Convention to Combat Desertification). Source: documentation on each treaty.
- ¹³⁶ Ratio of per capita CO₂ emissions of high-income countries to those of developing countries (least developed, landlocked, small-island developing States, low-income, middle-income countries). Source: World Bank, World Development Indicators Online.
- ¹³⁷ Value of compensation per capita for negative impact of development. Source: case specific information (no international data sets available).
- ¹³⁸ Emergency response funds. Source: national budgets (no international data sets).
- ¹³⁹ Humanitarian and reconstruction aid flows as a proportion of appeals. Source: calculation based on case-specific appeal documentation and OECD aid statistics (www.oecd.org/dataoecd/50/17/5037721.htm).
- ¹⁴⁰ Year to year percentage change in total IMF credit and loans disbursed (net transfer IBD and IDA loans outstanding, official net transfer) in proportion to percentage change in GNI growth rate. Source: data from World Bank, *World Development Indicators* and *Global Development Finance*.

- ¹⁴¹ These are Millennium Development Goal 1 indicators. Source: Millennium Development Goal indicators data sets (<http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Default.aspx>).
- ¹⁴² Ratification of the Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime. Source: OHCHR treaty body database (www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ¹⁴³ Children involved in economic activity, child labour and hazardous work. Source: ILO international programme on the elimination of child labour.
- ¹⁴⁴ Ratification of treaty. Source: OHCHR treaty body database (www.unhchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf/Statusfrset?OpenFrameSet).
- ¹⁴⁵ Percentage of urban population living in slums (Millennium Development Goal indicator 7.D). Source: Millennium Development Goal indicators data sets (<http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Default.aspx>).
- ¹⁴⁶ Percentage of urban population with access to improved sanitation (Millennium Development Goal indicator 7C). Source: Millennium Development Goal indicators data set (<http://mdgs.un.org/unsd/mdg/Default.aspx>).
- ¹⁴⁷ Landless agricultural labourers as proportion of rural labour force. Source: national statistical data (no international data sets).
- ¹⁴⁸ National legislation on land rights. Source: national legislation (no international data sets).
- ¹⁴⁹ National legislation and procedures. Source: review of national legislation and guidelines (no international indicator sets available).
-