



Convention on the Rights of the Child

Distr.: General
12 May 2015

Original: English
English, French and Spanish only

Committee on the Rights of the Child

Sixty-ninth session

25 May–12 June 2015

Item 4 of the provisional agenda

Consideration of reports of States parties

List of issues in relation to the report submitted by Israel under article 12, paragraph 1, of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography

Addendum

Replies of Israel to the list of issues*

[Date received: 22 April 2015]

* The present document is being issued without formal editing.



Acronyms

GOI	Government of Israel
CDG	Committee of Directors General
IPS	Israel Prisons Service
LAA	Legal Aid Administration
MOH	Ministry of Health
MOJ	Ministry of Justice
MSS	Ministry of Social Affairs and Social Services
MPS	Ministry of Public Security
NATU	National Anti-Trafficking Unit
CCD	Police Cyber Crime Division
ELEM	NGO – Youth in Distress in Israel

Question 1

Statistical Data on Sale of Children

1. Israel did not encounter any cases of sale of children. There are also no cases of child sex tourism, both inside Israel or by Israeli tourists abroad. In addition, no Israeli national was prosecuted and/or convicted under the extra-territorial provisions for traveling to other countries to engage in child sex tourism. Accordingly, the information elaborated upon below relates only to child prostitution and child pornography.

Statistical Data on Child Prostitution and Child Pornography

2. In general, cases regarding exploitation of minors are handled with serious consideration, out of respect for human dignity, the right to personal autonomy over the minor's body, the right to the integrity of the body, the right to privacy and the best interest of the child. This is reflected in a strict enforcement policy and by striving to set a severe level of sentences in this category of offenses.

3. For statistical data regarding victims of child prostitution and child pornography, and for information regarding court cases, please see Annexes I-II.

Statistical Data on Trafficking in Children

4. In the past three years, approximately fifteen (15) minor girls, who were trafficked, entered Israel illegally from the Egyptian border through the Sinai Peninsula. While they were on Egyptian territory, they were held in camps where they suffered heinous crimes and grave abuse at the hands of their captors ("Sinai Camps"), for the purpose of obtaining ransom from their family members in their countries of origin. In Israel, they were recognized as victims of trafficking, notwithstanding the fact that the offenses against them were conducted outside of Israeli borders, by foreign nationals. Following their entry into Israel, some of the girls were initially held in detention facilities, and were later referred to boarding schools run by the Ministry of Education. Approximately nine (9) of the girls were sent to the shelters for victims of trafficking in Israel. For more information on the shelters and other services provided to victims of trafficking in Israel, please see the report submitted by the State of Israel in 2012 (hereinafter: the "Initial Report").

5. In addition, in the past three years, there were two (2) cases of trafficking in minors for the purpose of prostitution that involved Israeli citizens. The cases involved eight (8) minor victims in total. For elaborated information on those cases, please see Annex III.

Statistical Data on Assistance and Reintegration to Child Victims

6. There is no aggregated data regarding this issue.

Question 2

7. As elaborated on pages 4-28 of the Initial Report, the acts and activities provided under Article 3 of the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography (hereinafter: the Protocol), are listed under the Israeli Penal Law 5737-1977 (the "Penal Law"). Since the submission of the Initial Report, two main amendments were made:

1) Amendment to Section 214(b3) of the Penal Law (Amendment No. 118, 2014) – Accessing obscene publication: In order to eliminate, to the extent possible, the use of child pornography this amendment provides that not only the possession (by

downloading) of an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor, but also accessing (through streaming) such material, constitute a criminal offense.¹ This is a significant amendment, aimed to cover cases in which the offender accesses pornographic materials containing minors but does not save those materials on his/her computer.

2) Amendment to the Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law 5758-1998 (Amendment No. 10, 2013 – Section 3(a)(5A)): the Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law 5758-1998 (hereinafter: the “Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law”) prohibits sexual harassment and provides that harassers are potentially personally liable for either the crime and/or tort of sexual harassment. The amendment adds another form of sexual harassment: publishing a photograph, film or recording of a person that focuses on a person’s sexuality, in circumstances in which the publication is likely to humiliate or degrade a person. Such an act constitutes a sexual harassment offense providing that the person did not consent to the publication. According to Section 5(a) of the Sexual Harassment Law, such an act constitutes a violation of the Protection of Privacy Law 5741-1981, which is a criminal offense punishable by five (5) years of imprisonment. It also constitutes a civil tort according to Section 6 of the Law.

State Attorney Guidelines

- State Attorney’s Guideline No. 14.7, entitled “Assistance to Crime Victims and Prosecution Witnesses in a Criminal Proceeding” (last update – 1.8.2011) states that each District Attorney shall appoint an attorney who is in charge of guiding the staff of the District Office on how to provide victims of crime with the relevant information on the rights and services to which they are entitled. The guideline aims to support victims during the criminal procedure.
- State Attorney’s Guideline No. 2.5, concerns the special circumstances involving conflicting evidence in a case of victims of sexual crimes. This Guideline maintains that if the case involving a witness who was also the victim of a sexual crime, criminal proceedings against that witness, due to conflicting statements or evidence should be initiated only rarely because of the exceptional mental state of the witness. Detaining such witnesses is forbidden for the purposes of an investigation. However, an investigation may be conducted in the case of witness tampering.
- Deputy Attorney General for Criminal Affairs’ Guideline of December 11, 2014 entitled “Treatment of cases regarding publication, possession and accessing obscene materials that includes the image of a minor”: This Guideline regulates the procedure for handling the prosecution of the offense at various stages of the criminal procedure. The Guideline provides operative instructions to handle cyber-pedophilia cases, and to enable the prosecutors to develop an effective argument, which is based on a broad understanding of the offense. The Guideline defines what “obscene material” includes, and emphasizes the implications of possessing or accessing such materials. The Guideline also explains that in certain cases, possessing or accessing obscene material containing the image of a minor can be considered to be an act of publication, in addition to other forms of publication that include the image of a minor that are elaborated under the Penal Law; such an act constitutes a separate offense, according to Section 214(b) of the Penal Law. For example, sending this kind of material from one user to another (via email or other

¹ Note, that in order to enable different officials to fulfil their duties, the Penal Law states that a person shall not be deemed to have committed an offense under Sections 205A to 205C and 214, if the provision of the information, its publication or the possession thereof was for a legal purpose, including true and fair reporting on the subject of prostitution and obscenity.

sharing program) or possessing such material on a file sharing services or program. The Guideline further provides that with regard to obscene publication, there is no right for the Defense to make a copy of these investigation materials, out of respect for the privacy and human dignity of the minors involved, and in order to avoid reoccurrence of the offense.

- Deputy Attorney General for Criminal Affairs' Guideline of March 2, 2014 entitled "Implementation of the Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law (Amendment No. 10 of 2013)": this Guideline was issued after the enactment of Section 3(a)(5A) of the Prevention of Sexual Harassment Law (see above). The Guideline explains, inter alia, that with regard to the publication of a photograph or a video that predominantly includes an image of a minor, a person can be prosecuted for both offenses – Section 214(b) of the Penal Law and Section 3(a)(5A) of the Sexual Harassment Law, because the purpose of both laws is different: the purpose of the offense under the Penal Law is to counter the phenomenon of pedophilia over the internet, while the purpose of the offense under the Sexual Harassment Law is to define the act of publishing a photograph as a form of sexual harassment in certain circumstances. In addition, the Guideline clearly states that due to the severe implications of these offenses on the lives of the victims, such offenders must be prosecuted, even if the offenders are minors themselves and even if they do not have a criminal record.
- In addition, the Police continue to operate in accordance with State Attorney Guideline 2.2, which orders that, when entering brothels, the Police must examine the potential of situations involving trafficking in persons for the purpose of prostitution.

Question 3

8. For updated information regarding investigation of cases of child pornography Please see Annex I.

- Reasons for a sharp increase in cases of child pornography in 2008-2009: During the years 2008-2009, there was an increase in the number of requests filed to the Police from foreign law enforcement agencies, who conducted covert activities on the internet to detect pedophiles during this period. The Special Cyber Crimes Division of the Police (hereinafter: "the CCD") received information on dozens of IP addresses, indicating Israeli users who downloaded pedophilic materials from different websites and programs. Thus, the Police made extensive efforts to locate those offenders and to investigate the relevant cases.
- Reasons for the number of cases prosecuted between 2004 and 2011 (45 cases out of 468): There are several reasons for the number of prosecutions during this period. First, during some of the relevant years, a special order of statute of limitation was applied to offenses of pornography, limiting the period to two (2) years from the day that the offense was committed. This consequently posed a challenge for the prosecution. In 2007, the order was cancelled so that the period of the statute of limitation was extended to five (5) or ten (10) years from the day that the offense was committed, depending on the category of the offense. Second, in 2014 a designated amendment to the Penal Law, followed by a State Attorney's Guideline, was established, in order to cover the offense of possessing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor, which was not downloaded to a computer (see reply to Question #2, above). Third, in some cases, involving a small amount of materials, or when the suspect was a minor, it was found that the possession of the materials was by coincidence and in good faith. Such cases exceed the scope of the

offenses covered by the Penal Law. Fourth, naturally, in the abovementioned cases, some were closed due to evidentiary problems.

Question 4

9. In recent years, key Government Ministries developed several plans of action concerning the prevention of child prostitution and sale of children:

The Special Inter-Ministerial Team to Develop a Collaborative Action-Plan to Improve Ways to Tackle Child Prostitution

10. The team is headed by the NATU and includes representatives of the MPS, MOH, MOI, MSS, the Ministry of Education, the Police, the State Attorney's Office and representatives of relevant NGOs: ELEM (Organization for Youth in Distress in Israel), and Feminine Horizon (a governmental assistance program for persons engaged in prostitution including minors, operating under the auspices of the MSS and Haifa Municipality). During 2012-2013, the team convened several meetings.

11. In January 2014, the team issued its concluding recommendations, which included a scheme of a national-scale plan entitled "The Action Plan to Eradicate the Phenomenon of Prostitution of Minors and its Social Implications". In February 2014, the concluding recommendations, were presented before the CDG and before the Knesset (the Israeli Parliament) Committee on Rights of the Child and the Knesset Sub-committee on Trafficking in Women and Prostitution.

12. The goals of the Action Plan are: (a) Reducing the likelihood of minors to engage in prostitution. (b) Increasing identification and detection of minors that are in risk of engaging in prostitution. (c) Creating an effective deterrence against consumers of minor prostitution. (d) Providing initial assistance ("Damage Control") and rehabilitation of minors in prostitution. (e) Increasing public awareness to the phenomenon of minors in prostitution and to its consequences. The relevant authorities are currently waiting for the results of the National Survey in order to gather an estimation of the required funds that need to be allocated in order to carry out the Action Plan. Furthermore, in 2015 the MPS began to implement some of the recommendations (as will be further elaborated upon below).

13. At this stage, the Inter-Ministerial Team found that the main characteristics of child prostitution are:

- The average age of entering into prostitution is 12-14 years old.
- During their first period of involvement in prostitution, most of the minors still attend educational frameworks and are at a reasonably normative- functioning level. This imposes a challenge on identification due to a lack of obvious signs indicating that special attention is required concerning the welfare of the minor.
- Prostitution of minors exists in a variety of groups within Israel: Jews, Arabs, secular, religious, Ultra-Orthodox, new immigrants, homosexual male minors and transgender minors and immigrants.
- About 75% of the minors involved in prostitution are female; 20% are male; 3%-5% are transgender minors.
- Note, that ELEM was an active participant in all the discussions of the Team, and provided sufficient findings on characteristics of two main categories of prostitution (casual and commercial prostitution).

The National Survey

14. The MSS and the MPS are conducting comprehensive research regarding prostitution in Israel (prostitution of women, men and minors) with the goal of assessing the extent of the phenomenon, and establishing an estimation of the number of minors that are engaged in prostitution. The research includes obtaining information about prostitution potentially occurring in different locations such as bars, strip-clubs, street-prostitution, “discreet” apartments and the internet. Following the first phase of the National Survey, the researchers found some difficulties in a questionnaire-based approach since minors in prostitution tend to deny their engagement in such activity and refrain from labelling themselves as such. The research is ongoing.

15. Due to the difficulties associated with ascertaining figures of minors engaged in prostitution, the MSS initiated a unique Plan of Proactive Detection. The plan includes (a) raising awareness among professionals that are working with youth in distress (b) designated training sessions for the counseling staff and other staff who are working with the young population in the local municipalities. The sessions include training on how to define and characterize minors involved in prostitution, potential reactions when dealing with such individuals and suitable treatment that can be offered to these minors. (c) At the end of the training process, the social workers in the local municipalities were asked to identify to the MSS, for the National Survey, which of their clients (only initials) are minors engaged in prostitution. The MSS found that there are currently approximately 950 minors that are engaged in prostitution. Most of them are girls, and all of them are treated by a social worker.

Forthcoming Inter-Ministerial Procedure for Identifying Minors in Prostitution

16. The MPS is in the process of formulating an inter-ministerial procedure aimed at improving cooperation and exchange of information between relevant Government Ministries and NGOs. A key principle of the Procedure is to keep the identity of the minor who is engaged in prostitution confidential.

The National Plan for Countering Trafficking in Persons

17. An inter-ministerial team, headed by the NATU, developed a National Plan for countering trafficking in persons, for the purpose of slavery and for the purpose of prostitution. The Plan was adopted by the GOI on December 2, 2007, in accordance with Government Resolution No. 2670 and it is under constant review. In December 2014, the CDG authorized the NATU to update the National Plan.

Question 5

18. In Israel, there is no designated coordinating body for the implementation of the Protocol, but rather there are several governmental authorities that are responsible for implementing the required activities under the Protocol. The following is a short description of each of the relevant authorities:

1. Coordinating Efforts to Prevent the Sale of Children – The National Anti-Trafficking Unit (NATU)

19. The NATU is the primary government agency that coordinates the anti-trafficking efforts of Israel, including child victims. The NATU was established according to a 2006 Government Resolution; it operates independently under the MOJ, and reports to the CDG. The NATU serves both as a coordination body, and as an authority in policy development. Its mission is to promote cooperation between all relevant government authorities, and to

serve as a bridge between government authorities and non-governmental organizations, as well as relevant international bodies. The NATU is also involved in different processes regarding the prevention of the sale of children or other forms of exploitation in the framework of surrogacy abroad.

2. Authorities leading the struggle against child pornography

(a) The Police Cyber Division (CCD)

20. In 2013, the Police expanded its investigation force, and established a Cyber Crime Division (CCD). It includes Sixty (60) investigators specializing in investigating online sexual offenses. The investigators of the CCD are specially trained in digital forensic expertise and in practices and patterns of distribution of material by offenders. The CCD possesses extensive web intelligence, equipping it with the necessary skills to investigate the crimes and the ability to identify the victims and their location. In addition, Internet Service Providers in Israel (ISPs) fully collaborates with the CCD. Following the establishment of the CCD, a special team for investigating cyber-sex crimes among minors was appointed. The team includes one (1) officer and two (2) investigators, all of whom are experts in identifying cyber-sex crimes and pedophilia and are familiar with the sensitivity of such cases. The officer is authorized to utilize the whole CCD staff when a large-scale case or sensitive case of cyber-sex crimes against minors is underway. The team is also in charge of collaborating with INTERPOL on these issues.

(b) The State Attorney's Office

21. The State Attorney's Office is dedicating increasing attention to the issue of child pornography. It is sensitive to the dynamic circumstances and to the increasing use of virtual media in order to commit offenses against minors, and the Office is continually making efforts to adapt accordingly to these challenges. For example, a Cyber Crimes Unit is forthcoming, and it will include prosecutors specializing in this issue.

22. In recent years, in each District Attorney's Office, a special appointee was designated to coordinate the handling of the trafficking in persons cases. In collaboration with a Coordinating Anti-Trafficking Attorney at the State Attorney's Office, they are working to acquire a full picture and comprehensive data on the interpretation and application of the trafficking in persons offense.

3. Authorities Leading the Efforts against Child Prostitution

(a) The MPS Society and Crime Prevention Division – Metzila

23. The MPS (encompassing the Police and the IPS) invests tremendous efforts in the field of minors' protection, prevention of crime and strengthening the personal safety of minors. The MPS is also working to promote, empower and protect youth in distress in order to prevent them from falling victim to the offenses under the Protocol. One of the leading divisions within the MPS that is promoting this field is Metzila. Metzila was established in 1996 in order to promote and reinforce the support of communities against violence with the aim of countering juvenile violence. It did so by bringing about improved coordination between community organizations and fostering greater involvement of residents of the community. Metzila runs a variety of anti-violence projects for children and teenagers in more than 70 cities - both Jewish and Arab - throughout the country. It does so by working in cooperation with the municipalities, Government Ministries, and other community agencies. Please see further details on Metzila's Program entitled "Preventing Violence against Women through Female Empowerment" in our response to Question #8.

(b) Ongoing Efforts by Government Ministries

24. In addition to the specifically designated units, the Youth Department in the Police, the MSS, the Ministry of Education and other Government Ministries are countering child prostitution through prevention, identification and treatment in different arenas, as elaborated in the Initial Report.

Question 6

25. Funding for countering trafficking in persons, including children:

- MOH: A total annual cost of approximately 0.5 Million NIS (U.S. \$125,000) is allocated for medical care provided in the shelters for victims of trafficking.
- Police: The security in the shelters for victims of trafficking in persons is carried out by an external company, supervised by the Police, for an annual cost of 1,200,000 NIS (U.S. \$300,000).
- The MSS:
 - Annual cost of 9,000,000 NIS (U.S. \$2,250,000) is allocated for trafficking in persons. This includes three (3) shelters, four (4) transitional apartments and the Day Center for victims of trafficking in persons in Tel Aviv-Jaffa.
 - Annual cost allocated for handling child prostitution: 6,000,000 NIS (1,500,000 USD), this includes: (1) Operating the 24/7 Open Space for Minors in Tel Aviv-Jaffa. (2) Operating six (6) Open Spaces in other local authorities in Israel. (3) Providing an emergency shelter for young women and men (over 18) that are engaged in prostitution. (4) Identification efforts (5) Rehabilitation programs.
 - Annual cost allocated for the Youth Protection Authority, in charge of aspects of treatment and reintegration, is 76,000,000 NIS (19,000,000 USD).
- MOJ: The total annual cost of 3,121,000 NIS (U.S. \$780,250) is allocated to counter trafficking in persons. This includes the annual funding of the LAA, the NATU, the State Attorney's Office and the Office of the Deputy Attorney General (International Law).

Question 7**The State Attorney's Office**

26. The Institute of Legal Training for Attorneys and Legal Advisers conducts seminars and training on regular basis for the State Attorney's Office on the offenses listed under the Protocol, as well as on trafficking in persons and on related issues of surrogacy.

27. In addition, special seminars are conducted in conjunction with Haruv Institute (NGO). The Haruv Institute was established in 2007, with the mission to enhance knowledge, as well as to develop advanced educational programs for professionals and allied care-givers who work with abused and neglected children, and their families. It conducts lectures on the subject of child sex offenses, and in particular cyber-sex offenses.

Judges and Court Personnel

28. Lectures and seminars on trafficking in persons, sexual offenses in general and in particular against children and related issues are conducted for judges on a regular basis.

For example, a seminar on sexual offenses was held in February 2014 by the Institute of Advanced Judicial Studies. The seminar included a session on investigating a child-witness in cases of sexual offenses.

The Police

29. With regard to Prostitution of minors: In the last two years, the Police has been placing greater efforts on improving several working procedures concerning prostitution of minors in order to make enforcement more efficient. This includes inter alia: (a) Providing lectures and seminars for different Police Districts in order to train the youth department staff on this phenomenon as well relevant legal aspects. In 2014, for example, nineteen (19) lectures and training sessions were conducted for juvenile police officers and investigators on the subject of prostitution, including prostitution of minors. (b) Refining and clarifying the offense of consuming prostitution services from a minor (Section 203C of the Penal Law) (hereinafter: “the Offense”). An explanatory document on the Offense was distributed to district investigation and intelligence officers, and work meetings and training sessions were conducted about the document. (c) The Offense was added to the Police’ list of “Disclosure Offenses”, i.e, offenses that require instigated investigations that are not contingent upon any complaint, as well as monitoring and assessment of prostitution of minors’ cases managed by the Police Juvenile Department; (d) An important emphasis was given to the collaborative interaction between the MSS and the Police, one noteworthy example is forwarding the details of a minor in prostitution to a Welfare Officer; (e) The Police increased its supervision and control over the Youth Department on investigation of minors’ prostitution cases; (f) Several meetings were conducted between the manager of the Open Space in Tel Aviv-Jaffa, ELEM, who operates MSS-funded Open Space, and Police representatives.

With regard to Child Pornography:

- In 2012, the Head of the CCD participated in the FBI International Course in Virginia, U.S.A (30-day course), on sexual offenses against minors and pedophilia.
- In September 2014, training was conducted for the CCD investigators by FBI cyber experts, providing the investigators with forensic tools to analyze and detect pedophiles on the internet.
- In May 2014, the head of the CCD participated in a five (5)-day FBI conference on the issue of online sexual offenses against children.
- In 2013, a CCD investigator participated in the Europol Convention on pedophilia.
- A number of investigators of the CCD were trained and qualified as child investigators (qualified to investigate minors both as victims and as offenders).
- Seminars and training on the subject of forensic knowledge and expertise with regard to offenses committed through the internet and technological devices (computers, phones) are conducted regularly for the CCD.
- Police Officers of the CCD conducted several lectures for pupils in junior high schools and high schools on the “National Safe Internet Week”. The lectures discussed methods of precautions when browsing the internet, explained the phenomenon of cyber sexual offenses, outlined avenues that can provide assistance to victims, and more.
- In 2014, Nineteen (19) lectures on prostitution of minors were given as part of different police training courses and units in conjunction with different NGOs.

The IPS

30. IPS ran a training program for staff who works in juvenile detention facilities. The training program provides lessons on identifying distressing situations amongst minors and ways to approach and communicate with adolescents, including issues referring to minors in prostitution, and the social background of the victims. In addition, the IPS's staff participates on a regular basis in conferences and seminars on the subject of minors, including seminars that are conducted by ELEM, aimed at deepening understanding and knowledge when addressing the phenomenon of prostitution of minors.

The MSS

31. Trainings are conducted for staff members, including supervisors of social workers that work in the local authorities.

The MOH

32. In the framework of the program "Safe sex in the big city" (see our response to Question #8), a training program was developed and conducted for the lecturers who ran the program.

The NATU

33. With regard to trafficking in persons, including children, the NATU conducts anti-trafficking training for government officials and to non-governmental actors on a regular basis. In some cases, the training is conducted in conjunction with NGOs and each training session is tailored for the specific audience. In addition, the NATU representatives participate in different lectures and panels. For example, in 2014, they participated in the annual conference of the Israel National Council for the Child (NGO), which focused on the issue of child prostitution. Representatives from the Police, the MOH and the MSS also participated in the panel.

34. "Responsible Tourism" – The MOJ and the Authority for the Advancement of Women initiated an awareness-raising campaign on the phenomenon of trafficking in persons in the tourism industry. The project was launched on September 8, 2014, and it was aimed at hotel managers and other officials in the tourism industry, government officials and NGOs representatives. The Seminar, attended by the Director of the MOJ, featured a panel that included representatives of the Israel Hotel Association, the Ministry of Tourism, the Police, and a representative from ELEM.

Question 8**A. Prevention of Child Prostitution****The Ministry of Education**

35. The Ministry of Education's Psychological Counseling Service ("SHEFI") operates a unit that is specifically designated for sex education and prevention of sexual assault. The Unit administers programs, and guides counselors and therapists throughout the school system. The programs are intended for pupils and educators, from kindergarten to high school. The Unit ran several programs during 2014, aimed, inter alia, at the prevention of trafficking in persons and prostitution of minors.

The MOH

36. Programs and projects are operated by the medical team of the Levinsky Clinic (for more information please see p.56 of the Initial Report). The Clinic offers support and counseling on matters relating to sex, sexually transmitted diseases, sexuality and sexual relationships, and also organizes explanatory meetings and workshops outside the Clinic, such as in schools, military units and educational frameworks. For example:

The Safe-Sex.co.il Website

37. This website is intended for teenagers and adolescents and provides information on sexual diseases and HIV. The website is promoted on social networks used by teenagers and adolescents. The website includes an open Q&A forum, where teenagers can pose questions.

The Levinsky Clinic Hotline

38. The Hotline's purpose is to provide counseling over the phone to anonymous callers, including persons at high risk of being infected, on issues related to sexuality in general, and more specifically on protected sexual relations and prevention of sexual diseases. The caller receives professional information and advice that may reduce the caller's fears, and encourage him/her to come to the clinic for a medical examination or treatment. In 2014, 405 calls were received through the Hotline.

The program "Safe Sex – Physically and Mentally"

39. This program includes workshops, inter alia, for youth in distress and for their parents. Each workshop contains six meetings with professionals. In 2014, twenty-two (22) workshops were conducted, in which 85 teenagers and 130 professional participated.

The program "Safe sex in the Big City"

40. This is a preventive and explanatory program designed for teenagers. The program includes meetings in which information is provided to youth, and they are given the opportunity to explore their thoughts, and raise questions that they might have on sex and sexuality. In addition to the information provided to the participants on the related issues, a strong emphasis is placed on the values of human dignity and physical integrity, the importance of free choice over their sexual identity, and of their partners.

41. In addition, Levinsky operates several mobile clinics in different cities in Israel, providing initial medical care to the general population.

B. Measures Taken to Prevent Children from Becoming Victims of Offenses under the Optional Protocol with regard to Children in Vulnerable Situations

The IPS

42. Minors in juvenile detention are held in "Ofek" facility (boys) and "Neve Tirtza" (girls). As mentioned above, the IPS has an organized training program for staff that work in detention facilities of juveniles, which covers identifying different situations of distress. In most of the cases the minors do not share or request any assistance on issues that are listed under the protocol and so the staff mainly relies on information provided by the municipal social services where the minors resided. However, the IPS treatment of violence program (the "Ethan Project"), serves as a professional platform for minors to discuss and share violent and traumatic experiences, both as offenders and as victims. In Ofek facility one minor who is a victim of prostitution received a specialized treatment tailored for his needs. In Neve Tirtza there are usually only one or two female minors a year, therefore it is

impossible to have long-term group treatment suitable for these minors' age. Nonetheless, there is individual, specialized treatment tailored to the minors' needs.

The MPS Society and Crime Prevention Division – Metzila

43. Metzila developed fourteen (14) different projects referring to different communities and target audiences in Israel, in sixteen (16) local authorities and boarding schools addressing issues related to the offenses listed under the Protocol. One of the prominent issues that Metzila addresses is reducing violence against women and girls. For example, Metzila developed a model to reduce violence amongst adolescent couples and it runs programs in schools to teach adolescents about healthy, non-abusive relationships. In addition to school programs, many activities and events are held, inter alia, for vulnerable populations such as new immigrants and minority groups, which promote female empowerment and aim to prevent violence against women.

44. In addition, Metzila initiated a project entitled "Preventing Violence against Women through Female Empowerment". In this framework, Metzila operates a variety of programs aimed at empowering girls in institutions for young girls at risk (for example girls' institutions, boarding schools, local community centers) across Israel. During 2015, 800 young girls participated in this project. The project focuses on strengthening the self-esteem and confidence of the young girls, improving their body language awareness, developing skills of self-defense and educating them in order to reduce dangerous behaviour, violence and eating disorders. These goals are achieved through different programs and courses conducted by social-workers, professional instructors and educational staff. For example, there are dance groups, sport classes (gymnastics, ballet classes, aerobics and more), theatre groups, informative courses (for prevention of violence, use of drugs and alcohol), workshops (on lifestyle, intimacy, food disorders), extreme sports, lectures, as well as group counseling sessions.

45. *For mechanisms to identify and detect children and in particular children who are at particular risk of becoming victims of any of the offenses under the Optional Protocol please see in our response to Question #13.*

Question 9

46. There is no indication of a problem of child sex tourism, inside Israel or by Israeli tourists abroad. No Israeli national was prosecuted and/or convicted under the extra-territorial provisions for traveling to other countries to engage in child sex tourism. Although Israel does not have any monitoring mechanism, the Ministry of Tourism, the MOJ and the Authority for the Advancement of Women has taken action to tackle the issue of sex tourism within Israel and to raise awareness on the subject within the tourism industry. For example, the "Responsible Tourism" seminar.(see our response to Question #7).

47. Furthermore, during 2014, the Minister of Tourism lobbied for the Israeli Tourist and Travel Agents Association to endorse the Global Code for Ethics in Tourism (hereinafter: the "Ethics Code"). Following the Minister's appeal, the Association announced, on January 22, 2014, that it adopted the Ethics Code. The Ministry of Tourism held several meetings with MOJ officials, in order to discuss and coordinate efforts towards the prevention of trafficking in persons. On January 14, 2015, at a conference for the development of the tourism industry, an official from the Ministry of Tourism's legal department gave a lecture on "trafficking in women and tourism" to professionals in this field.

Question 10

48. Israel did not encounter any cases of sale of children, in any form; however, the relevant government authorities are involved in different activities focused on prevention of such a phenomenon, through regulation of overseas surrogacy and by public awareness campaigns.

A. Regulation

49. The regulation of granting status for a newborn in Israel, following an overseas surrogacy, includes a meticulous process aimed at preventing the sale of children, as well as preventing other forms of exploitation or trafficking of the surrogate mother and the child. It requires a twofold judicial process, to which the Attorney General is a party, in his/her capacity as legal representative of the State of Israel:

1. Entering Israel and receiving Israeli citizenship

- A newborn's status in Israel is granted when genetic connection to the Israeli citizen-parent is proven, in accordance with Section 4(a)(2) of the Citizenship Law 5712-1952 (hereinafter: the "Citizenship Law"), which provides that every person who was born outside of Israel, will be granted Israeli citizenship from the moment of his/her birth if his/her father or mother is an Israeli citizen.
- In order to prove the genetic connection between the newborn and the Israeli citizen, a request for conducting a genetic test should be filed with a Family Matters Court in Israel, in accordance with the Genetic Information Law 5761-2000. The State of Israel conditions its approval of such a test on the plaintiff presenting both the factual and legal aspects of the case to the court and proving, among other things, that the surrogacy procedure conducted abroad was legal according to the foreign state's law. Thus, the State requires (a) medical documents affirming the IVF procedure and the origin of the genetic material (both sperm and egg); (b) the surrogacy agreement; (c) proof of consent of the birth mother for the permanent removal of the newborn child from that state and for conducting a genetic test.
- The test is required to be provided in a deposition authenticated by a diplomatic or consular representative of the State of Israel after a consulate employee has identified the birth mother; (d) a duly authenticated birth certificate; (e) proof of the legality of a surrogacy procedure in the foreign state in which it was conducted and proof of the legality of the specific procedure.
- If the result of the genetic test affirms that there is a genetic connection between the newborn and the Israeli citizen, the newborn will be granted Israeli citizenship on the grounds of birth to an Israeli citizen.
- In cases where the genetic test result shows that there is no genetic connection between the newborn and the Israeli citizen, the State of Israel works towards finding judicial solutions through the Israeli Courts. This process is made fully transparent to the foreign country in which the surrogacy process was conducted.

2. Judicial Parenthood Order for the spouse of the genetic parent

50. If the genetic parent has a spouse that is interested in forming parenthood relations with the child, the spouse requests a Judicial Parenthood Order from a Family Matters Court in Israel. This process also entails proof of the legality of the surrogacy procedure according to the domestic law of the country in which it took place. A number of requirements in the surrogacy agreement need to be met and made clear to the surrogate in her own native language. The requirements include a reasonable payment arrangement, the

date of signature by the parties prior to the fertilization process, the surrogate mother's voluntary consent to be a surrogate prior to the process, and other terms regarding the rights of the surrogate mother.

B. Raising Public Awareness and Prevention Efforts

51. The NATU is an active participant in all the discussions regarding the legislation and policy of overseas surrogacy with government officials. In addition, it leads public relation and information activities on the issue of legal overseas surrogacy, for example: the NATU initiated a meeting with representatives of the LGBT community including with the NGO "Gay Dads" who are promoting surrogacy abroad, and with professors from academia. The purpose of the meeting was to deliver the message that though surrogacy abroad is generally legal and does not constitute trafficking in persons, it is important to be aware of several issues in order to prevent situations of exploitation that might arise in the drafting of the contract. A few lectures were conducted by NATU on the subject, including a lecture on trafficking in persons and another on surrogacy, as part of a day-seminar for attorneys. In addition, the NATU assisted the NGO "Responsible Surrogacy" in providing information and instructions on different issues for their website.

C. The Mor-Yossef Committee

52. In 2010, a public committee was appointed by the Director General of the MOH, in order to conduct a comprehensive examination of the existing arrangements in the field of fertility and birth in Israel. The committee, headed by Prof. Mor-Yossef, delivered its concluding observations in May 2012, which included an advisory opinion of the NATU annexed to the report. Its concluding observations dedicated a chapter to overseas surrogacy and it recommended, inter alia, pursuing an international regulation of surrogacy; surrogacy conducted abroad will be conducted in clinics authorized by an inter-ministerial committee, which will examine the surrogacy agreement and the foreign law in the relevant country; and that the biological parent of a child that was born of surrogacy will be identified only if a genetic link can be proven between the child and at least one of the parents.

Question 11

53. There were no developments in this field since the submission of the Initial Report, except for a mutual legal assistance agreement which was signed between Israel and India in 2014. For relevant cases that were recently handed down by the Israeli Courts, which entailed international cooperation, please see Annex III.

Question 12

54. Section 2 of the Law of Evidence Revision (Protection of Children) 5715-1955 (hereinafter: the "Protection of Children Law") provides that an approval of a Child-Investigator must be given in order for a child (under the age of 14) to testify in court, with regard to certain offenses listed under the Law, that were conducted against his/her body or in his/her presence or when the child is suspected of committing such an offense. A Child-Investigator is a specialized investigator trained in working with children, appointed by the Minister of Justice following consultation with a designated professional committee.

55. In addition, child testimony that was given during an investigation may be admissible as evidence in court, thus exempting the child from testifying.

56. The Law further provides that a Child-Investigator may condition child testimony in court, with regard to certain offenses listed under the Law, under certain terms that are listed under the Law, such as: testifying without the presence of the defendant (but in the presence of his/her attorney), testifying from a location other than the witness stand, testifying when the judge and the attorneys are not dressed in formal court attire.

57. The list of offenses enumerated in the Protection of Children Law includes several offenses under the Protocol:

- Offering, delivering or accepting, by any means, a child for the purpose of sexual exploitation (Article 3 (1)(a)(i)(a) of the Protocol): Section 199 of the Penal Law (procurement); Section 203 of the Penal Law (inducing a person for prostitution under aggravated circumstances), Section 203C of the Penal Law (consuming prostitution services from a minor).
- Offering, delivering or accepting, by any means, a child for the purpose of transfer of organs of the child for profit or for the purpose of engagement of the child in forced labour (Article 3 (1)(a)(i)(b-c) of the Protocol): Section 377A(1),(4) of the Penal Law includes a trafficking in persons offense for the purpose of removing an organ from the person's body and for the purpose of engaging the child in forced labour. These sections are not listed under the Protection of Children Law, however their potential listing is currently under examination.
- Improperly inducing consent, as an intermediary, for the adoption of a child, in violation of applicable international legal instruments on adoption (Article 3(1)(a)(ii) of the Protocol): Section 364 of the Penal Law, provides that if a person offers or provides consideration in exchange for the permission to hold a minor who has not reached the age 14, or if he/she asks for, or receives, consideration in exchange for the permission to have possession of a minor, then he/she is liable to three years imprisonment. According to the Section, it is immaterial whether the consideration is cash or in some other kind. This Offense is listed under the Protection of Children Law.
- Offering, obtaining, procuring or providing a child for child prostitution (Article 3(1)(a)(ii)(b) of the Protocol): as mentioned above, Section 203 of the Penal Law (inducing in a person for prostitution under aggravated circumstances), Section 203C of the Penal Law (consuming prostitution services from a minor), are listed under the Protection of Children Law.
- Producing, distributing, disseminating, importing, exporting, offering, selling or possessing for the above purposes child pornography (Article 3(1)(a)(ii)(c) of the Protocol): Section 214(b) to the Penal Law, entitled obscene publication and display, i.e publishing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor, including a representation or a drawing of a minor, listed under the Protection of Children Law.
- Note, that with regard to trafficking in persons, including children, for the purpose of prostitution, although the offense is not listed under the Protection of Children Law, Section 2B(a) of the addendum to the Amendment of Procedure (Examination of Witnesses) Law 5718 - 1957, provides that the court may allow a minor to testify without the presence of the defendant.

Question 13

Mechanisms Established to Identify Child Victims of Sale, Prostitution and Pornography:

The MSS

- Appointed Youth Legal Social Workers of the MSS are trained to identify cases of sexual abuse in minors including cases of prostitution, and they work in collaboration with other government authorities including the Police. Over the last five (5) years, two (2) courses for training of Youth Legal Social Workers were opened every year. In 2013, for example, these social workers saw 49,000 children, 5,900 were referred for treatment due to sexual abuse.
- In addition, the MSS initiated activities in an attempt to locate children that are engaged in prostitution. Such programs include: (a) Street Search – a social worker, an instructor and a volunteer arrive at different locations to identify minors in prostitution; they contact them and try to rebuild the minors' trust in the system so that they will be able to help them exit the "cycle" of prostitution. (b) the "Open Space"(s): The Open Space in Tel Aviv-Jaffa is open 24 hours and it is aimed at providing "damage control" – an initial treatment and rehabilitation for minors engaged in prostitution. The Open Space provides hot-meals, shower, bed, counseling, legal assistance, all of which are provided by professional staff in a warm and accepting environment. The Open Space in Tel Aviv-Jaffa has an appointed team that is in charge of locating minors that are sexually exploited on the internet. Six (6) similar Open Spaces operate in other local authorities in Israel.

The State Attorney's Office

58. The identity of victims of offenses that involve pornographic materials displayed on the internet is unknown in most cases, and there are substantial difficulties in locating these victims; therefore, they are not often involved in the criminal process. In cases where a connection between offenders and victims was established through the internet, and includes pornographic materials of the victims, the Crime Victims' Units in the State Attorney's Office and in the District Attorney Offices, assist the victims to have their rights protected according to the Crime Victims' Rights Law 5761-2001 (hereinafter: the "Crime Victims' Rights Law").

59. In addition, as elaborated upon on page 15 of the Initial Report, the Penal Law includes specific provisions, which impose a duty to report (to a welfare officer or to the Police) on certain offenses inflicted on a minor that were committed by a person who is responsible for the minor (including a family member) (Section 368D). Such offenses include offenses that are listed under the Protocol. Violation of the duty to report constitutes a criminal offense, which is punishable by three months' imprisonment or six month if the offender is a professional or has responsibility for the minor. The obligation to report is stricter when it comes to professionals, in order to heighten the potential of identifying minors who become victims to harm, violence and sexual abuse.

The Police

60. The Police is involved in several projects aimed at locating and identifying sexual offenses committed against minors. For example, "Hofim Project" (Coasts) is a project aimed at preventing, treating and identifying prostitution by teenagers who often congregate in the coastal areas of Israel, such as in the cities of Eilat, Tel Aviv-Jaffa, and Tiberius. The target population of the project is minors and youth gathering in such places, mainly youth at risk and distress. The goal of this project is to offer a "safety net" for these

minors and offer them the needed care and services, following the task of proactively locating minors at risk. Recently the program was extended to include areas in the center of Jerusalem. The project is a result of cooperation between the MSS, the Ministry of Aliyah and Immigrants Absorption, the Ministry of Education, the Israeli Anti-drugs Authority, local authorities and the Police.

61. Additionally, since the internet has become a prominent arena for committing sexual offenses against minors, the Police has placed a concerted effort towards running information and educational activities for minors on the safe use of the internet. Furthermore, the Police CCD representatives are active partners in the National Internet Day, and a joint project with the Ministry of Education on the safe use of the internet is conducted in schools.

Measures Taken to Protect the Rights and Interests of Child Victims and Witnesses of Crimes under the Optional Protocol at all Stages of the Criminal Proceedings

62. Please see our comprehensive response on pages 42-55 of the Initial Report. Recent updates on this regard include:

63. The State Attorney's Office cooperates with the Israel National Council for the Child (NCC) and with the Association of Rape Crisis Centers in Israel in a joint project. The project includes accompanying minors during the criminal procedure, providing assistance and making sure that the minor has access to all the rights to which he/she is entitled to in criminal legal procedure. In addition, the project includes a center for religious families, providing specific psychological assistance for minors who are victims of sexual offenses and for their families.

64. On January 1, 2013, an amendment to the Center for Collection of Fines Law 5755-1995 entered into force. The amendment establishes that the State provide a sum up to 10,000 NIS (2,500 USD) for minors who were awarded compensation by the Court in the context of a criminal procedure. This compensation is a temporary remedy until it the money can be collected from the offender.

Information about Procedures Established and Measures Taken to Ensure the Safety and Integrity of Persons and/or Organizations Protecting Victims

65. Please see our reply on page 56, paragraph 92 of the Initial Report. Please note that the Witness Protection Authority, administered by the MPS, is designated with providing protection to witnesses under threat if the matter becomes necessary due to special circumstances surrounding a given case. Also note that the Police is responsible for the security arrangements in the shelters for victims of trafficking in persons.

Question 14

Rehabilitation Programs for minors engaged in prostitution

66. The MSS has specialized programs for the treatment and rehabilitation of minors who engage in prostitution. In the past, the MSS operated general rehabilitation programs for youth in distress who came from different circumstances and situations, in order to avoid stigmatization. In the last two years, the MSS has developed an additional program, which is a specialized rehabilitation program designed specifically for minors who have engaged in prostitution.

67. The "Universal" Programs are provided in the local community by social workers who specialize in the field of youth in distress, and by the staff of the Youth Protection

Authority in the MSS, who provide a network of authorized out-of-home options for at-risk teenagers.

68. The Unique Program is implemented through two main channels: First there is a project in cooperation with ELEM and the NGO Hut Hameshulash, which includes programs running in six different local authorities. Second, there is the Open Space project (see above on p.21). The projects include identifying and locating minors engaged in prostitution; initial assistance and “damage control”; referring victims to relevant bodies which provide services such as education, employment, legal aid, and psychological therapy.

Rehabilitation Housing Facilities for Youth

- Three (3) facilities for minor girls in Israel who were taken out of their homes due to severe circumstances of abuse, neglect and other factors: Tsofia – for initial emergency treatment; Mesila – for long term rehabilitation process; El Bustan – a designated facility for girls from the Arab population.
- Two (2) boarding schools for Jewish-orthodox girls.
- Two (2) treatment communities for drug addiction treatment for girls.
- Treatment facilities that are offered as an alternative for incarceration.
- Fourteen (14) hostels in the community, aimed at allowing for the girls to rehabilitate and reintegrate into the society.

69. In 2013, 626 girls stayed at the housing facilities for youth of the MSS. 88% of the girls were placed there due to sexual abuse. In all of those facilities, the girls are provided with treatment programs and psychological care. This includes specialized programs for girls who are victim of sexual abuse and prostitution. The Staff of those facilities receive training on treatment of victims of sexual offenses.

Emergency Services

70. The MSS operates emergency services for minors who were victim of sexual abuse – foster families, transitional homes, boarding schools. In addition, initial assistance is also provided in the Open Spaces (see above).

Special Treatment Centers for Child Victims who Suffered Sexual Abuse

71. In recent years, the MSS has established centers for the long-term treatment of children who were victims of sexual offenses. This is state-funded, professional treatment, in an easily accessible location. In regions where such centers do not exist, the Ministry has provided special funds for its District Offices, so that treatment can be provided in private clinics administered by professionals who are authorized by the State. Since the submission of the Initial Report, an additional Treatment Center was established, and today there are thirteen (13) centers across Israel.

Crisis Centers

72. As elaborated on p. 65-66 (section 224) of the Initial Report, the Assistance to Sex Violence Minor Crime Victims’ Law 5769-2008 establishes the right of a child victim of a sexual or violence crime to immediate assistance in a Crisis Center. The Crisis Centers, which are operated by the MSS, are intended to provide an initial treatment, which includes diagnosis and medical care; attention to immediate and essential needs of the victim, such as food and clothing; setting up a meeting with child investigator, police investigator, social worker or any other agent as needed based on the situation at hand; legal assistance,

medical and psychological care. Subsequently the victims are referred to the Treatment Centers which provide long-term rehabilitation treatment. Today, Six (6) Crisis Centers operate in different districts in Israel: Tel Aviv-Jaffa, Jerusalem, Be'er-Sheva, Haifa, Nazareth and in 2015, a center was established in Ashkelon. In 2014, 1653 children received treatment in the Crisis Centers. 1,333 of them were referred to the Crisis Centers due to suspicion of sexual assault.

Annexes

Annex I

Investigations²

Table 1

Child Prostitution Investigation Cases Initiated Between 2012-2015 – Disaggregated by Sex, Nationality, Residence³

<i>Total investigation cases initiated</i>	<i>Sex</i>			<i>Nationality</i>			<i>Residence</i>		
	<i>Male</i>	<i>Female</i>	<i>Unknown</i>	<i>Jewish</i>	<i>Non-Jewish</i>	<i>Unknown</i>	<i>Rural</i>	<i>Urban</i>	<i>Unknown</i>
70	18	51	2	58	12	2	2	67	1

Table 2

Child Prostitution Investigation Cases Initiated Between 2012-2015 – Disaggregated by Age⁴

<i>Total investigation cases initiated</i>	<i>Age 10</i>	<i>Age 11</i>	<i>Age 12</i>	<i>Age 13</i>	<i>Age 14</i>	<i>Age 15</i>	<i>Age 16</i>	<i>Age 17</i>	<i>Unknown</i>
70	1	3	1	9	20	22	16	8	14

Table 3

Child Pornography Investigation Cases Initiated Between 2012-2015 – Disaggregated by Sex, Nationality, Residence⁵

<i>Total investigation cases initiated</i>	<i>Sex</i>			<i>Nationality</i>			<i>Residence</i>		
	<i>Male victims</i>	<i>Female victims</i>	<i>Unknown</i>	<i>Jewish Victims</i>	<i>Non-Jewish Victims</i>	<i>unknown</i>	<i>Rural</i>	<i>Urban</i>	<i>Unknown</i>
341	53	257	51	247	54	51	13	319	9

² The date covers the period between 2012-2015. Last updated: 11.3.2015. Please note that the number under the section “Total” in each table marks the number of cases initiated between 2012-2015. However, each case might involve several victims, and, in some of the cases the victims can be of the same or different gender, age, religion or place of living. Therefore it is possible that the total number of cases might not accord with the total numbers of victims.

³ The information is disaggregated according to the victim.

⁴ The information is disaggregated according to the age of the victim.

⁵ The information is disaggregated according to the victim.

Table 4
Child Pornography Investigation Cases Initiated Between 2012-2015 – Disaggregated by Age

<i>Total investigation cases initiated</i>	<i>6</i>	<i>7</i>	<i>8</i>	<i>9</i>	<i>10</i>	<i>11</i>	<i>12</i>	<i>13</i>	<i>14</i>	<i>15</i>	<i>16</i>	<i>17</i>	<i>Unknown</i>
341	2	4	4	6	12	15	35	47	44	38	32	56	118

Table 5
Number of Cases Between 2012-2015 in Which an Indictment Was Submitted

<i>Year</i>	<i>Child Prostitution</i>	<i>Child Phonography</i>
2012	1	58
2013	11	23
2014	35	43
2015 ⁶	2	3
Total	49	127

⁶ Last updated: 11.3.2015.

Annex II

Prosecutions

A. Child Pornography Cases

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Indictment</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
Magistrate and District Court Cases				
Cr.C. 42667-02-15 Rishon-Le’Zion Magistrate Court	2015	The Defendant was charged with possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor. The Defendant had thousands of photos of minors, including nude photos of his daughter.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 50913-06-14 Ashkelon Magistrate Court	2014	The Defendant held in his possession a video of sexual offenses committed against a baby and distributed the video through his phone to his friends. He was charged with possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor. The victim’s identity is unknown.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to six months of community service.
Cr.C. 29356-11-14 Eilat Magistrate Court	2014	The indictment included offenses of possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor. The images included minors who were engaged in sexual acts with adults.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 41000-03-14 Beer-Shiva District Court	2014	The indictment included 12 charges of: indecent acts, sexual harassment and possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor. The case involved male minors aged between 12-16.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 2390-04-14 Rehovot Magistrate Court	2014	The indictment included one Defendant and one female victim age 12. The Defendant was charged with sexual offenses including possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor and sexual harassment. The Defendant contacted the victim through the internet, sent her photos containing sexual material and manipulated her to send him photos of her in nudity.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 41815-09-14 Rehovot Magistrate Court	2014	The indictment included 4 charges of sexual harassment, attempted sexual offenses and possessing and accessing obscene materials that includes the	The case is pending.	

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Indictment</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
		image of a minor. The Defendant held dozens of obscene photos of minors, who were not identified. The case was revealed by an undercover Police agent during Police intelligence operation.		
Cr.C. 14845-06-14 Petah-Tikva Magistrate Court	2014	The Defendant was charged with three charges of publication, and possession and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor.	The case is pending. The prosecution requested prison sentence.	
Cr.C. 63240-12-14	2014	The Defendant held in his possession dozens of pedophilia videos on his computer of obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 59088-09-14	2014	The Defendant held on his two computers obscene materials that included the image of a minor.		The case is pending.
Cr.C. 36460-01-14 Tiberius Magistrate Court	2014	The Defendant was charged with attempted indecent act, attempted sexual harassment and possessing and accessing obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to 20 months imprisonment and probation period.
Cr.C. 41998-10-14 Haifa Magistrate Court	2014	The Defendant was charged with possessing and accessing obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The case is pending.	
Criminal Case (Cr.C.) 51953-12-13 Ashqelon Magistrate Court	26.12.13	The indictment was submitted on 26.12.13 and included 4 defendants (born in '76, '66, '85 and '71 respectively) and 1 victim (born in '98). Defendant 1 was charged with sexual offenses that included possessing and accessing obscene materials that contains the image of a minor and sexual harassment. Defendant 2 and Defendant 3 were charged with sexual offenses including sexual harassment. Defendant 4 was charged with sexual offenses including forbidden intercourse by consent (Section 346(a) of the Penal Law 5737-1977, hereinafter: the Penal Law), and an indecent act in public before a person who has not yet reached age 16 (Section 349(b)) of the Penal Law, in a situation where the Defendant instructed the victim to commit sexual acts on herself, take pictures of herself during the act and send those pictures to the Defendant.	All the defendants were convicted.	Defendant 1 was sentenced to 18 months imprisonment. Defendant 2 was sentenced to eight months imprisonment, seven months conditional imprisonment and a fine. Defendant 3 was sentenced to 14 months imprisonment and seven month conditional imprisonment. Defendant 4 was sentenced to six months imprisonment, seven month conditional imprisonment for three (3) years and compensation to the victim.

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Indictment</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
Cr.C 26819-03-13 Be'er-Sheva Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor.	The parties reached a pleas bargain agreement and the Defendant was convicted.	
Cr.C. 2543-07-13 Ramla Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with the possessing and accessing obscene materials that includes the image of a minor. The Defendant had in his possession thousands of obscene videos and photos of minors, their identities are unknown.	The case is pending, and is scheduled for mediation.	
Cr.C. 11967-04-13 Kfar-Saba Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with three charges of attempted sexual offenses, and publication, possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor. The case was revealed by an undercover police agent during an intelligence operation.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 45765-12-13 Netanya Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with three charges of attempted sexual harassment. The Defendant conducted sexual conversations with a covert agent, who presented himself as a minor.	The Defendant was convicted within a plea bargain agreement in December 2014.	The Defendant was sentenced to two (2) months of community service, conditional imprisonment, and a fine. The Defendant is also required to meet a probation officer.
Cr.C. 3618-10-13 Nazareth Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with attempted publication of obscene materials that include the image of a minor and possession of obscene materials that include the image of a minor.	The Defendant was convicted.	The case is pending for sentencing.
Cr.C. 17016-12-13 Haifa Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant held in his possession 50 thousands files of obscene material including the images of minors on his computer, and exploited minors by taking their nude/obscene photos and publishing them; some of the photos were taken without the minors' knowledge. The victims were male and female minors. The indictment included several charges of indecent acts, possessing and accessing obscene materials that included the image of a minor, and publication of obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The case is pending.	

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Indictment</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
Cr.C. 50832-11-13 Haifa Magistrate Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor. The obscene material in his possession included images of adults committing sexual offenses against minors.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to six months of community service, conditional imprisonment and received a fine.
Cr.C. 2929-06-13 Haifa District Court	2013	The Defendant was charged with two (2) charges of committing sexual offenses and one charge of possessing and accessing obscene materials that included the image of a minor and publication of obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to 18 months of imprisonment, six years of community service and was ordered to pay monetary compensation to the victim.
Cr.C. 10269-08-12 Be'er-Sheva District Court	6.8.12	The indictment was submitted on 6.8.12. It included 14 charges against one defendant, six of the charges involved 4 minor-victims (born in '89, '94, '95 and '97).	NA	NA
Cr.C. 3484-05-12	2012	The Defendant contacted 11 and 15 year-old girls through the internet and propositioned them. He met one of the victims in person. The indictment included four (4) charges against the Defendant.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to 14 months imprisonment and ordered to pay compensation to one of the victims.
Cr.C. 3985-05-12	2012	The case was revealed by an intelligence agent during a police operation. The Defendant contacted the minor (the covert agent), using an online chat room and propositioned a minor. The Police found ten-thousands files of obscene materials that included the image of minors on his computer.	The Defendant was convicted within a plea bargain agreement.	Following a report of the Probation Service, the Court sentenced the Defendant to six months of community service and a conditional imprisonment.
Cr.C. 4090-05-12	2012	The case was revealed by an intelligence agent during a police operation. The Defendant used an online chat room and propositioned minors. The Police found on his computer thousands of obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The Defendant was convicted.	The defendant was sentenced to seven months imprisonment, conditional imprisonment and he was fined. The Defendant filed an appeal, the case is pending.
Cr.C. 3661-05-12	2012	The case was revealed by an intelligence agent during a police operation. The Defendant contacted minors by using an online chat-room and propositioned them. The Police found on his computer 14 files of obscene materials that include the image of a minor.	The Defendant was convicted within a plea bargain agreement.	The Defendant was sentenced to three months of community service.

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Indictment</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
Cr.C. 13343-05-12 Nazareth Magistrate Court	2012	The Defendant was charged with publication of obscene materials that included the image of a minor, possessing and accessing obscene materials that included the image of a minor, and advertising an obscenity, by using a minor for the presentation of it.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to ten months of conditional imprisonment for three years, and a fine.
Cr.C. 54911-03-12 Haifa District Court	2012	The Defendant was charged with publication of obscene materials that included the image of a minor, sexual harassment and blackmail by threats.	The case is pending.	
Cr.C. 45883-03-11 Be'er-Sheva District Court	2011	The indictment included 3 Defendants and 4 male victims. The Defendants were charged, inter alia, with committing acts of sodomy, indecent acts and obscene publication.	The Defendants were convicted within a plea bargain agreement.	Defendant 1 was sentenced to 9 years imprisonment; Defendant 2 was sentenced to 4 years imprisonment; Defendant 3 was sentenced to 13 months imprisonment.
Cr.C. 33236-10-11 Nazareth Magistrate Court	2011	The Defendant was charged with five charges of sexual offenses, sexual harassment, and possessing and accessing obscene materials that include the image of a minor.	The Defendant was convicted.	The Defendant was sentenced to six months of community service, conditional imprisonment and a fine.
Supreme Court Cases				
C.A. 6703/13 <i>Nissim Cohen v. The State of Israel</i>	2013	An appeal of the decision of the District Court, in which it convicted the Defendant and sentenced him to 15 month imprisonment, conditional imprisonment and required him to pay monetary compensation to the victim. The Defendant was charged with attempted indecent act, deception offenses and possessing and accessing obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The Court denied the appeal. The Court emphasized that the "virtual" offenses of the appellant did not revoke the strong implications and exploitation of the victims. The Court ruled that the potential damage is even higher in cyber offenses, due to the distribution and sharing potential, and emphasized the minors' right for privacy and human dignity.	The sentences remained 15 months imprisonment, probation period and compensation payment to the victim.
C.A. 512/13 <i>Anonymous v. The State of Israel</i>	2013	An appeal of the conviction of the District Court, in which the Defendant was indicted for sexual offenses committed on minors and for the publication of obscene materials that included the image of a minor.	The appeal was denied and the appellant was convicted.	30 months imprisonment; 12 months' probation and compensation for the victims.
Cr.A. 490/11, <i>The State of Israel v. Yafeem Gorivich</i>	2012	On January 10, 2012, the District Court of Nazareth rendered a judgment in an appeal on a case concerning the possession of child pornography. The Defendant was charged with multiple violations of possessing obscene material including images of minors. In this case, following an investigation	The Defendant was convicted.	The Nazareth Magistrate Court sentenced the Defendant to eight months' suspended imprisonment and fined him with 10,000 NIS (U.S \$ 2857). The State and the defendant both

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Date</i>	<i>Indictment</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
		request from INTERPOL, the Defendant's computer was searched and a large amount of child pornography was found. The Nazareth Magistrate Court found the Defendant guilty, despite the State's inability to prove that he had actually watched or distributed the material. The Court ruling stated that the offense required the mere possession of the material, regardless of actual use or distribution. The Court found that this interpretation stems from the purposes of the law, which includes prevention of the exploitation of minors, by deterring the potential consumption of such material.		appealed to the District Court, which extended the sentence by an additional six (6) months' imprisonment, to be served in community service. The District Court stressed the importance of sentences that create substantial deterrent, but took into account the Defendant's contribution to the community and his good behavior since the offenses were committed, and therefore did not impose the maximum penalty. A request for approval of an appeal on the sentence was denied by the Supreme Court; The Court rendered that the sentence was reasonable, considering the amount of material found on his computer.
C.A. 6357/11, <i>Braverman v. The State of Israel</i>	16.2.2012	The Court denied the appeal on the gravity of the sentence, and emphasized the importance of deterrence when it comes to sex crimes committed through the internet, saying that the court needs to send a clear message to those who are using the internet for criminal objectives and for perverse and offensive desires, and even more so when the internet is used for the purposes of reaching innocent minors and abusing them.	The appellant was convicted.	An appeal on the sentence was denied and the defendant was sentenced to 12 years imprisonment, two (2) years' probation for three (3) years and compensation to be paid to the victims.

B. Child Prostitution Cases

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Indictments</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Plea Bargain Reached and Reason for Plea Bargain</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
<i>The State of Israel v. Anonymous</i> (S.Cr.C, 8075/07, Jerusalem District Court)		In December 2008, the Jerusalem District Court convicted a woman of exploiting minors for prostitution with aggravating circumstances, namely, an offense committed by a person responsible for the minor (Section 203B(c) of the Penal Law).		The defendant was sentenced to five years imprisonment and one year suspended imprisonment, and she was fined NIS 30,000 (U.S. \$ 7,894)
<i>The State of Israel v. Ben Moha</i> (S.Cr.C. 605/09, Jerusalem District Court)		On October 18, 2009, the Jerusalem District Court convicted a defendant who had solicited two (2) teenage girls to have intercourse with men inside his apartment in exchange for money. The Court convicted the defendant of exploiting minors for prostitution (Section 203B (A) (1) of the Penal Law) and for influencing the girls to use dangerous drugs (Section 21 to the Dangerous Drugs Ordinance).		The Court sentenced the defendant to 15 months imprisonment and four (4) months suspended imprisonment.
<i>The State of Israel v. Michael Praver</i> (Cr.C., 20510/09, Petah Tikva Magistrate Court)		In August 2010, the Petah Tikva Magistrate Court convicted a defendant on three (3) different counts: 1) maintaining a place for purposes of prostitution (Section 204 of the Penal Law); 2) prostitution and obscenity (Section 199(A) (2) of the Penal Law); and 3) exploitation of minors for prostitution (Section 203B (A) (1) of the Penal Law). The defendant was found guilty of operating a massage parlor and “employing” a 16-year-old girl		The defendant was sentenced to ten (10) months imprisonment.
<i>The State of Israel v. Meir Ammar</i> (Cr.C. 879/09, Be'er-Sheva District Court)	The defendant was charged with attempted inducement to engage in prostitution, consuming prostitution services of a minor and indecent acts against minors.	After reviewing the evidence, the Court acquitted the defendant of the charge of attempted inducement to engage in prostitution, and convicted him of indecent acts and consuming prostitution services of a minor.		The defendant was sentenced to six (6) months' imprisonment, to be served in community service, suspended imprisonment, ordered to pay 5,000 NIS (U.S. \$1,315) as compensation to the victim and fined 400 NIS (U.S. \$105).

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Indictments</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Plea Bargain Reached and Reason for Plea Bargain</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
<i>The State of Israel v. Anonymous</i> [Cr.A. 3212/11, appealing S.Cr.C. 44880-05-10 (Tel Aviv-Jaffa) District Court [<i>The State of Israel v. Shay Arviv</i>]]	The defendant was charged with several counts of exploiting minors for prostitution, attempted exploitation of minors for prostitution under aggravated circumstances, pandering of minors, exploiting minors for prostitution under aggravated circumstances, and subjecting a minor to dangerous drugs	The defendant was convicted on several counts of exploiting minors by way of inducing minors to prostitution under aggravated circumstances, exploiting minors by way of inducing minors to prostitution, pandering of minors and multiple counts of supplying drugs to minors.	The parties reached a plea bargain agreement. Reason: Avoiding the involvement and testimony of the minors in the trial.	The defendant was sentenced to five (5) years imprisonment, suspended imprisonment and fined NIS 10,000 (U.S. \$2,631). The State Attorney's Office filed an appeal against the leniency of the sentence. The appeal was accepted and the Supreme Court added three (3) years to the sentence imposed by the District Court. The final sentence is eight years' imprisonment.
<i>The State of Israel v. Anonymous</i> (Cr.C. 32644-05-11, Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court)	In May 2011, the two defendants were charged with various counts of inducing a minor to prostitution, pandering of minor, sexual offenses against minors (sodomy and indecent acts) and other offenses. The defendants are also minors.	Defendant 1 was convicted of sodomy. Defendant 2 was convicted of pandering, sodomy, assault and two (2) counts of threats.	The parties reached a plea bargain agreement. Reasons: Lack of sufficient evidence as well as the personal circumstances of the defendants. Furthermore, in order to avoid the involvement and testimony of minors, who were reluctant to be exposed.	On March 6, 2013, Defendant 2 was sentenced to 18 months imprisonment, suspended imprisonment and he was ordered to pay 5,000 NIS (U.S. \$1,111) in compensation to one of the complainants. On June 24, 2013, Defendant 1 was sentenced to six (6) months imprisonment, to be served in community service, suspended imprisonment and he was ordered to pay 2,000 NIS (U.S. \$444) in compensation to one of the complainants.
<i>The State of Israel v. Moshe Veitzman</i> (Cr.C. 33600-01-13, Tel Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate Court)	A related case to Cr.C. 33670-01-13. In January 2013, the defendant was charged with consuming prostitution services of a minor (multiple cases), pursuant to Section 203C of the Penal Law, and attempted indecent act.		The parties reached a plea bargain agreement: the indictment was amended and the charges of attempted indecent act were removed. Reasons: the defendant did not have previous convictions; the relationship	On November 21, 2013, the defendant was sentenced to five (5) months of imprisonment, to be served as community service, and he was fined 2,000 NIS (U.S. \$444). In addition, the defendant was required to sign a commitment that for the period of the suspended sentence (two years and six (6) months) he will

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Indictments</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Plea Bargain Reached and Reason for Plea Bargain</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
			between the defendant and the complainant almost amounted to a relationship between spouses. Moreover, the complainant introduced herself, at first, as 19 years old.	not commit a sexual offense. He was required to provide a guarantee of 2,000 NIS (U.S. \$444)
<i>The State of Israel v. Ortal Hemo and Aa'id Salama et. al.</i> (Cr.C. 33670-01-13, Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court).	<p>On January 2013, the defendants were charged with the following offenses:</p> <p>Defendant 1: inducing a minor to prostitution, threats, and insulting a public servant.</p> <p>Defendant 2: inducing a minor to prostitution, consuming prostitution services from a minor and attempted inducement of a minor to prostitution.</p>	<p>According to the plea bargain, Defendant 1 was convicted of inducing a minor to prostitution.</p> <p>Defendant 2 was convicted of inducing a minor to prostitution, attempted inducement of a minor to prostitution and consuming prostitution services from a minor.</p>	The parties reached a plea bargain agreement.	<p>On November 7, 2013, Defendant 1 was sentenced to seven (7) months imprisonment, suspended imprisonment and a conditional fine of 5,000 NIS (U.S. \$1,250).</p> <p>On May 28, 2014 Defendant 2 was sentenced to eighteen (18) months imprisonment, suspended imprisonment, fined with 2,200 NIS (U.S. \$550) and ordered to pay 50,000 NIS (U.S. \$12,500) in compensation to the complainants.</p>
<i>The State of Israel v. Zion Abutbul</i> (Cr.C. 33632-01-13 Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court).	A related case to the abovementioned indictment (33670-01-13). The defendant was charged in January 2013 with consuming prostitution services from a minor (multiple cases) and attempted rape (two (2) incidents).	According to the plea bargain, the defendant was convicted, on September 19, 2013, of indecent act and consuming prostitution services from a minor.	<p>The parties reached a plea bargain agreement.</p> <p>Reasons: lack of cooperation with the prosecution by the complainant and her lack of willingness to testify in Court. Moreover, the evidence indicates that the defendant terminated his actions when the complainant asked him to.</p>	On March 31, 2014 the defendant was sentenced to six (6) months imprisonment to be served in community service, suspended imprisonment and ordered to pay 25,000 NIS (U.S. \$6,250) in compensation to the complainant.

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Indictments</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Plea Bargain Reached and Reason for Plea Bargain</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
<i>The State of Israel v. Alberto Levin</i> (Cr.C. 33544-01-13, Tel Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate Court)	A related case to the abovementioned indictment (33670-01-13). The defendant was charged with consuming prostitution services from a minor (multiple cases).	According to the plea bargain, the defendant was convicted, on June 16, 2013, of consuming prostitution services from a minor.	The parties reached a plea bargain and the indictment was amended. Reasons: evidentiary difficulty and the fact the defendant did not have prior convictions.	On September 7, 2014 the defendant was sentenced to six (6) month imprisonment that could be served in community service, suspended imprisonment, fined 1,000 NIS (U.S. \$250) and ordered to pay conditional fine of 2,000 NIS (U.S. \$500).
<i>The State of Israel v. Anonymous et. al.</i> (Cr.C. 59784-10-10, Tel Aviv-Jaffa Magistrate Court) Appealing <i>Anonymous v. The State of Israel</i> , Cr.A. 39295-01-14, Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court)	On October 2010, the two (2) defendants were charged with exploiting minors for prostitution. On November 9, 2010, pursuant to the recommendation of the Court and due to evidentiary difficulty in the case of Defendant 2, his indictment was amended to include only consuming prostitution services of a minor.	On October 20, 2013, Defendant 1 was convicted and Defendant 2 was acquitted (in light of the circumstances of the cases, the Court was not convinced that Defendant 2 was aware of the age of the minor).		On December 15, 2013, Defendant 1 was sentenced to 12 months imprisonment, suspended imprisonment, fined with 5,000 NIS (U.S. \$1,250) and the Court ordered him to pay 15,000 NIS (U.S. \$3,750) in compensation to the complainant. On February 2014 Defendant 1 filed an appeal to the District Court against his conviction and for a mitigation of his sentence. The defendant chose to withdraw the appeal. The Court reduced the defendant's sentence to nine (9) months imprisonment instead of twelve (12) months imprisonment. The fine and compensation as determined by the trial court remained unchanged.
<i>The State of Israel v. Dan Ben Chaim and Daniel</i> (Ben Gal) Ben Zaken et. al. (S.Cr.C. 24692-04-14 Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court).	On April 2014 the defendants were charged with exploitation of minors for prostitution and consuming prostitution services from a minor.	According to the plea bargain, Defendant 1 was convicted of consuming prostitution services from a minor. The parties agreed that Defendant 1 would deposit 18,000 NIS (U.S. \$4,500) before sentencing, as compensation to the three (3) complainants (6,000 each).	The parties reached a plea bargain. Reasons: evidentiary difficulties in establishing that the defendants were aware of the complainants' age. Furthermore, there	On December 31, 2014 Defendant 1 was convicted in the amended indictment. A sentencing hearing has been scheduled for March 3, 2015. With regard to Defendant 1 it was decided by the parties to recommend

<i>Court Case</i>	<i>Indictments</i>	<i>Convictions</i>	<i>Plea Bargain Reached and Reason for Plea Bargain</i>	<i>Sentence</i>
			were concerns regarding the possible stigmatization of the complainants if they were to testify in court.	twelve (12) months imprisonment and suspended imprisonment according to the Court's discretion. The case is pending. With regard to Defendant 2 the negotiations for a plea bargain are still ongoing. The case is pending.
<i>The State of Israel v. Viacheslav Sandrin</i> (Cr.C. 19862-07-14, Rehovot Magistrate Court).	On July 2014 the defendant was charged with several cases of consuming prostitution services from a minor, indecent act performed with a minor, sexual harassment of a minor, sexual harassment, attempted consuming prostitution services from a minor, publishing an obscene publication that included the image of a minor and the sale of intoxicating beverage to a minor.	According to the plea bargain agreement, the defendant was convicted, on November 23, 2014, of several cases of consuming prostitution services from a minor, indecent act against a minor, sexual harassment of a minor, publishing an obscene publication that included the image of a minor, possessing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor and the sale of intoxicating beverage to a minor.	The parties reached a plea bargain agreement. Reasons: evidentiary difficulties.	The Case is pending.
<i>The State of Israel v. Eliyahu Zeitun et. al.</i> (Cr.C. 58050-11-14, Ramla Magistrate Court).	On November 2014, the five (5) defendants were charged with consuming prostitution services from a minor, exploiting a minor for prostitution and engaging in forbidden intercourse by consent.			The case is pending.
<i>The State of Israel v. Shlomo Adari</i> (Cr.C. 28275-06-14 Jerusalem Magistrate Court).	On June 2014, the defendant was charged with consuming prostitution services from a minor.			The case is pending.

Annex III

Cases regarding trafficking in children

The State of Israel v. Ness (S.Cr.C. 10836-05-13, Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court)

1. In May 2013, an indictment was filed against the Defendant and he was charged with trafficking in persons (multiple charges), rape, indecent act (multiple charges), publishing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor (multiple charges), utilizing the body of a minor in order to advertise an obscenity (multiple charges) and possessing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor (multiple charges). The Defendant was convicted and sentenced to sixteen (16) years imprisonment, suspended imprisonment, and 100,000 NIS (25,000 USD) and compensation was awarded to the complainant.

2. The Defendant is an Israeli citizen who met on the internet a mother (who was convicted as well) and her 10 years old daughter (the victim) who live in Georgia. The Defendant developed an online relation with the mother and later, upon his arrival to Georgia, he met the mother and her daughter. He bought gifts for the child and transferred money from Israel for the mother and daughter. Subsequently, the Defendant and the mother reached an agreement according to which he would pay her monthly payments of \$100 and in exchange she would allow him to use her daughter's body for the production of pornographic material and for committing sexual acts against the child. The Defendant met with the mother and the daughter in the hotel in Tbilisi and took obscene photos of the child, sexually assaulted her while visually recording the acts with several cameras. The Defendant gave the mother a camera and a laptop so she could produce pedophilia photos of the child at his will. The mother emailed the photos to the defendant and he paid her. The Defendant published and sold the photos and films. Additionally, the Defendant held in his possession many obscene materials of other minors, which he also published.

3. The submission of the indictment as well as the prosecution were conducted jointly by the Israeli and Georgian authorities, following information they received from the United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement. An investigation determined that the Defendant had been creating and distributing pornographic materials. Israel's State Attorney's Office issued a request for legal assistance from the Georgian authorities that included taking possession of a camera and computer that contained information of the victim, identifying the hotels where the offenses were believed to have taken place, sending recordings of conversations with the victim's mother, and allowing an Israeli computer expert to join the investigation. The investigation was effective and revealed information on websites and networks used by the Defendant that enabled him to carry out his crimes. The evidence in the case included materials that were collected both in Israel and in Georgia; and the mother and the daughter were questioned and gave written statements. The Georgian authorities arrested the mother and subsequently she was sentenced to eleven (11) years imprisonment. Her testimony in the Israeli Court was given through a video-conference.

4. On January 15, 2015 the Tel Aviv-Jaffa District Court convicted the Defendant on all charges. The Court ruled that according to the strong evidence in this case it was proven that the child was passed from hand to hand: from her mother to the Defendant as if she was an object, and therefore the element of "a transaction in a person", as required by the offense of trafficking in persons according to Israeli Penal law, was met. The daughter was objectified. According to the Court, the objectification, and making a use of a person, need not be permanent and does not even require a long period of time, but can occur for a short

period of time. Also, the transaction in a person, and the objectification of a person, do not need to involve the displacement of the victim from his/her place of residence, as long as they occur for one of the purposes mentioned in the offense (in this case, trafficking in persons for the purpose of “causing him/her to participate in an obscene publication or in an obscene performance”). Finally, the Court accepted the State Attorney’s Office’ argument, according to which the crime of trafficking in persons involves a wide range of situations that are not necessarily contingent upon a place, consent nor compensation, and that clearly the circumstances of the case showed that a transaction was made between the mother of the victim and the Defendant, a transaction whose purpose was to make use of the minor’s body as an object, both for the Defendant’s sexual desires and for trading in the photos of the minor.

The State of Israel v. Sandrin (Cr.C. 19862-07-14, Rehovot Magistrate Court)

5. On November 23, 2014, the Defendant, an Israeli citizen, was convicted (within a plea bargain agreement) of several cases of consuming prostitution services with a minor, indecent act against a minor, sexual harassment of a minor, publishing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor, possessing an obscene publication that includes the image of a minor and the sale of intoxicating beverage to a minor.

6. The investigation in Israel began following a request from the Russian law enforcement authorities, after intense activity by the Defendant on a very popular Russian website called “VKontakte”. On this website, various games can be played in exchange for “virtual currency”, which must be acquired through real currency. The investigation revealed that, between 2012-2014, the Defendant propositioned young teenage boys, from both Israel and abroad, to masturbate in front of a computer camera while he watched, and that in exchange, he would purchase virtual currency for them. The boys gave their consent and the defendant paid them in virtual currency, in exchange for their willingness to masturbate in front of the computer camera, which he watched through his computer.

7. The State Attorney’s Office issued, in June and July 2014, requests for legal assistance from Russian and Ukrainian authorities, respectively. The requests included obtaining the testimonies of the victims and their parents, information from various computers, cameras, bank accounts and cell-phones, and locating one of the defendant’s victims. In addition, the requests included the involvement of Israeli computer experts in the course of the investigation.

8. It is important to note the precedential aspect of this case: though there was no physical contact between the defendant and the minors, the State Attorney’s Office decided to charge the Defendant with consuming prostitution services from a minor because he paid for a virtual act of prostitution.

9. The case is pending.
