

## International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination

Distr.: General 23 August 2019

Original: English

## Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination Ninety-ninth session

**Summary record of the 2753rd meeting** Held at the Palais des Nations, Geneva, on Thursday, 15 August 2019, at 3 p.m.

Chair: Mr. Amir

## Contents

Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention (*continued*)

Combined twenty-third and twenty-fourth periodic reports of Mongolia

This record is subject to correction. Corrections should be set forth in a memorandum and also incorporated in a copy of the record. They should be sent within one week of the date of the present record to the Documents Management Section (DMS-DCM@un.org).

Any corrected records of the public meetings of the Committee at this session will be reissued for technical reasons after the end of the session.





The meeting was called to order at 3 p.m.

**Consideration of reports, comments and information submitted by States parties under article 9 of the Convention** (*continued*)

Combined twenty-third and twenty-fourth periodic reports of Mongolia (CERD/C/MNG/23-24 and CERD/C/MNG/Q/23-24)

1. At the invitation of the Chair, the delegation of Mongolia took places at the Committee table.

2. **Mr. Bilguun** (Mongolia) said that cooperation and dialogue with the Committee played a key role in his Government's efforts to bring national legislation into conformity with the Convention, raise public awareness of racial discrimination and implement relevant policies and actions. During the period under review, several domestic laws had been amended and new legislation had been enacted to support implementation of the Convention.

3. The new Criminal Code prohibited discrimination in judicial proceedings on grounds of national origin, language, race, age, gender, social origin, wealth, occupation, official position, religion, sexual orientation and gender identity, disability, opinion and level of education. It also provided for equality before the law of all legal entities, without distinction as to property, revenue, area of activity or form of business. The Law on Civil Service established a legal obligation for civil servants not to discriminate in the delivery of public services on any grounds.

4. The National Programme on Improving Public Legal Education sought to improve legal literacy and awareness of human rights, and a special programme on the same subject had been designed for persons with disabilities and children. By mid-2019, 424 persons, including civil servants, had been trained under the programme. In addition, online and video-based training on legal issues was available to civil servants and the general public. The Programme had received State and municipal funding in the amount of 357 million tugriks in 2018 and 40 million tugriks from the State budget in 2019. Additional funding had come from international development cooperation agencies.

5. An independent body dedicated to combating human trafficking and prostitution had been established within the criminal department of the National Police Agency in order to implement the Law on Combating Human Trafficking and the associated national programme. Over the past three years, the State had allocated 95 million tugriks to non-governmental organizations (NGOs) working against human trafficking. Training courses had been held for police officers, court officials, prosecutors, and border control and immigration officials. As a result, public awareness had increased and several cases of human trafficking had been investigated, prosecuted and punished.

6. A special unit had been set up within the Independent Authority against Corruption to implement the National Anti-Corruption Programme. In 2017, the unit had conducted a baseline survey of State and municipal bodies in 21 municipalities, 99 soums (administrative units) and the capital and, on that basis, it had issued recommendations on the implementation of the Programme. By the end of 2018, 61 per cent of State institutions and 40 per cent of municipal institutions had implemented the recommendations. To increase transparency and accountability, the Independent Authority against Corruption had also set up a hotline, which had received 249 calls in 2018. Taking on board successful practices from other countries, the Government had set up citizen oversight units that received complaints and provided legal information and counselling. The Public Centre set up in December 2017 facilitated the engagement of the general public, the private sector and governmental and non-governmental entities with regard to anti-corruption activities. The Centre held regular training courses for civil servants and had created a database for use in the National Anti-Corruption Programme. The Programme had received funding in the amount of 2 billion tugriks from the State budget in 2018.

7. Following an evaluation in 2018, the Government had decided to continue a programme designed to restore reindeer farming and improve farmers' living standards. The evaluation had found that the support provided to reindeer farmers in the areas of

education, health and social welfare had been implemented successfully. Efforts in the areas of tourism and fishery, indigenous culture and small- and medium-sized enterprise development had proven less successful. It had emerged that the reindeer herders of the taiga continued to require support, and the regulation governing welfare disbursements to the Dukha people of the taiga had been amended to meet their needs. The amended regulation provided for a triennial subsidy for Dukha people living in Tsagaan nuur soum, Khuvsgul Province, wishing to visit their relatives in the nearby Tyva Republic of the Russian Federation; envisaged stepping up Tyva language teaching and teacher training; and called for the timely delivery of Government policies, programmes and services to reindeer herders in remote areas. Implementation of the programme had led to a significant increase in reindeer herds.

8. The State party's comprehensive legal framework established provisions against 16 types of discrimination based on race, ethnicity, language, colour, age, sex, social origin and status, property and assets, occupation and official position, religion, sexual orientation and gender identity, disability, opinion and education. In order to implement those provisions, and thus the Convention, efforts to promote understanding and acceptance of multilingualism, cultural diversity and shared values must be stepped up. The Government was committed to supporting positive actions through public education policies, with support from the Committee and other international entities.

9. Mongolia had 18 officially registered NGOs. Draft legislation had been prepared to amend the Law on Non-Governmental Organizations in order to prohibit discrimination on grounds of race, ethnicity, language, colour, age, sex, social origin and status, property and assets, occupation and official position, religion, disability, sexual orientation and gender identity in the exercise of NGO activities. Any violation of those provisions by an organization would lead to its dissolution.

10. Hate speech was addressed in an article of the Constitution and criminalized in the Criminal Code, the Law on Administrative Offences, the Law on Advertising, the Law on Freedom of the Media and the Law on Public Broadcasting. To date, there had been no legislation protecting the rights and interests of foreign workers in Mongolia or Mongolian workers abroad, and no law providing legal remedy against violations of their rights. To address that shortcoming, the labour legislation had been reviewed in order to bring it into line with international standards, for example by establishing an obligation for employers of migrant workers to set up mechanisms to ensure observance of labour standards at the workplace. Accession to the International Labour Organization (ILO) Labour Inspection Convention, 1947 (No. 81), the ILO Labour Inspection (Agriculture) Convention, 1969 (No. 129) and the Protocol to the ILO Forced Labour Convention, 1930 (No. 29) was under consideration.

11. Several legislative amendments had been submitted for parliamentary approval. Among other things, they were aimed at bringing the functioning of the National Human Rights Commission into line with the principles relating to the status of national institutions (Paris Principles), establishing the right to legal aid for foreign nationals and stateless persons and aligning the Family Law and labour legislation with the requirements of the Convention.

12. **Mr. Yeung Sik Yuen** (Country Rapporteur) said that he wished to thank the State party for providing more data and statistics than in its previous report. However, there were still gaps in the data, notably in relation to poverty, housing, health, life expectancy, social security and the use of languages. Statistics in the areas of employment and education had been provided for the Kazakh, Tuva and Tsaatan communities, but he would like to know why figures had not been provided for the other ethnic minorities. Did the five-yearly census yield data disaggregated by ethnicity? If so, he would like to know how many minorities were referenced in the census and whether they were counted on the basis of self-identification. He also wondered whether any statistics were available showing the socioeconomic situation of non-citizens, including asylum seekers, refugees, migrants and stateless persons.

13. He would like to know why the province of Bayan-Ulgii was inhabited mainly by ethnic minority groups. He wondered what the main economic activities were in the

province and whether there was any specific provincial legislation in place to ensure nondiscrimination and to protect the rights of minority groups, in particular the right to participation in decision making.

14. Noting that persons with disabilities comprised around 3 per cent each of the Kazakh and Tuva populations, but 6 per cent of the Tsaatan population, he asked why there was such a large difference. Did the work typically done by those groups entail particular risks? Persons with disabilities accounted for what proportion of the general population of Mongolia? The Committee was aware of reports of discrimination against persons with disabilities in employment, transport and access to public buildings, and also in education, where schools were not always accessible, textbooks were inadequate and there was a lack of specialist teachers. The Committee would like to know whether any plans of action calling for short- and medium-term measures had been devised to address those problems.

15. According to the report, 77.4 per cent of Kazakhs were "educated", yet only 17.3 per cent had completed primary education. Similar figures were presented for other groups. If only a small number had completed primary education, he wondered how a larger number could be said to be educated. The report also referred to "higher level education" and "senior high school", without explaining the difference. For the purposes of comparison, he would appreciate receiving figures for "educated" persons belonging to the majority population.

16. In Bayan-Ulgii province, where there was a concentration of ethnic minorities, most of the teachers were Kazakh and taught in Kazakh rather than in Mongolian or other minority languages. In practice, that meant that ethnic minorities did not acquire proficiency in Mongolian and were therefore barred from civil service posts, for which Mongolian was a requirement, and from attending university. Was that problem specific to that region, and how did the State intend to ensure that the bilingual education policy was effectively implemented, providing quality teaching of Mongolian and minority languages? He would also like to know whether the State intended to take steps to protect the country's seven minority languages classified as endangered by the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO).

17. The unemployment rate among the Kazakh, Tsaatan and Tuva communities was well over 50 per cent, while the national rate was 8.4 per cent. Why was that the case, and how did the State plan to address that situation? The report stated that a certain percentage of those who were counted as unemployed were enrolled in education programmes, which would surely imply that the real unemployment rate was lower. He would appreciate some clarification in that regard. By way of comparison, he would appreciate receiving figures for unemployment among the majority Khalkhas population.

18. Given the difficulties experienced by persons belonging to minorities other than Kazakhs in accessing employment in public service, including teaching posts, and in view of the documented instances of discrimination on the basis of ethnicity and political opinion, he wished to know whether the State planned to take special measures to facilitate the employment in public service of persons belonging to ethnic minorities.

19. The Committee welcomed the Government's efforts to improve living standards and access to health care among the Tsaatan, or Dukha, people in the taiga. Even so, the twice-yearly checkups and consultations to which they were entitled were carried out at the regional hospital, which for them was often a two-day horseback ride away. For the sick and elderly, that was problematic. He wondered whether mobile clinics sent to the taiga might not provide more effective health care to such groups.

20. Mining and tourism were in competition with the Dukha's use of the land, and traditional rights had been ignored in the granting of licences for commercial activities. He understood that the State party was in the process of revising its legislation on protected areas. Did it plan to provide for the involvement of ethnic minorities and indigenous peoples in decision-making and for obtaining their free, prior and informed consent? Given that the Dukha people were extremely knowledgeable about their own area, he would have thought that consulting them over its management and protection as a national park, and giving them employment in the region, would benefit not only the group itself, but also the State.

In response to the Committee's concerns about the lack of specific legislation 21. prohibiting racial discrimination, the Government had stated in its report that it was of the opinion that a "proper legal environment" was in place, but that it had nevertheless requested a survey of other countries' legislation on discrimination. What obstacles prevented the State party from introducing specific legislation defining racial discrimination in accordance with article 1 of the Convention and prohibiting all forms of racial discrimination? According to the report, the status of international treaties was governed by the Constitution, which set out that "the international treaties to which Mongolia is a party shall become effective as domestic legislation upon the entry into force of the laws or on their ratification or accession". He had understood that Mongolia applied the monist system, with automatic incorporation of international treaties into domestic law. If that was the case, the delegation might clarify the use of the phrase "upon the entry into force of the laws", which appeared superfluous. He drew attention to a contradiction between a statement made by the Mongolian delegation during the Committee's consideration of the State party's previous report and the content of the current report. According to the summary record of the meeting of 3 December 2015 (CERD/C/SR.2407, para. 22), the representative of Mongolia had said that the international instruments to which Mongolia was a party had the same effect as national legislation, provided that they did not contradict the Constitution. That statement was apparently at odds with the final sentence of paragraph 22 of the current report, which read "article 2.2 of the Law on the Legal Status of Foreign Nationals provides that the provisions of the international treaty shall prevail if an international treaty to which Mongolia is a party is inconsistent with the present Law". The Committee would benefit from the delegation's clarification of the status of international treaties in the domestic legal order.

22. Notwithstanding the Committee's requests and recommendations for the State party to introduce legislation explicitly prohibiting hate speech and banning organizations that promoted racial discrimination, and its call for the State party to ensure prosecution of racially motivated violence, racist hate speech remained quite common in social media and on websites.

23. The Committee had seen reports of a tendency to query the Mongolian background of electoral candidates in derogatory and insulting terms and of the authorities' failure to take legal action against the sources of such racially motivated remarks. The inability of the legal system to protect fundamental human rights should therefore be seriously investigated. Ultra-nationalist organizations reportedly used hate speech against foreigners and claimed to be performing law enforcement duties against foreigners who, in their view, violated Mongolian legislation.

24. During the interactive dialogue in December 2015, the State party had indicated that it was taking concrete measures to prevent and prosecute intolerance, violence and discrimination against foreigners and that eight persons had been charged with such offences. The Committee would be interested to hear about the results of the concrete measures and the outcome of the legal proceedings. Although hate crimes and hate speech were punishable under the new Criminal Code, the Committee had seen no evidence of the implementation of the relevant provisions. Moreover, the lack of a definition of discrimination, including racial discrimination, could impede the successful prosecution of such offences.

25. According to the report, there were 18 officially registered NGOs, groups and movements with nationalist views in the country. He wished to know how many had been registered since the submission of the State party's previous report and whether the figure of 200 active supporters and followers referenced in the report reflected the overall membership or the membership of each entity. Far higher figures had been provided by other sources. The State party had announced during the previous interactive dialogue that the Dayar Mongol group would be disbanded because it had breached the Constitution and the Convention, but it was still officially registered and claimed to have some 3,000 members. According to the report, the power to suspend or dissolve an NGO and to confiscate its property lay with the courts rather than with the executive branch. Article 14.1 of the Criminal Code provided for a fine based on a number of "settlement units". He enquired about the value of such units in terms of Mongolian or any other currency.

26. **Mr. Kut** said that the Committee had in its previous concluding observations requested the State party to provide information within one year on its implementation of three recommendations. A reminder had been sent in January 2017, but no response had been received prior to the submission of the current periodic report. In one of the recommendations, it had asked the State party to ensure that the provisions of the Criminal Code prohibiting racist hate speech were in line with article 4 of the Convention. According to the report, a working group had been established to introduce the amendments recommended by the Committee. He would welcome additional information regarding its work and the implementation of article 14 (1) of the Criminal Code, addressing discrimination. The offences defined in article 14 (1) were punishable by a fine, community service or a one-year travel ban, but the offence of disruption of national unity under article 19 (9) was punishable by a term of imprisonment of 5 to 12 years. The State party should ensure that articles concerning offences against the State were not applied in cases involving discrimination issues or persons claiming to be victims of discrimination.

27. With regard to the second recommendation, the Committee had expressed concern regarding racially motivated violence against foreigners and the existence of ultranationalist neo-Nazi organizations. The Committee had recommended that the State party prohibit such organizations and declare participation in their activities to be an offence punishable by law. According to the report, no racially motivated offences had been registered in the State party and no organizations had been disbanded. He would therefore welcome further information on the proposed amendment of the Law on Not-for-Profit Legal Entities, which would reportedly address those issues.

28. The Committee had recommended in its previous concluding observations that the State party ensure that the Tsaatan (or Dukha) people were fully and effectively consulted on all decisions affecting them and that it ratify the ILO Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169). According to the report, various programmes were being implemented to increase the social status and well-being of the Dukha people. He enquired about the steps taken to resolve the problem of illegal extraction of natural resources in Khuvsgul Province and asked whether the community had been consulted during the relevant procedures relating to extraction.

29. **Ms. Shepherd** said that she would like to know more about the criteria used to divide people into national and non-national ethnic groups, such as heritage, ancestry or percentage of the population. According to the report, a survey of anti-discrimination legislation in other countries by the National Legal Institute was expected to determine the prospects for implementing comprehensive legislation consistent with the specific conditions prevailing in Mongolia. She wondered why such research was necessary, as the report stated elsewhere that the legislation currently in force comprehensively prohibited discrimination. Reference had also been made in the delegation's opening statement to research by the National Legal Institute concerning laws in the State party that prohibited direct discrimination and that were aimed at ensuring justice and equality. The Committee would welcome additional information regarding the Institute's findings.

30. The poverty rate in Mongolia had reportedly stood at 38.7 per cent in 2010 and 27.4 per cent in 2012. She requested updated statistics, especially for the period since 2015, and, if possible, disaggregated data for the various ethnic groups. She wished to know whether the State party intended to ratify the ILO Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No. 189). Noting that the State party's core document (HRI/CORE/MNG/2015) listed the rights and freedoms enjoyed by citizens under the Constitution, she asked whether non-citizens, including domestic workers, enjoyed the same rights and freedoms. The core document also referred to a compulsory human rights course for students in university and college degree programmes, a plan to include human rights education in secondary school curricula and a training module on the human rights-based approach, developed by the Institute of Education, with the support of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). The Committee would be interested to hear whether those initiatives had had an impact on hate speech and human rights violations.

31. **Mr. Avtonomov** said that, according to the census conducted in 2000, there were only 303 persons in Mongolia belonging to the Dukha ethnic group at the time. The corresponding figure for the 2010 census was just 282. He noted that special measures were

being taken by the State party to promote the Dukha language and culture and that monthly subsidies were being provided to Dukha families. However, problems stemming from the extraction of natural resources and the pressure of tourism in the region persisted. He would appreciate information regarding special measures, as defined in the Committee's general recommendation No. 32 on the meaning and scope of special measures, taken for the benefit of the Dukha ethnic group, and on measures to protect their ability to engage without discrimination in traditional occupations and their access to land and natural resources, in line with general recommendation No. 23 on the rights of indigenous peoples. He was interested in hearing whether the State party would consider ratifying the amendment to article 8 of the Convention, aimed at regularizing the funding of the Committee's work.

## The meeting was suspended at 4.50 p.m. and resumed at 5.10 p.m.

32. **Mr. Calí Tzay** said that the State party claimed in its report that discrimination was prohibited by law, but it failed to state whether the legislation to prevent racial discrimination was effectively implemented. The Committee would therefore appreciate information on specific legislation that was being actively implemented and on cases in which perpetrators of discrimination had been prosecuted. Could victims invoke the Convention during legal proceedings?

33. According to the report, some school textbooks were published in the Tuva and Kazakh languages. Yet according to a study by the Institute of Education, Tuva and Kazakh children who lived in Bayan-Ulgii Province and Khuvsgul Province had failed to make genuine progress and were in danger of losing their mother tongue. As education played a key role in preventing racial discrimination and preserving the culture and history of minority groups, he wished to know whether effective action was being taken to preserve minority languages.

34. The Committee had been informed that about 600 workers from the Democratic People's Republic of Korea were being subjected to extremely rigorous working conditions and were being paid less than the minimum wage. It had received similar reports concerning Chinese immigrants. Was there any connection between the neo-Nazi groups who employed racist rhetoric and discriminatory acts perpetrated against migrant workers?

35. The growing population of Ulaanbaatar and the increased air pollution there had created major public health problems. He wished to know how the Government was tackling the health crisis. Were there any statistics indicating that minorities were disproportionately affected by air pollution? International copper mining operations had been increasing in rural areas. He asked whether extraction operations were being conducted in indigenous areas and, if so, whether the local people had been informed and consulted prior to the establishment of the requisite infrastructure.

36. **Ms. Verdugo Moreno** said that, while she commended the provisions of the Criminal Code prohibiting hate crimes, there seemed to be shortcomings in their practical implementation. She wished to know whether aggravating circumstances were deemed to exist and harsher penalties imposed where a physical or sexual attack entailing injuries or even homicide was perpetrated on grounds of race or ethnicity. She also wished to hear whether the training programmes for judges and prosecutors encouraged them to draw attention to racial or discriminatory motives underlying offences that should entail tougher sentences.

37. She commended the establishment of a 24-hour hotline for complaints concerning reprehensible conduct by police officers and asked whether such conduct could include racial profiling and arbitrary detention on racial grounds. Were police officers trained to refrain from racial profiling? The Committee would also like to know whether the legal training provided for the general public referred specifically to discrimination and whether citizens were aware of procedures for denouncing discriminatory acts. Were measures taken to ensure that NGOs that assisted vulnerable groups and groups that had traditionally been victims of discrimination were aware of relevant legislation?

38. **Mr. Diaby**, referring to paragraphs 26–28 of the State party's report, said that he wished to know more about the circumstances in which Mongolian nationality could be

withdrawn and, in particular, the process that was followed with regard to persons who did not have dual nationality. Noting that a number of Kazakhs had renounced their Mongolian citizenship, while others had applied to have it restored, he asked whether any applications for the restoration of citizenship had been denied and, if so, on what grounds.

39. A number of ultranationalist groups had emerged in the country, including the Dayar Mongol organization, and there had reportedly been a rise in the incidence of racist hate speech and violence, in particular against Chinese migrants. Mongolian women in relationships with Chinese men had also reportedly been targeted. He would be grateful for information about such problems, including disaggregated data on the victims of racially motivated offences. Racist hate speech had apparently flourished during the country's previous parliamentary elections. He asked whether any mechanisms had monitored hate speech in politics and, if so, whether any complaints had been lodged and investigations launched. Lastly, he would like to know whether the National Human Rights Commission had been involved in drafting the State party's periodic report, and for what reasons there was such a dearth of civil society organizations in the State party.

40. **Ms. Ko** said that she would be interested to learn more about the National Programme on Improving Public Legal Education. There were apparently two such programmes, one for the general population and another for specific population groups. Were ethnic minorities among those specific population groups, and was the curriculum adapted to the target recipients?

41. **Ms. Chung** said that she wished to know to what extent migrant workers were subjected to forced labour in the State party, whether the delegation could provide disaggregated data on the population groups that were affected and whether Mongolia intended to become a party to the ILO Domestic Workers Convention, 2011 (No. 189). With regard to the law governing labour migration to and from the country, she would be interested in receiving data, disaggregated by racial or ethnic background, on those persons who left the country to work abroad. She would also like to know more about the situation of indigenous peoples in Mongolia. Specifically, had any communities been forcibly evicted from their lands, and how had the illegal extraction of natural resources on the territory of indigenous peoples been halted, as indicated in the report.

42. **Ms. McDougall** said that she would welcome more comprehensive data on the socioeconomic and employment status of national ethnic minorities, ethnic groups and migrants, in comparison with the majority population. Was it true, as stated in the periodic report, that the expression of racist sentiment was criminalized only in "the most serious cases"? If so, the Committee would like to know how the authorities distinguished between serious and non-serious racist hate speech. She wondered what could account for the fact that there had been no reported cases of racially motivated offences in Mongolia, whether the population was aware of the rights under the Convention and of the complaints mechanisms available when those rights were violated and whether the public had confidence in the justice system. Lastly, the Committee would appreciate it if the delegation could provide information on whether stateless persons were able to gain access to education, health and other basic services on an equal footing with Mongolian citizens.

43. **Ms. Li** said that she would appreciate it if the delegation could clarify the difference between "national ethnic minorities" and "ethnic groups", specifying whether the distinction affected their legal status. It would also be helpful to know the total number of national ethnic minorities and ethnic groups in the country. She noted that the Criminal Code had been revised. Was racial, national or ethnic motivation considered to be an aggravating factor in the commission of offences? Lastly, it would be useful to know the extent to which the provisions of the Convention had been invoked before the domestic courts.

44. **Ms. Mohamed** said that she wished to know how the roles and responsibilities of the Human Rights Subcommittee and the National Human Rights Commission differed, especially since they both reported to the parliament. She asked whether human rights education had been introduced into the national school curriculum. She would like to know what inspection and monitoring mechanisms were in place to ensure that the working conditions of migrant workers complied with labour standards, and whether migrant workers had access to health care and insurance, were able to submit complaints of human rights abuses and were able to apply for Mongolian citizenship.

45. **Mr. Bilguun** (Mongolia) said he could confirm that the Dayar Mongol organization no longer existed. The authorities had faced difficulties when it came to dissolving such organizations, which were registered as NGOs. As a result, a bill on not-for-profit legal entities had been submitted to the parliament to prohibit such entities from engaging in any activities that discriminated against persons inter alia on grounds of race, ethnicity, language, skin colour, age, gender, religion, sexual orientation or gender identity. If such discrimination was found to have occurred, the entity concerned could be dissolved.

46. **Mr. Bold** (Mongolia) said that of the 18 officially registered organizations, groups or movements with nationalist views in Mongolia, 4 were currently active. They usually registered as organizations with the declared purpose of promoting national identity and culture, since the legal term "nationalist organization" did not exist. Between 2015 and 2018, five persons had been convicted of offences related to racial discrimination. There had been no reported cases of racial discrimination so far in 2019.

47. **Mr. Jadamba** (Mongolia) said that, when it came to the use of indigenous lands by the extractive industries, the right of indigenous peoples to be consulted was provided for in general administrative law and in a law on mineral resources. As a result, the indigenous peoples were always involved in decisions that affected them, including when it came to awarding mining permits. In addition, before a decision on licensing could be made, a tripartite agreement had to be signed in order to protect the human rights and fundamental freedoms of indigenous peoples. In the past, the negative impact of extractive industries had led to pollution of natural resources and indigenous land and had taken a toll on the health of members of the Tsaatan people. A law had thus been enacted prohibiting mineral exploration and mining activities in certain areas, such as those around river headwaters and protected water reservoir zones and forested areas. Subsequently, thousands of hectares of land occupied by the Tsaatan people had been accorded protected status. Moreover, nine mining licences had been withdrawn, leaving just one active licence for extraction on land belonging to the Tsaatan people.

48. **Mr. Bilguun** (Mongolia) said that the proportion of persons with disabilities among the Tuva and Kazakh ethnic minorities was below the national average of 3.3 per cent. The number of Tsaatan persons with disabilities was above average, largely owing to their traditional livelihoods as reindeer herders. Their right to health care was unaffected by the high proportion of persons with disabilities.

The meeting rose at 6 p.m.