



**General Assembly**

Distr.  
GENERAL

A/HRC/10/38/Add.1  
27 February 2009

Original: ENGLISH

---

HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL

Tenth session

Agenda item 2

**ANNUAL REPORT OF THE UNITED NATIONS HIGH COMMISSIONER  
FOR HUMAN RIGHTS AND REPORTS OF THE OFFICE OF THE  
HIGH COMMISSIONER AND THE SECRETARY-GENERAL**

**The rights of persons belonging to national or ethnic, religious and  
linguistic minorities\***

**Report of the Secretary-General**

**Addendum**

**REPORT ON THE EXPERT MEETING ON INTEGRATION  
WITH DIVERSITY IN POLICING**

**Vienna International Centre, Vienna, Austria, 15-16 January 2008**

---

\* Late submission.

## I. BACKGROUND

1. Following the recommendation of the Working Group on Minorities and the Independent Expert on Minority Issues, the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) in cooperation with the International Labour Office (ILO) and the United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime (UNODC) as well as the Independent Expert held an expert meeting on integration with diversity in policing at the Vienna International Centre in Austria from 15 to 16 January 2008. The event was hosted by the Austrian Government.
2. OHCHR invited 10 professionals from the police service of different regions and countries of the world (Brazil, Cameroon, Canada, Hungary, India, Ireland, Nigeria, Pakistan, Samoa and South Africa) to participate in the meeting as experts and deliver presentations focused on sharing of good experiences and lessons learned in relation to inclusion with diversity in policing.<sup>1</sup> Besides sharing of good experiences and lessons learned, the main objective of the meeting was to determine whether it would be useful to develop OHCHR guidelines on the practical application of human rights principles and provisions related to integration with diversity, based on the current draft (E/CN.4/Sub.2/AC.5/2006/WP.1).

## II. INTRODUCTION AND ORGANIZATION OF WORK

3. **Georg Heindl**, Head of the Minority Issues Unit of the Austrian Ministry of European and International Affairs, made the opening statement. He emphasized the long-standing support of his Government for minority issues at the United Nations, especially as relates to issues of participation, under which integration with diversity in policing can be subsumed. **Timothy Lemay**, Chief of the Rule of Law Section at UNODC, highlighted the importance of inter-agency cooperation on policing issues and suggested that the issue of integration with diversity should perhaps be included in the UNODC bluebook police manual which is currently being updated.
4. **Martin Oelz**, **Legal Officer** from the Equality, Migrant Workers, and Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Team of the ILO, pointed out that from the perspective of his organization, the issue of integration with diversity in policing is primarily an issue of equality and human rights at work. He stated that the ILO believes that fair and inclusive workplaces are more efficient and that it promotes the development and implementation of practical tools and workplace policies to this end. **Julian Burger**, Coordinator of the Indigenous Peoples and Minorities Unit of OHCHR, gave a brief overview of the work of OHCHR on minority issues and of the recent institutional changes in the human rights machinery. He also gave a short statement on behalf of the Independent Expert on minority issues, conveying her regrets for being unable to attend the meeting and her support for the initiative of preparing guidelines and collecting best practices and country case studies.
5. **Tom Hadden**, the author of the draft guidelines, introduced the document and highlighted some of the main issues it addresses. He added that it was recognized that the material he was

---

<sup>1</sup> The full list of participants is available at <http://www2.ohchr.org/english/issues/minorities/docs/RepDiversityPolicing.doc>.

able to draw on was somewhat limited and that further work was needed to ensure that any eventual agreed version would reflect the problems and requirements in all regions. He then explained that his approach to minority rights is integrationist and that he feels that for practical areas such as policing we have to move away from human rights preaching and try to have a practical toolkit that is based on human rights standards but does not put practitioners off. He invited the participants' views on how best to prepare an outcome document that police would read and use, and regarding the desirability to make this tool an inter-agency one.

6. It was agreed that Julian Burger and Martin Oelz would facilitate the meeting and that Ilona Alexander would prepare a narrative report of the meeting which would be circulated to all participants for comments and approval before a final version is produced. The draft agenda was adopted by consensus. The participants then had a chance to briefly introduce themselves and their work in relation to integration with diversity through a tour de table.

### **III. SHARING OF GOOD EXPERIENCES AND LESSONS LEARNED - PRESENTATIONS BY EXPERTS FROM NATIONAL POLICE FORCES**

#### **Fiji and Samoa**

7. **Kasanita Seruvatu**, Training Adviser for the Samoa Police Project and former Director of Education and Training of the Fiji Police, described problems of attracting certain segments of minorities due to unfavourable conditions such as low pay. The recruitment in the Fiji Police has always been on a percentage basis, taking into account Fijians as the ethnic majority and Indians as the largest minority. In all police recruitment, the majority intake has consisted of Fijians, followed by Indians and others. The prospects for minority recruitment had improved when the compulsory height, weight, age and chest size requirements had been removed from the selection requirements for recruits. In addition, the average age of 18-25 was moved up to 35. While the change met with a lot of scepticism, it is now well accepted and recruitment is no longer discriminatory against a certain section of the community, especially those of slight build.

8. Ms. Seruvatu further reported that in 2006, the Commissioner and the Board of Management made another concession intended to promote integration with diversity. It allowed the Muslims in the Fiji Police Force to grow beards in accordance with their religious beliefs. Recruitment advertisements are now placed in all ethnic newspapers - Fijian, English, Hindi, and Chinese, in order to attract all minority groups. Although the Fiji Police has so far been unable to attract any Chinese into the police force, it is attempting to rectify this by sending a Fijian police officer to mainland China to learn Mandarin for two years to enable him to better respond to the needs of the Chinese community by removing the language barrier. Ms. Seruvatu also described interesting concepts of community policing based on traditional chieftain systems in Samoa, and on the connection of the three pillars of culture, church and government in Fiji, which have proved rather successful as they reach out to all communities and help accelerate integration.

9. Ms. Seruvatu concluded that progress towards policing with diversity in the Pacific can be summarized as follows: inclusion of all significant cultural, social and political issues into training programmes; human rights training for police officers both locally and abroad; inclusion of gender and equity strategies across the board in all policing areas; proactive policing through

community policing initiatives that use the already existing societal structures to enhance the relations between police and the community; and vigorous and continued efforts to recruit those from the minority groups into policing.

### **India**

10. **Mr. Radhakrishnan**, Inspector General of Police in Chennai, Tamil Nadu, described the experience in the South Indian State of Tamil Nadu with a 60 million population made up of 88 per cent Hindus, 5.6 per cent Muslims and 6 per cent Christians. The place had witnessed a series of violent acts engineered by religious fundamentalists following Hindu and Muslim disputes. Mutual suspicion, fear and hatred dominated the atmosphere. The police machinery, comprising personnel from the majority Hindu community, was accused of prejudice and bias. Therefore, the police authority faced the daunting challenge of ensuring a neutral role in the conflict. Mr. Radhakrishnan described a number of measures that enabled the police to take strict and impartial action against the wrongdoers and to establish the rule of law.

11. Mr. Radhakrishnan further explained that the police introduced the concept of community policing by consulting the community with the help of area committees, city vigilance committees and boys clubs, identifying the root causes and adapting itself to solving problems prioritized by the community. The community perspective was brought into police training to shed new light on cultural issues, values and traditions and remove bias from the minds of the police. The result was the birth in 2004 of a new training project entitled “Communal (Religious) Relations Management Training for the Police through Community Engagement”, consisting of the following modules: basic tenets of major religions of India and universality of religions; social, cultural and communal background of India and Tamil Nadu; past incidents of disharmony in Tamil Nadu; police professionalism and neutrality to handle communal disharmony/relations; and tapping the community resources to handle communal relations.

12. In addition, a documentary film and training manual were developed. The resource team was composed of 80 per cent of community contributors and 20 per cent of police officers. The training was delivered through lectures, role play exercises, experience sharing, interactive discussions, community interface sessions, panel interviews and debriefing sessions. The community contributors were encouraged to make constructive criticism of police behaviour and attitudes to bring about the desired change in the police mindset through a mutual dialogue. An evaluation of the training revealed that the training intervention succeeded in attaining the desired objective. Mr. Radhakrishnan pointed out that overall, there is adequate representation of minorities in the Tamil Nadu Police Force. It may increase in the future as in 2007 the provincial Government of Tamil Nadu has enacted a law to reserve 7 per cent of government jobs and seats in educational institutions for religious minorities.

### **Pakistan**

13. **Muhammad Shoaib Suddle**, Director of the National Police Bureau in Pakistan, described as the main challenge in Pakistan the need to transform the police into a public-friendly instrument (in general, and not only towards minorities). In terms of integration with diversity, Pakistan has borrowed many good practices from Ireland’s Patten report and from the Japanese experience. Through the Police Order 2002, replacing the 141-year-old anachronistic Police Act of 1861, a serious effort has been made to address the long-existing

systemic problems of policing in Pakistan. Under the new law and its preamble, access to fair policing is seen as a key component of effective law enforcement as it seeks to create a police service that is reflective of and responsive to the needs of the diverse community it serves, and where diversity is not an issue but a strength. It seeks to depoliticize and professionalize the police, thereby enabling it to take proactive steps to embrace diversity.

14. Mr. Suddle pointed out that an important measure adopted to promote democratic policing is to take affirmative action for recruiting more policemen from minority groups. Not only would a more representative police be more sensitive to the needs of a diverse population, it would also help address the disproportionately high rate of unemployment among the disadvantaged minorities. The Government has set up a separate Ministry for Minority Affairs and the proposal to establish a dedicated Minorities Cell at the National Police Bureau has been agreed to in principle. The Cell's functions would include to assess, analyse, evaluate and review the whole spectrum of police-minorities relationships; to recommend appropriate steps for improving police behaviour and attitude towards minority communities; to develop policy guidelines for promptly and effectively dealing with complaints from minority groups against members of law enforcement agencies; to devise policy interventions identifying capacity-building and sensitization needs for police officers; to suggest affirmative action to address the issue of minorities' representation in law enforcement agencies; and to propose a national action plan for fulfilling the constitutional obligation of provision of equal protection of law to minorities.

15. In conclusion, Mr. Suddle expressed his support for the OHCHR guidelines but suggested that a more broad-based approach is needed and policing issues needed to be higher on the United Nations agenda. He further suggested that it would be useful to make a link between the Millennium Development Goals and policing as there cannot be rule of law, peace, and economic prosperity without proper policing. He finally called for a doable and implementable agenda for police reforms, which is needed in many countries.

### **Brazil**

16. **Fernando Oliveira Queiroz Segovia**, Chief of the Division of Social and Political Affairs of the Federal Police in Brazil and of the Service for the Repression of Crimes against Indigenous Communities, pointed out that the public image of police in Brazil is rather negative - the police are seen as violent and ineffective in preventing and combating crime. The fear and mistrust of police is higher among non-whites who believe that the police are violent, wound innocent people in shootings and target the black population. Surveys show that younger men of colour are often verbally or physically abused. A case study also identified some measures that could decrease the problems in discrimination by police, such as promoting internal campaigns against discrimination; selecting a greater number of members of minority groups for the police force as these are more sensitive to the problems of the community than police officers from other communities; more police involvement with black communities; punishing cases of discriminatory actions; and emphasizing proper law implementation in the training of the police.

### **Cameroon**

17. **Richard Blaise Eboa Eboue**, Chief of the Bureau in charge of police commissioners and officer management, Cameroonian National Police, described Cameroon as a mosaic of about 250 to 300 local languages and tribes or cultures with a secular multireligious society of

Christians, Muslims and Animists. Cameroon's Constitution makes a commitment to promotion of diversity through the equality of all peoples and the elimination of all forms of discrimination and makes specific references to protection of minorities. Despite these commitments, policing authorities have not exerted much effort on integration with diversity. Pygmies, the largest minority group, are excluded from the police (in Cameroon and in Central African countries in general) while their communities are constantly subjected to abuses and violations of their rights. The exclusion of Pygmies from the national police corps is due to a discriminatory recruitment requirement of a minimum height of 1.52 metres, while the average height among Pygmies is around 1.30 metres. The Bororos, the second main minority group, is very poorly represented in the police force (0.3 per cent) and only in the low ranks.

18. Mr. Eboa Ebouele pointed out that since French and English have become the two official languages of Cameroon, the authorities are promoting bilingualism through constitutional provisions and training institutions. In order to increase representativity, the authorities have also implemented quotas and a reserved places policy for employment in the public sector since 1975. Mr. Eboa Ebouele expressed support for the draft guidelines but called for further meetings to be held in other United Nations languages. He also called for the removal of barriers for the recruitment of minority groups and the active engagement of all Central African States in comprehensive and sustainable reforms leading to the increase in the integration of minorities in the police.

### **Nigeria**

19. **Peace Abdallah Ibekwe**, Assistant Commissioner of Police, Administration in Nigeria, argued that in Nigeria gender equality in policing is a more sensitive issue than integration of different ethnic and religious groups. Diversity in policing in Nigeria has no racial undertones, it is based mainly on different ethnic groups whose cultures, languages and religions are different. She described an interesting concept of community policing in which there is only a federal police force and officers are trained to work anywhere in the country regardless of their ethnic and religious background. There is however a tendency that these officers should then stay in the same post for long periods of time so that they can develop relations with the community. Ms. Ibekwe reported that in the opinion of traditional chiefs in Nigeria, some kind of community policing (in terms of consultation with the communities) has always been in place, long before the concept of community policing became an official strategy. In the case of Nigeria, community policing has improved the image of the Nigerian police force that is no longer seen as mostly oppressive. This is partly also due to the fact that working conditions of the police have improved and the officers are more content and thus less oppressive.

20. Ms. Ibekwe further explained that the community policing project teams are normally made up of officers from different parts of the country. The success of these teams is preconditioned by the fact that from the time of enlistment each prospective recruit is trained to divest himself/herself of ethnic, religious and linguistic differences. After the training one may be posted to any part of the country; thus it is imperative to imbibe the spirit of the oneness/unity of the nation despite the presence of different ethnic groups, languages and religions. Despite its diverse nature, the Nigerian community also sees their police as a federal force and readily accepts any police officer regardless of their coming from areas different from where they are posted to work. Nigerians see all policemen and women as police first and would rarely want to know what states they come from. This is probably because of the recruitment policy which

ensures that all ethnic groups are represented and the training that equally prepares all the recruits to work in any part of the country regardless of the differences. Yet at the same time, linguistic and religious differences sometimes create difficulties for the work of the police in some, especially rural, areas.

### South Africa

21. **Pieter Cronje**, former Brigadier-General (Director) of South African Police and first head of its Human Rights Unit during transition in South Africa (1994-2002), described the creation of a non-racial and diverse police service that reflects the demographic diversity of the country and provides a professional service to the whole South African society as one of the biggest challenges of the new South African Police Service, given the history of apartheid and a huge amount of distrust between different communities and racial groups. During apartheid, black police officers were not expected to be literate, were not allowed to arrest whites and could only work within strict parameters, usually under white supervision. Typically, black police officers received 30 per cent less pay than their white counterparts of the same rank and had no career structure; it was not until 1978 that black officers could wear the same uniform as their white colleagues. The situation was similar for Indian and other non-white police officers who were also discriminated against but had a slightly higher status than black employees.

22. Mr. Cronje reported that in 1991 the South African Police Service started an internal reform process and different programmes and policies were implemented to address the issue of diversity, equality and correcting the wrongs of the past. The basis for the process was the principle of non-discrimination. Fast-track promotions and an accelerated development programme offered an opportunity to fast-track the promotion of historically disadvantaged persons or members of the police service who had a proven ability. Succession planning was initialized to expose historically disadvantaged members to the senior and top management environment throughout the Police Service to achieve representivity, effectiveness and continuity at its most senior management echelons. Preferential/affirmative training and shadow posting improved literacy and technical skills and knowledge levels of persons who had been historically disadvantaged, enabling them to function effectively and efficiently in the police service and to acquire management experience and expertise. Additionally, lateral entry programmes were implemented to address the limited internal human resource based capacity by introducing and supplementing existing capacity, in order to attain the affirmative action targets. These programmes had varied success and some processes still continue.

23. Mr. Cronje said that integration with diversity remained a challenge. South Africa is a very diverse society but different ethnic groups are located in specific parts of the country. The South African Police Service adopted community policing as an operational strategy. One aspect of community policing is the establishment of police-community partnerships and a problem-solving approach responsive to the needs of the community. A major challenge is therefore to deploy police in areas where they are able to establish partnerships and use officers who are able to understand local customs, traditions and languages. The risk of this model in a country like South Africa is that it may be interpreted as building on the foundations of apartheid. At present, the local communities are not sensitized to dealing with the diversity in the police and even after more than a decade of democracy, there is still much racism and distrust left.

### Northern Ireland

24. **Mark Reber**, Senior Inspector of the Garda Síochána Inspectorate in the Republic of Ireland and former Northern Ireland Policing Board Oversight Commissioner, reported that all main steps described in the draft OHCHR guidance note were reflected in the Northern Ireland experience. Mr. Reber's presentation concentrated on the experience of the police service between 1999 and 2007. In 1998, Catholics represented only 8 per cent of the police force, whereas 40 per cent of the population of Northern Ireland was Catholic. There was a need to overcome the imbalance in the Royal Ulster Constabulary (the police force in Northern Ireland) and effective policing was required to build confidence between the police and the community. As recognized by the Governments both of the United Kingdom and of Ireland, and explicitly stated in the Belfast Agreement, the issue of policing lay at the heart of many of the seemingly intractable inter-community tensions that had hampered a wider political solution in Northern Ireland.

25. Mr. Reber reported that in response, the United Kingdom Government established the Independent Commission on Policing for Northern Ireland, more commonly known as the Patten Commission. Its recommendations aimed to initiate a reform programme that would result in a police service that was reflective of the ethnicity, religion and gender of the society within which it operated, properly accountable to the communities it served, and effective in achieving its law enforcement objectives. As a result, the entire selection and recruitment process was redesigned, and recruitment of police officers and civilian staff was contracted to the private sector. A comprehensive advertising campaign was launched that reached beyond the majority community, explicitly targeting areas previously underrepresented in policing. All new recruits would continue to be required to reach a specified standard of merit in the selection process, and if successful, would enter a pool from which an equal number of Protestants and Catholics would be drawn. This subsequently became known as "50:50" recruitment and has had a positive short-term impact, with Catholic representation almost tripling since 1999. These measures have also been consistently supported by human rights organizations, as well as successfully withstanding legal challenges. To ensure that reforms were not ignored or implemented selectively, the Patten Commission also devised a crucial mechanism which allowed for the independent monitoring of the pace and degree of changes taking place. These assessments were then routinely communicated in public progress reports. The Patten Commission thereby achieved its objective of balancing Catholic representation in the police.

### Canada

26. **Gwenneth Marie Boniface**, Deputy Chief Inspector in the Garda Síochána Inspectorate in the Republic of Ireland and former superintendent and inspector with the Ontario Provincial Police, explained that past practices in Canada, in which police found themselves forcing Aboriginal children to leave their family homes and transporting them to residential schools where they were punished for speaking their language and practising their cultural beliefs, created a relationship of distrust between the police and the Aboriginal community. Ms. Boniface reported that all the important steps which must be taken to build a relationship between the community and the police, as identified in the draft OHCHR guidelines, were considered in a public inquiry which resulted in identifying best practices for police to build and sustain relationships with Aboriginal communities which properly reflect their role as community contributors and not solely as law enforcers.



27. Ms. Boniface identified the best practices as follows:

- Establishing teams of officers to directly liaison with the Aboriginal community on a daily basis
- Ensuring the involvement of Aboriginal police services and the assistance of Aboriginal mediators when responding to Aboriginal protests and occupations
- Providing culturally sensitive training for police officers (training should be evaluated by a third-party evaluator to ensure it is continually updated and valuable)
- Establishing public order policing strategies for Aboriginal occupations and protests, with particular emphasis on the historical, legal and behavioural differences of such incidents (training should focus on the requirements for peacekeeping, communication, negotiation and building trust before, during and after such incidents)
- Open and transparent Government/police interactions, independent reviews of police actions, and the relationship between police and Government

28. In order to improve traditionally low representation of Aboriginal officers and ensure their retention, outreach programmes have been put in place, consisting of , for example, recruitment directly in the communities (during cultural events, etc.), open door days during which 120 visitors had a chance to see how the police works, and a summer work programme. These measures have proved successful in increasing recruitment. Additional measures to improve relations with the Aboriginal community included a leadership forum setting out an agenda for work with communities and community advisory councils.

### Hungary

29. Mr. **Gyorgy Makula**, Crime and Liaison Officer at the Crime Prevention Department of the Budapest Police Headquarters in Hungary, described the work of an association of ethnic minority police officials of Romani origin. Roma in Hungary constitute 5.5 to 6 per cent of the population and should be represented at all levels of the society, including law enforcement agencies. The cooperation between the police, Romani non-governmental organizations and Romani self-government started in 1994-1995. The Ministry of the Interior had also taken the initiative to carry out a survey on the attitude against the Roma within the police force in 1996-1997. As a result, agreements had been signed between Romani minority self-governments and police headquarters. Furthermore, police scholarships and summer camps (on a regular basis) had been introduced for Romani secondary school students to make the job of a police officer more popular. The goal of these measures is to help increase the number of Roma in the law enforcement branch of the State administration.

30. Mr. Makula further reported that on 24 November 2006 the Fraternal Public Benefit Association of European Roma Law Enforcement Officers had been set up in Budapest with the participation of representatives from five European countries (Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Hungary, Romania and Slovakia). The establishment of the association was initiated by Hungarian police officers of Romani and non-Romani origin. Both the senior officials of the Hungarian Ministry of Justice and Law Enforcement and of the law enforcement agencies have

been committed to cooperation with Roma since the very beginning. Within its scope of activities, the association directly helps combat discrimination and moreover also fosters the education and employment of Roma, the improvement of their housing conditions, and provides an opportunity to break out of poverty.

31. Mr. Makula explained that objectives of the Fraternal Public Benefit Association of European Roma Law Enforcement Officers include: the promotion of equal opportunities in the law enforcement agencies of Hungary and other EU member States; the reduction of mutual prejudices between the law enforcement agencies and the Romani communities; increasing the number of staff of Romani origin at the law enforcement agencies; and improvement of the life and service conditions of the Romani staff members currently on board. It is hoped that member organizations will be set up in other European countries. Mr. Makula emphasized that his association takes an integrationist approach, is based on voluntary membership and includes non-Roma. In conclusion, he called for the coordination of projects designed to improve the situation of Romani communities in Europe and for cooperation of policing units in intergovernmental organizations with his association and other associations of minority police officers.

32. These presentations were followed by brief discussions on, inter alia, the need for civilian oversight as a necessary ingredient for democratic policing, problems with abuse and mistreatment of minority police officers, and the issue of the desirability of minority officers being deployed in minority areas.

#### **IV. SHARING OF GOOD EXPERIENCES AND LESSONS LEARNED - PRESENTATIONS BY REPRESENTATIVES OF INTERGOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS AND OTHER RELEVANT BODIES**

33. Seven representatives of intergovernmental organizations and other relevant bodies made short presentations on sharing of good experiences and lessons learned in relation to inclusion with diversity in policing.

34. **Martin Oelz** briefly introduced the three main ILO instruments relevant to the discussion - Convention No. 111 concerning Discrimination in Respect of Employment and Occupation, 1958, the Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work and the Guidelines on social dialogue in public emergency services. These Guidelines provide best-practice-based guidance for the delivery of high-quality public emergency services, including on employment diversity, inter alia through active campaigning to recruit and retain youth, women and ethnic minority candidates, ensuring attitude changes among recruiters, social dialogue as an effective means to achieve commitment to more diversity, and effective policies and procedure to address discrimination and harassment within the service.

35. **Timothy Lemay** briefly introduced the work of UNODC, including in relation to developing tools and training materials such as the Compendium of United Nations standards and norms in crime prevention and criminal justice (including best practice). He pointed out that UNODC has no immediate programme that focuses purely on diversity in policing. However, issues of diversity often come up in UNODC's engagements with law officials generally, which is why UNODC is a relevant partner in this area and why it welcomes joining forces with others

active in this field, to ensure that all international standards on policing are reflected in the assistance UNODC provides. This assistance can relate e.g. to planning of police reform, increasing the participation of minorities in the police, training law enforcement officials on diversity issues, fairer treatment of minorities in prisons, and oversight of police agencies (by diverse investigatory bodies, such as independent ombudsmen or complaints commissioners to oversee the work of the police, systems to investigate police discrimination against minorities, and internal disciplinary procedures to prosecute abusive police). In terms of lessons learned, the UNODC believes that a more representative police service means greater legitimacy and efficiency. Diversity in policing needs to be built into all technical assistance programmes, and there has to be diversity at all levels of a police agency and in specialist functions.

36. **Dmitri Alechkevitch**, Political Adviser to the High Commissioner on National Minorities of the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE HCNM), emphasized the importance of the topic discussed by pointing out that the police have the power to influence perceptions about minorities and about the capacity of the State to act in a just and accountable way. People have more contact with the police than with judges and other officials. By the same token, police also have an important role in shaping the attitudes of minorities towards the State. The HCNM office was pleased that the OHCHR guidelines significantly draw on the OSCE HCNM Recommendations on Policing in Multi-Ethnic Societies. Mr Alechkevitch pointed out several strengths of the OHCHR guidelines, such as the examples of good practice. He argued that there are advantages in integration with diversity for everyone and that a holistic approach, including for example the need to overhaul the entire criminal system to ensure that the police do not operate in a vacuum, was desirable. He then suggested that retention efforts need to be considered more prominently in the guidelines and that the guidelines could benefit from the inclusion of a checklist. He expressed an interest in further cooperation on this topic with all participants of the meeting.

37. **Manuel Marion**, Deputy Head of the OSCE Strategic Police Matters Unit (SPMU), briefly introduced the work of OSCE as relates to institution-building and capacity-building in community policing, police training, human resources and investigations. He introduced three important resource books that deal, among other issues, with diversity. The “Guidebook on Democratic Policing” emphasizes that the protection and promotion of persons belonging to national minorities is an essential factor for democracy, peace, justice and stability at the national as well as international level. It calls for police to combat racist and xenophobic acts, for police investigations to be sensitive to minorities, and for outreach to minority communities. The “Basic Police Training” includes a chapter on goals, objectives and topics for cultural diversity training. The “Community Policing” handbook is based on the principles of being visible or accessible to the public, responding to community needs, listening to community concerns, engaging and mobilizing the community, and being accountable. Mr. Marion described some OSCE activities related to the integration of minorities in policing in the Balkans. The OSCE has learned from this experience, and although the population was at first sceptical towards these efforts, levels of confidence have grown. A focus on the judiciary was also important as cooperation between the police and judiciary was low in the case of the Balkans. Mistakes have however also been made, for example due to pressure from the international community to train many officers in a short time, which resulted in training periods which were too short and insufficient background checks. He also introduced the OSCE POLIS (Policing Online Information System) website ([www.polis.osce.org](http://www.polis.osce.org)).

38. **Blaz Mamuza** from the Regional Network on Hate Crime Prevention and Investigation, established under the aegis of the OSCE, introduced the activities of his network, including training programmes with curricula based on best practices. He pointed out that in the last two decades there had been an increased number of anti-Semitic, racist, xenophobic, anti-Muslim and other hate-motivated incidents in the OSCE region. The network had been developing curriculum/training resources based on identified “best practices”, with built-in recognition of State differences (political/social environment, legislative framework and resources). He emphasized that because hate crimes affect whole groups and not just individuals, their proper handling is very important for improving police-community relations and cooperation. He pointed out that police officers themselves, as a stereotyped group, are also often victims of hate crime. He said that hate crimes can be reduced by furthering objectives of community-based policing. He also introduced a number of training resources available for the network, such as the OSCE TANDIS (Tolerance and Non-discrimination Information System) website (<http://tandis.odihr.pl/>).

39. **Patrick Atayero**, Deputy Chief, Strategic Policy and Development Section, Police Division, Department of Peacekeeping Operations (DPKO), introduced some of DPKO’s policies in relation to peace agreements relevant to the topic of the meeting (e.g. on minority representation in law enforcement agencies, on non-discrimination and affirmative action in employment). He then turned to examples of good practice in United Nations peacekeeping missions. The United Nations Mission in Liberia (UNMIL) has supported the national police in establishing community policing forums with the involvement of NGOs. Mobile recruitment teams and involvement of celebrities during recruitment campaigns have also been used in order to facilitate recruitment and cooperation with local communities, and the tracking of intakes by ethnicity introduced, in order to ensure that all 17 tribes would be represented, none exceeding 13 per cent. The United Nations Mission in Kosovo (UNMIK) utilized a number of regulations so that recruitment into the Kosovo Police Service (KPS) as well as deployment would reflect the multi-ethnic composition of Kosovo. UNMIK guidelines also require fair treatment of minorities by police, and the KPS Policy and Procedure Manual guarantees equal training and balanced representation of ethnicity in all ranks. Besides general recruitment for which minorities are eligible, a number of efforts have been made to recruit ethnic minorities, including ex-police officers from ethnic minorities.

40. **Rudolf Battisti**, Lieutenant Colonel of the Viennese Police responsible for human resource management described recruitment campaigns aimed at increasing the percentage of police officers from migrant background. At the end of 2006 about 320,000 people with non-Austrian citizenship lived in Vienna (19 per cent of the population). However, if the persons who had acquired Austrian citizenship are taken into account, the percentage rises to almost one third of the population. At present, the Regional Police Command of Vienna only employs 1 per cent of police officers from migrant background. The goal is that by 2012 there will be at least one police officer with a migrant background in each police station in Vienna. This is hoped to be achieved partly through the recruitment campaign “Vienna needs You”, in the framework of which some 600 migration associations and target institutions have been addressed. The campaign mainly targets young adults of the second generation, who were born in Austria or who have lived there since they were children and who therefore have an intercultural knowledge and a good command of German as well as of the language of their parents. Implementing quota systems was not considered desirable in Vienna due to the negative experiences with quotas in other countries.

41. **Cristina Palaghie**, expert in the Romanian Ministry of Interior and Administrative Reform, briefly described a series of programmes for the integration of Roma, which include among others recruitment of Roma into the police force and free of charge provision of identity papers through mobile units. The recruitment campaign includes identifying young Roma for recruitment and organizing debates in schools about minority and police relations.

42. **Joanna Goodey** from the EU Agency for Fundamental Rights informed the meeting about the Agency's work on hate crime policing for which there are focal points in all EU member States and publicly available reports. She pointed out that there is no tradition of transparent data collection on hate crime and violence in EU countries and as a result there is a complete lack of data on the topic in EU agencies. She also referred to the lack of trust of vulnerable minorities towards police in EU countries and suggested that independent police complaints authorities can be important mechanisms to facilitate the trust of minority communities.

## **V. REVIEW OF CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES FOR INTEGRATION WITH DIVERSITY IN POLICING AND WAY FORWARD**

43. **Tom Hadden**, the author of the OHCHR guidelines, summarized the main issues raised in the country case studies which were not adequately addressed in the current draft of the guidelines:

- Structural problems in many ex-colonial States:
  - Political control over police as an agent of Government (Pakistan/South Africa)
  - The hierarchy of ethnic groups within a police force (South Africa/Brazil)
  - The legacy of colonial policing structures (Fiji)
  - Different levels of policing - national and local/gendarmerie and civil (Nigeria and civil law jurisdictions)
  - Gender concerns - specialist roles versus integration at all levels (Nigeria)
- Practical problems:
  - Language issues - training existing police in minority languages and/or recruitment or deployment of local officers (Cameroon/South Africa)
  - Deployment strategies - multi-ethnic units and patrols versus communally distinctive patrols and/or recruitment of local auxiliaries (India/Tamil Nadu)
  - Policing indigenous communities - how much autonomy and how much reliance on traditional/restorative structures (Canada/Samoa)
  - Focus on the relationship between corruption and low pay/status (Pakistan)

44. He invited to discuss the value of the guidelines and the way forward. The collection of best practices is one of the main value-added parts of the guidelines, and he raised the question that if the guidelines were to be produced to whom they should be addressed - United Nations field officers, NGOs and/or police officers.

45. The discussion revealed a unanimous support for the production of the guidelines and consensus regarding its usefulness. One participant said that the title “toolkit” is misleading because the guidelines are not in a toolkit format and do not offer very concrete examples for action. Another suggested that the guidelines need to make clear how the internal police procedures can be strengthened to gain more credibility, and how the developed good practices can be sustained. An oversight mechanism, within the United Nations framework or at least a recognized international NGO, should be developed for this purpose. Another participant suggested that existing national bodies such as ombudspersons and parliamentary committees could be involved in monitoring and follow-up. A number of participants suggested that it is important to briefly address the domains of security and criminal justice to frame the issue, but that the main focus of the guidelines should be on policing. There was a suggestion for the guidelines to target policymakers and those who produce training manuals, while one participant said that the current draft of the guidelines seems more suitable for management.

46. It was recommended that the guidelines have a strong human rights focus to dispel the myth that human rights lead to weak and ineffective policing. One participant pointed out that in many countries, the focus of police work is simply not at all on human rights and the integration of minorities (except attempts by individual officers or teams), but rather on drugs, terrorism, etc. It is therefore time that the United Nations pays more attention to issues like integration of minorities in policing in order to inspire country engagement on these issues. An NGO representative pointed out that some key documents related to integration with diversity such as the HCNM Recommendations and the Rotterdam Charter see partnership with NGOs as a crucial element of integration with diversity. The NGOs would thus welcome clear guidance from the United Nations as to the kind of actions they can take in this regard. They should, for example, have an advocacy and campaigning role in the process. Representatives of minorities themselves should also be consulted in the process of developing the guidelines. The guidelines could, for example, be presented to the United Nations Forum on Minority Issues and perhaps, if the effort can be sustained, to the General Assembly in order to trigger interest from States.

### **Diversity in recruitment into the police and in promotion and retention efforts**

47. The discussions focused on whether there is a need for associations of minority police officers, on the usefulness of recruitment quotas and on the role that trade unions can play in promoting diversity. While some participants thought that associations of minority police officers are important for persons belonging to minorities because they allow them to offer support to each other and to inform the leadership of the police of the problems their communities are facing, others cautioned that associating oneself like this often leads to more exclusion and promotes divisions. One should feel first of all a police officer; any other allegiance should be secondary. One participant said that training on diversity should create a better working environment for minority police officers and thus contribute to retention. A variety of views were expressed about the usefulness of quotas in recruitment. One participant suggested that quotas are politically popular but not so with police personnel, and that in some

countries they give rise to problems with getting even minimally qualified (e.g. literate) candidates. Another participant thought that preferential treatment should be avoided, while others thought that quotas are acceptable but should be used only in exceptional cases.

48. In relation to trade unions, it was pointed out that in some countries police officers were not allowed to form or join trade unions or to go on strike. While international standards on freedom of association permitted restrictions of the trade union rights of police officers, this excluded them from a crucial tool in their struggle for improvement of work conditions such as low pay. Where police unions or associations exist, they have a potential to address and raise equality and diversity issues within the police force. Regarding obstacles to minority recruitment, attention was drawn not only to educational and physical requirements which may have a discriminatory effect on some minority communities but also to problems with lack of identity documents among potential recruits from some minority communities. In terms of best practice in relation to retention efforts, the example of the police ombudsperson's office in Peru was cited.

### **Dialogue and cooperation with minority communities**

49. Community policing, with its many models, was identified as a crucial concept for this topic. Within the framework of this discussion, some participants gave examples of cooperation with minority communities in their countries. In Fiji and Samoa, the police carry out various outreach activities at the grassroots level, for example by engaging with youth in church groups and with women's organizations. In Canada, indigenous advisory councils proved effective. It was suggested that the guidelines should include a collection of options as different models are more applicable in different situations and time periods. While all participants agreed that the relationship between communities and police at the local level is crucial, some cautioned that identifying real representatives of the communities is often very hard and suggested that it would be useful if the OHCHR guidelines identified some best practices in relation to the identification of community leaders. It was further suggested that community involvement is crucial for local crime prevention and some best practices on that would also be useful.

50. One participant emphasized that while consultations with communities are crucial, they must be focused on problem-solving; otherwise communities soon lose interest. Furthermore, commitment from the top and allocation of resources is crucial to make dialogue and cooperation with minority communities work. Another participant emphasized the need to reach out to the youth through school visits, etc., and cited an example of offering voluntary jobs for representatives of minorities which, however, did not seem to be popular among youth. One NGO participant emphasized the role of NGOs, which should go beyond consultations and be focused on joint problem-solving. From his experience, NGOs can be instrumental in bringing the police to the table to negotiate with minorities. The OHCHR guidelines should give practical suggestions for such NGO involvement.

### **Training**

51. Some participants raised concerns that in some countries police trainers are often not very knowledgeable and professional. Conducting training is not seen as a desirable specialization, and often officers are posted to a training institution as a punishment for example for not being productive, although this has started to change in some countries, with selection processes for

recruitment of trainers becoming more competitive. Often trainers are themselves not free of prejudices. A change in mindset of the trainers is thus needed first if a change in the mindset of trainees is to take place. One participant even suggested that psychologists should help to develop profiles of persons suitable to be trainers - concentrating on attitudes and looking for persons who are culturally sensitive, open to change, etc.

52. A number of participants emphasized that it is important to bring community perspective into the training. Minority representatives should be involved in the training, they should talk to the trainers and perhaps the trainees too in order to shed light on minority problems, culture, etc. Except for very specialist policing topics, trainers should ideally come from the communities themselves. Minorities should also provide feedback during the training. Some participants suggested that non-police facilitators, such as academics, etc., should be involved in training. One participant cautioned that it can be hard for outside organizations, which want to provide training, to reach the police. A further obstacle is the fact that training priorities and resources are often determined several years in advance and thus do not correspond to the timely need on the ground. In addition, diversity training is sometimes seen as a one-off, instead of a continuous process and integral part of the curricula for each year. Several participants argued that human rights principles should be integrated into all trainings, including competency-based, not be taught as a separate course.

53. A number of participants pointed out that the United Nations and other training material is extremely theoretical, while police officers are interested in very practical issues and applied practices. The DPKO representative replied that police officers from Member States are usually invited to help in the development of DPKO training materials. In this way, standard training materials that countries should adapt to their needs are developed. Similarly, participants argued that training materials are often Eurocentric. A number of participants thus suggested that, with the possible exception of competency-based training which can be universal, training materials always need to be tailored to the location, and local trainers should always get together and work on this before they deliver the training. It was suggested that the OHCHR guidelines should guide practitioners to where they can find good training materials. Preference should be given to interactive training as this is always popular. One participant emphasized that the integration of minorities in policing academies is very important for improving relations among the majority population and minorities and within the police force, as lasting friendships are made during the academy years.

### **Monitoring and oversight of the processes of change**

54. It was suggested that not only violations but also best practice should be monitored. An example was given of the organization called Altus which trains civil society monitors in each country who pay unannounced visits to local police stations and rank their practice for the purposes of a regional competition on which station is the best. While some emphasized that external auditing is always needed, others pointed out that initial monitoring from within the organization is also crucial. One participant pointed out that there should be meetings with minority communities in order to review and monitor. Besides the police, government representatives should be involved in these meetings. One participant emphasized that the criteria and benchmarks used for the assessment of performance are crucial; however, there is a problem of assessment due to lack of data, for example because of data protection acts.



## **VI. CONCLUSIONS AND SUGGESTIONS FOR FOLLOW-UP**

55. The participants agreed to the following conclusions and suggestions for follow-up:

- The meeting was a useful initiative
- Further regional consultations with police practitioners in other United Nations languages would be desirable
- It would be useful to produce OHCHR guidelines on integration with diversity in policing based on the current draft; in (electronic) consultation with the participants of the meeting and include examples of “best practices” on a wider range of topics
- There are already some good experiences and tools available within the United Nations system that the OHCHR can draw upon when developing the guidelines
- Specialist NGOs should be invited to share their experiences and cooperate with the United Nations in promoting integration with diversity in policing
- Minority representatives should be involved in the consultation process for the OHCHR guidelines in order to give it legitimacy and find out whether the guidelines would work in practice
- There is a need to awaken the interest of Governments in the broader issue of integration of minorities and to place it higher on the political agenda
- A small steering group should be created from among the participants for the purpose of future promotion of the guidelines and other follow-up actions
- A narrative report of the meeting should be distributed to all participants for comments and submitted to the first session of the Forum on Minority Issues, along with the redrafted OHCHR guidelines<sup>2</sup>

-----

---

<sup>2</sup> This has not been possible as the Forum was fully devoted to the theme of “Minorities and the Right to Education”. The present report is therefore submitted directly to the Human Rights Council.